

11. Park Patrol

- **The Park Patrol unit is intended to provide Recreation and Park Department facility security, with primary responsibility for enforcing provisions of the Park Code. Because the Park Patrol unit has only five staff, including the supervisor, who are scheduled for 30 hours per week, the Park Patrol unit's main functions are issuing parking citations and locking facilities and setting alarms at night.**
- **The Recreation and Park Department Park Patrol unit does not have adequate management tools to define the Park Patrol unit's purpose, policies, and procedures. Except for informal and ad hoc procedures, the Park Patrol unit has no standardized procedures for carrying out its security and Park Code enforcement functions. This lack of standardization is not only inefficient, because routine functions are not performed in a consistent manner, but also puts the Department at risk if the Park Patrol unit does not have clearly defined procedures to respond to events such as emergency calls and alarms.**
- **One of the Park Patrol unit's major functions is the writing of parking citations for parking violations on Recreation and Park Department property. In FY 2004-2005, the Park Patrol collected approximately \$158,000 in parking citation revenues, based on 2,604 parking citations, including 2,048 parking citations in Golden Gate Park and 556 parking citations in the Marina, with an estimated 80 percent collection rate. Because the Municipal Transportation Agency receives all parking citation revenues under the Charter, the Recreation and Park Department should meet with the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic to discuss the transfer of all parking citation functions on Recreation and Park Department property from the Recreation and Park Department to the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic.**
- **The Recreation and Park Department has security needs that cannot be fully addressed by the Department's Park Patrol unit within existing staff resources. The General Manager should develop an overall security plan that identifies the roles of the Department's respective staff members, including recreation directors, custodians, gardeners, and Park Patrol officers, in locking facilities, and reporting and following up on security incidents.**

The Recreation and Park Department's Park Patrol provides Department facility security, particularly with regard to locking facilities in the neighborhood parks and Golden Gate Park and setting their alarms. The Park Patrol is also responsible for enforcing Park Code provisions related to parking, signs, permits and reservations, road closures, the Department's dog policy, field closures, and the City's non-smoking policy.

The Recreation and Park Department has five Park Patrol officers, including one supervisor and four staff, in the Park Patrol Unit, reporting to the Director of Operations. The Department also has six Park Patrol positions, including the Head Park Patrol officer and five Park Patrol officers, at Monster Park Stadium, reporting to the Monster Park Stadium manager and funded by revenues from the lease agreement between the San Francisco Forty-Niners and the Department.

The Park Patrol is authorized 5.25 full time equivalent positions in the FY 2005-2006 budget. Because the Park Patrol unit schedules each staff person for 30 hours per week (or 0.75 full time equivalent position), these 5.25 full time equivalent positions equal seven part-time staff, including one part-time Head Park Patrol officer and six Park Patrol officers. Currently, the Park Patrol unit has five staff, including one part-time Head Park Patrol officer and four Park Patrol officers. The Park Patrol staff cover a work schedule of 20 hours per day, Monday through Friday, and 30 hours of coverage, due to overlapping shifts, on weekends and holidays.

The Park Patrol unit is responsible for (a) receiving and responding to emergency calls, (b) locking Department facilities and setting alarms, (c) enforcing Park Code parking, dog, permits and reservation, street closures, and other policies, (d) providing customer service, such as assisting park and recreation facility visitors, and (e) participating in emergency preparedness.

Table 11.1

Park Patrol

Appropriated Funding and Authorized Staffing FY 2005-2006

Appropriation	Amount	Classification	Title	Full Time Equivalent Position Count
Permanent Salaries	\$268,809	8210	Head Park Patrol Officer	0.75
Retirement	24,409	8208	Park Patrol Officer	4.50
Social Security	20,565			
Health Service	39,145			
Dental Coverage	6,841			
Unemployment Insurance	672			
Other Fringe Benefits	914			
Overhead	105,082			
Services of Other Departments	<u>40,000</u>			—
Total Appropriations	\$506,437			5.25

Park Patrol Management Oversight

The Recreation and Park Department Park Patrol unit does not have adequate management tools to define the Park Patrol unit's purpose, policies, and procedures.

The Park Patrol Unit's Mission Statement

The Park Patrol's mission statement is too lengthy and imprecise to describe the organization's reason for existence or to serve as the basis for developing objectives, standards and performance measures. The Park Patrol is supposed to provide "security and safety for all visitors to San Francisco Recreation and Parks facilities", according to the Park Patrol's mission statement. The mission statement provides that the Park Patrol officers are law enforcement officers, who (a) are committed to provide a competent and effective public safety service to all persons, and (b) have primary duties to preserve the peace, protect life and property, and enforce the Park Code, including issuing verbal and written warnings, writing citations, making arrests, and investigating minor misdemeanors. According to the mission statement, the Park Patrol officers work in conjunction with the San Francisco Police Department to ensure maximum service for the park community.

The mission statement should describe the nature and scope of work to be performed and the organization's reason for existence.¹ The mission statement should also be simple, clear, and reflect three attributes, including opportunities, competence, and commitment.² The Park Patrol's mission statement needs to be simplified and revised to clearly reflect the contribution that the Park Patrol can make to the Recreation and Park Department's mission to "enlighten the senses... and meet the high expectations and needs of patrons". Further the Head Park Patrol Officer should seek suggestion from all members of the Park Patrol

Performance Measures, Standards, and Objectives

A primary task of a manager is to convert the organization's mission statement into operational specifics.³ The Park Patrol unit has not developed performance measures, standards, and objectives to make operational the Park Patrol unit's mission statement and evaluate the efficiency and effectiveness of the unit's work performance. The Recreation and Park Department's annual efficiency plan, required by the Administrative Code, is supposed to include customer service, strategic planning, annual performance and performance evaluation elements. However, the Department's FY 2004-2005 efficiency plan does not include performance measures for the Park Patrol unit. Consequently, the Park Patrol unit does not have a method to evaluate the Park Patrol unit's overall performance and identify areas of improvement. The Department cannot measure the need for Park Patrol staff or Park Patrol staff's productivity.

Performance Measures

The Park Patrol unit needs to establish performance measures, standards, and objectives. Performance measures, relating to the mission of the Park Patrol unit, include:

- (a) The quality of public assistance.

¹ George L. Morrissey, *Management by Objectives and Results in the Public Sector*, Reading: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, 1970, page 25.

² Peter F. Drucker, *Managing the Nonprofit Organization*, New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1990, pages 3-8.

³ *Ibid.*, page 5.

- (b) The extent of vandalism to Recreation and Park Department property.
- (c) The completion of peace officer training.
- (d) The effectiveness of responses to emergencies.

Performance measures are normally stable over an extended period of time.

Performance Standards

Performance standards are measures of excellence and should specify how many, how much, or how well the management expects the organization to perform in completing its performance measures. Using the performance measures cited above, performance standards should include:

- (a) No negative ratings on public surveys or no reports of unsatisfactory assistance.
- (b) Declining number of vandalism incidents.
- (c) Percentage of Park Patrol officers with current Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST).

The Recreation and Park Department management should revise performance standards periodically as the performance expectations change.

Performance Objectives

Performance objectives are a benefit to be achieved. The Park Patrol unit should develop performance objectives that are measurable and verifiable,⁴ including (a) stating a single key result to be accomplished as specifically and quantitatively as possible, (b) specifying a target date for accomplishment, and (c) specifying a maximum cost factor.

The objective statement should relate directly to the manager's mission and to higher-level missions and objectives. Further, the statement should be (a) attainable as well as presenting a challenge, and (b) understandable by those who will be contributing to its attainment. For example, two performance objectives developed from the Park Patrol's performance measures could be:

- To implement an approved alarm upgrade program by July 1, 2006, within the approved budget, and
- To have 75 percent of the Park Patrol officers who meet Peace Officer Standards and Training by December 31, 2006, at a cost not to exceed \$20,000.

⁴ George L. Morrissey, *Management by Objectives and Results in the Public Sector*

Policies and Procedures

The Recreation and Park Department has not established policies and procedures for the Park Patrol, resulting in a lack of formal guidelines and procedures in enforcing the Park Code, writing citations, and providing security. Policies and procedures serve multiple functions including (a) a self-regulating control standard for performing work, (b) an efficiency and effectiveness tool incorporating best practices or lessons learned, and (c) a training and indoctrination tool for newly assigned personnel.

Park Patrol policies and procedures consist of informal memoranda issued on an ad hoc basis and cover various operational topics such as gate closings, enforcement of dog regulations, and vehicle equipment. The Park Patrol unit lacks standardized procedures for carrying out Park Patrol operations, including (a) receiving and responding to emergency calls, (b) locking facilities and maintaining alarms, and (c) enforcing parking and other Park Code provisions, such as the non-smoking and on-leash dog policy and vending with a permit. This lack of standardization is not only inefficient, because routine functions are not performed in a consistent manner, but also puts the Department at risk if the Park Patrol do not have clearly defined procedures to respond to events such as responding to emergency calls and alarms.

Operational Planning: Action Plan 2004

Proposition C, which re-authorized the Park and Open Space Fund and was approved by the voters in March 2000, required the Recreation and Park Department to adopt several long-term plans, including the Strategic Plan, the Capital Plan, and the five-year Operational Plan. The Recreation and Park Department is to update the Operational Plan annually, and developed the *Operations Planning: Action Plans 2004* to comply with this requirement. One of the 2004 Action Plan strategies is to improve safety and security in the Department's parks and facilities through preventive and proactive measures, including (a) increasing the effectiveness of the Park Patrol staff, and (b) significantly enhancing the capability of performing the Park Patrol function with a volunteer Park Patrol and by employing existing Recreation and Park Department staff members to perform duties previously performed by the Park Patrol.

The Recreation and Park Department spelled out several strategic steps to evaluate or improve the Department's security and the Park Patrol functions in the 2004 Action Plan, including to:

- Improve communications internally and externally to facilitate the timely exchange of pertinent information;
- Upgrade and improve facility security systems at all sites to minimize response requests for false positive alarms,
- Increase staff levels through the establishment of a volunteer Park Patrol Reserve program;
- Create several staffed informational kiosks to provide information and monitor public activities;

- Develop a docent program to provide cultural, historical and natural history programs for park visitors in conjunction with the Department's Office of Volunteer Services;
- Improve interdepartmental communication related to identifying the allocation of Park Patrol resources, and improve interdepartmental partnerships with other City Agencies.

The 2004 Action Plan includes 27 specific steps that the Recreation and Park Department intends to take to achieve these strategic steps, of which the Department has only accomplished two, including establishing a volunteer Park Patrol Reserve Program, which was suspended in June of 2005. Otherwise, the Recreation and Park Department has made little progress in implementing the 2004 Action Plan.

The 2004 Action Plan included hiring an independent consultant and working with the Police Department to analyze Park Patrol policies and procedures and the existing command headquarters and their appropriateness related to location and function. The Department has not moved forward on analyzing the Park Patrol policies and procedures or evaluating the appropriateness of the command headquarters. Although the Budget Analyst does not consider it necessary to hire an outside consultant to analyze the Park Patrol policies and procedures, the Department does need to move forward in developing the policies and procedures. Also, the current Park Patrol command headquarters consists of a small, cramped, dirty and entirely unsuitable room located in the Structural Maintenance Division's yard.

The Recreation and Park Department's Security Needs

The Recreation and Park Department does not have security plan, addressing the overall security requirements of the Department. The four Park Patrol officers cannot meet all the Department's security needs. Recreation directors, gardeners, and custodians expressed concern about security or safety during interviews. For example, one recreation director reported an incident at Garfield Park in which a neighbor pulled a gun on a contract worker. In multiple interviews, Recreation and Park Department staff reported concerns about contact with homeless encampments or encounters with disorderly or aggressive individuals. Custodians reported that restrooms were not always locked at night, allowing individuals to enter and litter the restrooms. In focus groups conducted by the Budget Analyst, staff reported that they did not receive adequate information about safety or security incident's and the Department's follow up to these incidents.

According to the Director of Operations, the Department has an ongoing relationship with the San Francisco Police Department, including bimonthly meetings and discussions to facilitate park patrols. The Director of Operations should develop an overall security plan that identifies the roles of the Department's respective staff members, including recreation directors, custodians, gardeners, and Park Patrol officers, in locking facilities, and reporting and following up on security incidents. In Section 2 of this report, the Budget Analyst has recommended transferring 30 custodians to the evening shift. As part of this transfer, the Director of Operations should identify which facilities will have custodian crews present during the evening hours and who will be responsible for locking and checking facilities.

Citing Parking and Other Park Code Violations

One of the Park Patrol unit's major functions is the writing of parking citations for parking violations on Recreation and Park Department property. Parking citation revenues equal only an estimated 33.8 percent of the Park Patrol's annual budget. The Park Patrol unit's FY 2004-2005 budget was \$467,306 and estimated parking citation revenues were approximately \$158,000, based on 2,604 parking citations, including 2,048 parking citations in Golden Gate Park and 556 parking citations in the Marina, with an estimated 80 percent collection rate. Parking citation revenues accrue to the Metropolitan Transportation Authority.

The Park Patrol unit writes very few citations for Park Code violations other than parking. Based on information provided by the Head Park Patrol Officer, the Park Patrol issued 13 Park Code citations for violations other than parking in FY 2004-2005. The citations were issued for vending without a permit, theft of utilities, camping without a permit and other such offenses. In response to our inquiry concerning the reason for the low number of non-parking citations, the Head Park Patrol Officer stated that Park Patrol Officers are reluctant to confront Park Code violators when working alone, without communications, without backup, and without the proper equipment to effect an arrest or citation. The Head Park Patrol Officer further stated that most of the 13 non-parking citations were issued when two Park Patrol Officers were on duty.

Because the Municipal Transportation Agency receives all parking citation revenues under the Charter, the Recreation and Park Department should meet with the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic to discuss the transfer of all parking citation functions on Recreation and Park Department property from the Recreation and Park Department to the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic.

Monster Park Stadium Surveillance Equipment

The Recreation and Park Department has five Park Patrol officers assigned to Monster Park Stadium, who report to the Stadium manager. These positions are funded by revenues from the lease agreement between the San Francisco Forty-Niners and the City.

Monster Park Stadium has a camera surveillance system that is obsolete. The existing analog recorders of Monster Park's closed circuit surveillance system each record the activities captured by four cameras, on a time-sharing basis. Thus, imagery from an area under surveillance is much less complete than that recorded by state-of-the art digital recording systems with simultaneous recording that permit 100 percent coverage of each area under surveillance. Further, a National Football League *best security practice* specifies digital systems.

The Budget Analyst has been advised that Homeland Security grant funding may be available to procure a digital recording system. The Budget Analyst recommends that the General Manager, Recreation and Park Department, investigate the advisability of procuring the subject equipment and if warranted, seek such funding.

Conclusions

The Recreation and Park Department lacks an overall security plan or management tools to provide oversight over the Park Patrol function. Because the Park Patrol unit is staffed with only one part-time supervisor and three part-time officers, the Park Patrol unit can not perform all the functions, including (a) receiving and responding to emergency calls, (b) locking Department facilities and setting alarms, (c) enforcing Park Code parking, dog, permits and reservation, street closures, and other policies, (d) providing customer service, such as assisting park and recreation facility visitors, and (e) participating in emergency preparedness. Park Patrol officers issue few Park Code violation citations other than parking citations. Because the Metropolitan Transportation Agency receives all parking citation revenues under the Charter, the Recreation and Park Department should meet with the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic to discuss the transfer of all parking citation functions on Recreation and Park Department property from the Recreation and Park Department to the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic.

The General Manager should also develop an overall security plan that identifies the roles of the Department's respective staff members, including recreation directors, custodians, gardeners, and Park Patrol officers, in locking facilities, and reporting and following up on security incidents. Concurrent with the security plan development, the General Manager should ensure that the Park Patrol unit has adequate management tools and oversight, including performance measures, standards and objectives, and especially, policies and procedures to ensure that the Park Patrol is performing efficiently and carries out its security functions according to standardized procedures.

Recommendations

The Recreation and Park General Manager should:

- 11.1 Evaluate the service level provided by the current Park Patrol staffing level and make adjustments if deemed suitable and practicable, in the light of the Recreation and Park Department's overall mission, and within existing funding appropriations.
- 11.2 Provide the Park Patrol with the assistance that it needs to develop acceptable administrative practices, including developing a Policies and Procedures Manual and data collection and reporting methods.
- 11.3 Direct staff to update the performance measures, supporting strategies, and action steps contained in the Operational Planning document concerning the Park Patrol and ensure that the action steps are accomplished.
- 11.4 Direct staff to locate an appropriate "command headquarters" for the Park Patrol.
- 11.5 Direct staff to develop a recommendation on whether to obtain a digital recording system for Monster Park, preferably with grant funding.

- 11.6 Meet with the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic to discuss the transfer of all parking citation functions on Recreation and Park Department property from the Recreation and Park Department to the Metropolitan Transportation Agency's Department of Parking and Traffic.
- 11.7 Develop an overall security plan that identifies the roles of the Department's respective staff members, including recreation directors, custodians, gardeners, and Park Patrol officers, in locking facilities, and reporting and following up on security incidents.

Costs and Benefits

The Budget Analyst's recommendations can be accomplished within the Recreation and Park Department's existing appropriated funding and authorized staffing levels and would enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of the Park Patrol, and thus enhance the experiences of the patrons of the Recreation and Park Department's parks, facilities, and programs and improve the level of safety within Monster Park.