1 Planning Code - Article 11 - Historic Preservation in the C-3 Districts]

2

3

4

5

6

Ordinance amending the San Francisco Planning Code, Article 11, entitled 'Preservation of Buildings and Districts of Architectural, Historical, and Aesthetic Importance in the C-3 Districts," in its entirety; and making findings, including environmental findings and findings of consistency with the General Plan and Planning Code Section 101.1(b).

8

9

7

NOTE:

10

11

13

12

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

25

Additions are <u>single-underline italics Times New Roman</u>; deletions are <u>strike through italics Times New Roman</u>. Board amendment additions are <u>double-underlined</u>; Board amendment deletions are <u>strikethrough normal</u>.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

Section 1. Findings. The Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco nereby finds and determines that:

- (a) General Plan and Planning Code Findings.
- (1) On February 2, 2012, at a duly noticed public hearing, the Planning Commission in Resolution No. 18531 found that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance were consistent with the City's General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b). In addition, the Planning Commission recommended that the Board of Supervisors adopt the proposed Planning Code amendments. A copy of said Resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 120301 and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board finds that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance are on balance consistent with the City's General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in said Resolution.

- (2) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board finds that the proposed ordinance will serve the public necessity, convenience and welfare for the reasons set forth in Planning Commission Resolution No. 18531 which reasons are incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.
- (b) Historic Preservation Commission Findings. On November 2, 2011 at a duly noticed public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission in Resolution No. 667 reviewed the proposed Planning Code amendments and recommended that the Board of Supervisors adopt some of the proposed amendments. On February 1, 2012 at a duly noticed public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission reviewed additional possible amendments to Article 10, some of which have been incorporated into the proposed Planning Code amendments, provided additional recommendations, and incorporated all of its prior recommendations in Resolution No. 673, which supersedes its Resolution No. 667 as the Historic Preservation Commission's recommendations to this Board. A copy of Resolution 673 and additional recommendations of the Historic Preservation Commission are on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 120301.
- (c) Environmental Findings. The Planning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this Ordinance are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code section 21000 et seq.) (CEQA) under Section 15060(c)(2) of the CEQA Guidelines to the California Environ. Said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 120301 and is incorporated herein by reference.

Section 2. The San Francisco Planning Code is hereby amended by amending Article 11, to read as follows:

1	ARTICLE 11: PRESERVATION OF BUILDINGS AND DISTRICTS OF							
2	ARCHITECTURAL, HISTORICAL, AND AESTHETIC IMPORTANCE IN THE C-3 DISTRICTS							
3	Sec. 1101. Findings and Purposes.							
4	Sec. 1102. Standards for Designation of Buildings.							
5	Sec. 1102.1. Designation of Buildings.							
6	Sec. 1103. Standards for Designation of Conservation Districts.							
7	Sec. 1103.1. Conservation District Designations.							
8	Sec. 1104. Notice of Designation. Intentionally Left Blank.							
9	Sec. 1105. Reconsideration of Designation. Intentionally Left Blank.							
10	Sec. 1106. <u>Procedures for Change of Designation</u> : Designation of Additional							
11	Significant and Contributory Buildings.							
12	Sec. 1107. Procedures for Designation of Additional Conservation Districts or							
13	Boundary Change of Conservation Districts.							
14	Sec. 1108. Notice of Designation.							
15	Sec. 1109. Preservation Lots: Eligibility for Transfer of Development Rights.							
16	Sec. 1110. Construction, Alteration or Demolition of Significant or Contributory Buildings							
17	or Buildings in Conservation Districts.							
18	Sec. 1111. Applications for Permits to Alter, Permits to Demolish, and Permits for New							
19	Construction in Conservation Districts.							
20	Sec. 1111.1. Determination of <u>Minor and Major Alterations</u> .							
21	Sec. 1111.2. Referral of Applications for Major Alterations to Landmarks Preservation							
22	Advisory Board: Review by the Department of City Planning Sign Permits.							
23	Sec. 1111.3. Recommendation by the Director of Planning Review by the Planning							
24	Department.							
25								
	Planning Commission BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page							
	n							

1	Sec. 1111.4. Consideration and Decision by the City Planning CommissionScheduling and
2	Notice of Historic Preservation Commission Hearings.
3	Sec. 1111.5. Decision by the City Planning Historic Preservation Commission.
4	Sec. 1111.6. Standards and Requirements for Review of Applications for Alterations.
5	Sec. 1111.7. Permits for Signs Standards and Requirements for Review of Applications for
6	Permits to Demolish.
7	Sec. 1112. Demolition of Significant and Contributory Buildings and Buildings in
8	Conservation Districts Intentionally Left Blank.
9	Sec. 1112.1. Applications for a Permit to Demolish.
10	Sec. 1112.2. Disposition of Applications to Demolish Contributory Buildings and Unrated
11	Buildings in Conservation Districts.
12	Sec. 1112.3. Applications to Demolish Significant Buildings or Contributory Buildings from
13	which TDR Have Been Transferred; Acceptance and Notice.
14	Sec. 1112.4. Referral to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board Prior to Hearing; Review
15	by the Director of Planning.
16	Sec. 1112.5. Planning Commission Hearing and Decision.
17	Sec. 1112.6. Decision of the Planning Commission.
18	Sec. 1112.7. Standards and Review of Applications to Demolish.
19	Sec. 1113. Standards of Review for New and Replacement Construction in
20	Conservation.
21	Sec. 1114. Modification of a Decision of the Historic Preservation Commission.
22	<u>Sec. 1115. Appeal.</u>
23	Sec 1116. Unlawful Alteration or Demolition.
24	Sec. 11151117. Conformity with Other City Permit Processes.
25	Sec. 11161118. Unsafe or Dangerous Conditions.
	Planning Commission BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 4

1	Sec. 11171119. Maintenance Requirements and Enforcement Thereof.
2	Sec. 11191120. Enforcement and Penalties.
3	Sec. 1120.1121 Relationship to Article 10.
4	Sec. 11211122. Notice of Amendment.
5	Sec. 11221123. Notice Procedure.
6	Sec. 11231124. Time Provisions.
7	Sec. <i>1124<u>1125</u>.</i> Severability.
8	Appendix A Category I Buildings.
9.	Appendix B Category II Buildings.
10	Appendix C Category III Buildings.
11	Appendix D Category IV Buildings.
12	Appendix E Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District.
13	Appendix F New Montgomery-Second Street Conservation District.
14	Appendix G Commercial-Leidesdorff Conservation District.
15	Appendix H Front-California Conservation District.
16	Appendix I Kearny-Belden Conservation District.
17	Appendix J Pine-Sansome Conservation District.
18	SEC. 1101. FINDINGS AND PURPOSES.
19	(a) It is hereby found that a substantial number of the buildings in the C-3 District
20	have a special architectural, historical, and aesthetic value. These buildings contribute
21	substantially to San Francisco's reputation throughout the United States as a City of
22	outstanding beauty and physical harmony. A substantial number of these special buildings
23	have been and continue to be unnecessarily destroyed or impaired, despite the feasibility of
24	preserving and continuing their use, and without adequate consideration for the irreplaceable

loss to the people of the City of their aesthetic, cultural, historic and economic value.

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

25

Page 5 5/9/2012

- (b) It is further found that distinct and definable subareas within the C-3 District possess concentrations of buildings that together create a unique historic, architectural, and aesthetic character which contributes to the beauty and attractiveness of the City. The quality of these geographic areas has been and continues to be degraded by the unnecessary demolition of buildings of substantial architectural and aesthetic merit, by their replacement with buildings which conflict with the character and scale of the area, and by alteration of buildings in a manner which conflicts with the character and scale of the area.
- (c) It is therefore declared that the protection, enhancement, and perpetuation of buildings and definable subareas of special architectural, historical, and aesthetic interest is necessary to promote the health, safety, prosperity and welfare of the people of the City.

 Accordingly, the purposes of this Article are:
- (1) The protection, enhancement, and perpetuation of structures and subareas of special architectural, historical, and aesthetic character which contribute to the urban environment;
- (2) The maintenance and improvement of a healthy economy for the City by enhancing both property values and the City's attractiveness as a place to do business;
- (3) The protection and improvement of the City's attractiveness to tourists and other visitors, and the stimulus to business provided thereby;
- (4) The enrichment of the educational, cultural, aesthetic and spiritual life of the inhabitants of the City by fostering knowledge of the heritage of the City's past and retaining the quality of the City's urban environment.
- (d) It is further found that the use of Transferable Development Rights ("TDR") as provided herein is necessary to promote the urban planning and design goals of the Master General Plan by:

- (1) maintaining appropriate overall development capacities in each zoning district within the C-3 area, as defined by applicable floor area, height, bulk and other parameters;
- (2) encouraging and directing development into the Special Development District in order to maintain a compact downtown financial district; and
- (3) facilitating the retention of Significant Buildings, and encouraging the retention of Contributory Buildings, and the compatible replacement or alteration of Unrated buildings in Conservation Districts, as defined herein this Article.

SEC. 1102. STANDARDS FOR DESIGNATION OF BUILDINGS.

The buildings in the C-3 Districts are divided into five categories according to the Building Rating methodology as set forth and explained in the Preservation of the Past section of the Downtown Plan, a component of the *Master General* Plan. Those categories are as follows:

- (a) Significant Buildings Category I. Buildings which that:
- (1) Are at least 40 years old; and
- (2) Are judged to be Buildings of Individual Importance; and
- (3) Are rated Excellent in Architectural Design or are rated Very Good in both Architectural Design and Relationship to the Environment.
 - (b) Significant Buildings Category II. Buildings:
 - (1) Which That meet the standards in Section 1102(a) above; and
- (2) To which, because of their depth and relationship to other structures, it is feasible to add different and higher replacement structures or additions to height at the rear of the structure, even if visible when viewing the principal facades, without affecting their architectural quality or relationship to the environment and without affecting the appearance of the retained portions as separate structures when viewing the principal facades. The

Planning Commission **BOARD OF SUPERVISORS**

Page 8

- (d) Contributory Buildings Category IV. The buildings listed in Appendix D to this Article 11 are hereby designated as Contributory Buildings Category IV.
- (e) Unrated Buildings Category V. All buildings in the C-3 District not otherwise designated in this Section are hereby designated as Unrated Category V.

SEC. 1103. STANDARDS FOR DESIGNATION OF CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.

Portions of the C-3 District may be designated as Conservation Districts if they contain substantial concentrations of buildings that together create subareas of special architectural and aesthetic importance. Such areas shall contain substantial concentrations of Significant and Contributory Buildings and possess substantial overall architectural, aesthetic or historic qualities justifying additional controls in order to protect and promote those qualities.

SEC. 1103.1. CONSERVATION DISTRICT DESIGNATIONS.

The following Conservation Districts are hereby designated for the reasons indicated in the appropriate Appendix:

- (a) The Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District is hereby designated as set forth in Appendix E.
- (b) The New Montgomery-Second Street Conservation District is hereby designated as set forth in Appendix F.
- (c) The Commercial-Leidesdorff Conservation District is hereby designated as set forth in Appendix G.
- (d) The Front-California Conservation District is hereby designated as set forth in Appendix H.
- (e) The Kearny-Belden Conservation District is hereby designated as set forth in Appendix I.
- (f) The Pine-Sansome Conservation District is hereby designated as set forth in Appendix J.

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

SEC. 1104. <u>INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK.</u> NOTICE OF DESIGNATION.

- (a) The Zoning Administrator shall notify by mail the owners of every building designated by this ordinance as a Significant or Contributory Building and every building within a conservation district as established by this ordinance.
- (b) With respect to buildings designated Significant or Contributory by this ordinance, notice shall also be given by posting each such building in a conspicuous place as well as by publication pursuant to the provisions of California Government Code Section 6064. The notice shall state that the owner of every building so designated has the right to request a change of designation and the time permitted for making such a request.
- (c) The Zoning Administrator shall cause a copy of this ordinance, or notice thereof, to be recorded in the office of the County Recorder for properties designated as Significant or Contributory, and for properties designated within a conservation district, by this ordinance.

SEC. 1105. INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK. RECONSIDERATION OF DESIGNATION.

(a) Request for Reconsideration. Within 45 days of the effective date of this ordinance, a request for reconsideration and change of a designation may be filed by any affected property owner, by any organization or group which has historic preservation stated as one of its goals in its bylaws or articles of incorporation, or the application of at least 50 registered voters of the City, based on the grounds that under the standards contained in Section 1102 the designation set forth in this ordinance is incorrect. Such a request shall be filed with the Department of City Planning on forms provided for that purpose. The Department of City Planning shall not accept or act upon any application filed after 45 days have passed. Once a request for reconsideration has been made as to any building, no additional requests shall be accepted as to that building; however, another applicant may seek a change of designation different from that sought in the original reconsideration request. Any property owner who contends that the designation applicable to its property deprives the owner of a constitutionally protected property right, or that, by reason of such application, the property owner is

Page 10 5/9/2012

entitled to compensation, shall assert such argument in connection with and in aid of the application
filed under this Section and provide all evidence in the property owner's possession in support of such
contention.

(b) Referral to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board; Review by the Department of City Planning. Upon determination by the Zoning Administrator that an application is complete, the Zoning Administrator shall promptly refer the matter to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board for review and recommendation, and the Department of City Planning shall undertake a study of the reconsideration request and prepare a report and recommendation. The Landmarks board shall recommend approval, disapproval, or approval with modifications of the application within 30 days of receiving it; provided, however, that if more than 30 applications are received within any 15 day period at the Department of City Planning, the Zoning Administrator may extend the time for Advisory Board action with respect to those applications for an additional period of time not to exceed 45 days, and if more than 50 applications are received within such time, for an additional period of time deemed necessary to allow sufficient time for Board review. If the Landmarks Board fails to respond within the allowed time the City Planning Commission shall proceed without a recommendation from the Landmarks Board.

(c) Submittal to the Planning Commission. Upon completion of the study by the Department of City Planning and recommendation by the Landmarks Advisory Board, the matter shall be scheduled for public hearing before the Planning Commission; provided, however, that in no event shall it be scheduled later than 30 days after the Advisory Board has made its recommendation unless the applicant consents to an extension of this time limit. Notice of the hearing shall be given by mail to the applicant and to any other persons requesting notice.

(d) City Planning Commission Decision. The Planning Commission may approve,

disapprove, or approve with modifications the reconsideration application. The building shall be

deemed to be designated according to the decision of the Planning Commission and the provisions of

Planning Commission

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

this Article 11 applicable to that designation shall apply to the building notwithstanding another designation of the building in Appendices A, B, C or D to this Article.

SEC. 1106. <u>PROCEDURES FOR</u> CHANGE OF DESIGNATION: <u>AND</u> DESIGNATION OF ADDITIONAL <u>SIGNIFICANT AND CONTRIBUTORY</u> BUILDINGS.

Buildings may be designated <u>as Significant or Contributory</u> or their designation may be changed through amendment of Appendices A, B, C and D of this Article. Such designation or change of designation shall be governed by the following provisions in lieu of the provisions of Section 302:

- (a) Initiation. The designation or change of designation of a <u>Significant or Contributory</u> building may be initiated by motion of the Board of Supervisors, by resolution of the <u>Planning Commission or the Landmarks Preservation Advisory BoardHistoric Preservation Commission (HPC)</u>, by the verified application of the owner or authorized agent of the affected property, by the application of any organization or group which that has historic preservation stated as one of its goals in its bylaws or articles of incorporation, or by the application of at least 50 registered voters of the City. Except in the case of initiation by governmental bodies, any such application shall <u>contain historic, architectural, and/or cultural documentation to support the initiation or change of designation as well as any additional information that may be required by the application procedures and policies established by the HPC. be filed with the Department of City Planning upon forms prescribed by the Department of City Planning, and shall be accompanied by all data required by the Department. If initiated by motion of the Board of Supervisors, the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors shall refer the matter to the HPC for its review and recommendation prior to passage by the Board of Supervisors, without referral to the Planning Commission.</u>
- (b) Notice; Referral to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board; Referral to the HPC;

 Review by the Planning Department of City Planning. Upon determination by the Zoning

 Administrator Department that a verified application is complete and contains all necessary

 Planning Commission

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

information or upon receipt of the motion or resolution of one of the governmental bodies set forth in Subsection (a) above, the Zoning Administrator Department shall: (1) promptly schedule a hearing before the HPC on the proposed designation or change of designation; and (2) send notice of the proposed designation or change of designation hearing by mail no less than 20 days prior to the date of the hearing to the owner(s) of the affected property, unless the application is that of the owner; the applicant(s), if any, for the designation or change in designation; to the owners of all properties within 150 feet of the affected property; and to any interested parties who so request in writing to the Department. and (2) promptly refer the matter to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board for review and the submittal of a recommendation. The Department of City Planning shall also undertake a study of the proposed designation or change of designation.

- (c) Action by the <u>Planning Historic Preservation</u> Commission. <u>Upon completion of the review of the The</u> proposed designation or change of designation <u>by the Department of City</u>

 <u>Planning and the submittal of the report by the Landmarks Board, the matter</u> shall be placed on the agenda of the <u>Planning Commission HPC</u> for public hearing. The <u>Planning Commission HPC</u> shall determine the appropriate designation or change in designation of the building. If the <u>Planning Commission HPC</u> approves or modifies the <u>proposed</u> designation or change of designation in whole or in part, it shall transmit <u>the proposal its recommendation</u>, together with a copy of the resolution <u>of approval</u>, to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors <u>without referral to the Planning Commission</u>.
- (d) Designation by Board of Supervisors. The Board of Supervisors, or a committee thereof, shall hold a public hearing on any proposal so transmitted to it. The Board of Supervisors may approve, modify and approve, or disapprove the designation or change of designation by a majority vote of all its members.
- (e) Appeal to Board of Supervisors. If the *Planning Commission-HPC* disapproves the proposed designation or change of designation, such action shall be final except upon the Planning Commission

filing of a notice of appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days by the applicant or any of the persons, organizations or groups listed in Section 1106(a); provided, however, that if the proposal was initiated by the Board of Supervisors, the Clerk of the *said* Board shall be notified immediately of the disapproval without the necessity for an appeal.

- (f) Hearing and Decision by the Board of Supervisors. The Board of Supervisors, or a committee thereof, shall hold a public hearing on any such proposal appealed to it or initiated by it. The Board of Supervisors may uphold the Planning CommissionHPC, overrule the Planning CommissionHPC and approve, or modify and approve, the designation or change of designation by a majority vote of all its members.
- (g) Notice of <u>Board of Supervisors</u> Proceedings. Notice of the hearing scheduled before the <u>Planning Commission and</u> Board of Supervisors, and of the availability of applicable reports, shall be given by mail <u>no less than 20 days prior to the date of the hearing</u> to the initiators of the designation or change of designation, to the <u>owners owner(s)</u> of any affected building, to <u>any</u> appellants, and to any other interested person or organization <u>who so requests in writing to</u> the <u>Department requesting notice</u>.
- (h) Grounds for Designation or Change of Designation. The designation of a building may be changed if (1) changes in the area in the vicinity of a building located outside a Conservation District warrant a change in the rating of the building with respect to its relationship to the environment and therefore place it in a different category, pursuant to Section 1102; or (2) changes in Conservation District boundaries make a building of Contextual Importance fall outside a Conservation District and therefore no longer eligible for designation as a Contributory building, or, conversely, make a building of Contextual Importance fall within a Conservation District and therefore eligible for designation as a Contributory Building; or (3) changes in the physical features of the building due to circumstances beyond the control of the owner, or otherwise permitted by this Article, warrant

placing the building in a different category pursuant to the standards set forth in Section 1102; or (4) restoration of the building to its original quality and character warrants placing the building in a different category pursuant to the standards set forth in Section 1102; or (5) by the passage of time, the building has become at least 40 years old, making it eligible to be considered for designation as a Significant or Contributory building, pursuant to Section 1102; or (6) the discovery of new factual information (for example, information about the history of the building) makes the building eligible for rating as a Building of Individual or Contextual Importance and, therefore, eligible to be designated as a Significant or Contributory Building.

SEC. 1107. PROCEDURES FOR DESIGNATION OF ADDITIONAL CONSERVATION DISTRICTS OR BOUNDARY CHANGE OF CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.

A Conservation District may be designated or its boundary changed through amendment of Section 1103.1 of this Article 11. The HPC may recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of Conservation District designations or boundary changes to the Board of Supervisors. Such designation or boundary change shall be governed by the following provisions in lieu of the provisions of Section 302.

(a) Initiation of Designation or Boundary Change. The designation of an area of the C-3 District as a Conservation District or the change of District boundaries may be initiated by motion of the Board of Supervisors, by resolution of the *Planning Commission or the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board HPC*, upon the verified application of the owners or other authorized agents of greater than 25 percent of the structures in the area proposed for designation (or, as to an alteration, 25 percent of the structures of the proposed new district unless it would be an area smaller than the existing district, in which case it shall be 25 percent of the structures of the existing district), upon the verified application of any organization or group *whichthat* has historic preservation stated as one of its goals in its bylaws or articles of incorporation, or upon the verified application of at least 150 registered

voters of the City. Except in case of an initiation by governmental bodies, any such application shall contain historic, architectural, and/or cultural documentation to support the designation or boundary change as well as any additional information that may be required by the application procedures and policies established by the HPC be filed with the Department of City Planning upon forms prescribed by the Department of City Planning, and shall be accompanied by all data required by said Department.

- (b) Notice; Referral to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory BoardHistoric Preservation Commission; Review by the Planning Department of City Planning. Notice, referral to the Landmarks Board and review by the Department of City Planning shall be as provided in Section 1106(b) of this Article. If a proposed Conservation District designation or boundary change is initiated by the Board of Supervisors, the Clerk of the Board shall refer the matter to the HPC for its review and recommendation. Upon determination by the Planning Department that a verified application is complete and contains all necessary information or upon receipt of a motion or resolution by the Board of Supervisors or the HPC initiating designation or a change in designation, the Department shall (1) promptly schedule a hearing before the HPC on the proposed district or boundary change; and (2) send notice of the HPC hearing by mail no less than 20 days prior to the date of the hearing to the initiators of the designation or boundary change, to the owners of all lots within the proposed new district or the district being modified, and to any interested parties who make a request in writing to the Department.
- (c) Submittal to the Planning Commission. Submittal to and action by the Planning Commission shall be as set forth in Section 1106(c) of this Article. Action by the HPC. The proposed designation or boundary change shall be placed on the agenda of the HPC for public hearing. If the HPC approves or modifies the proposed designation or boundary change in whole or in part, the Department shall transmit the HPC's recommendation together with a copy of the HPC's resolution

and with any comments of the Planning Commission, as set forth in subsection (d) below, to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors.

(d) Review by the Planning Commission. Following action by the HPC, the Department shall promptly refer the HPC's recommendation on the proposed Conservation District designation or boundary change to the Planning Commission, which shall have 45 days to review and comment on the proposed designation or boundary change. The Planning Commission's comments, if any, shall be forwarded to the Board of Supervisors together with the HPC's recommendation. Notice of the Planning Commission hearing shall be given as provided in Section 1107(b) of this Article.

The Planning Commission's comments shall be transmitted to the Board of Supervisors as a resolution and shall (1) address the consistency of the proposed boundary change with the policies embodied in the General Plan and the priority policies of Section 101.1, particularly the provision of housing to meet the City's Regional Housing Needs Allocation, and the provision of housing near transit corridors; (2) identify any amendments to the General Plan necessary to facilitate adoption of the proposed boundary change; and (3) evaluate whether the proposed boundary change would conflict with the Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area.

(e) Designation by Board of Supervisors. The Board of Supervisors, or a committee thereof, shall hold a public hearing on any proposal so transmitted to it. The Board of Supervisors may approve, modify and approve, or disapprove the designation or boundary change by a majority vote of all its members.

Prior to the Board of Supervisors' vote on a proposed boundary change, the Planning

Department shall conduct thorough outreach to affected property owners and occupants. The Planning

Department shall invite all property owners and occupants in the area covered by the proposed

boundary change to express their opinion in writing on the proposed boundary change, be it in the

form of a vote or a survey, with the goal of obtaining the participation of at least half of all

property owners and half of all occupants in the area. Such invitation shall advise owners of the

practical consequences of the adoption of the proposed boundary change, including the availability of preservation incentives, the types of work requiring a Permit to Alter, the process and fees for obtaining a Permit to Alter, and the types of work that is generally ineligible to receive a Permit to Alter. The property owners' and the occupants' votes, tallied separately and combined, shall be considered by the Board of Supervisors when taking action on the proposed boundary change.

(e)(f) Appeal to Board of Supervisors. If the *Planning Commission HPC* disapproves the proposed designation or boundary change, such action shall be final except upon the filing of a notice of appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days by the applicant or any of the persons, organizations, or groups listed in Section 1107(a); provided, however, that if the proposal was initiated by the Board of Supervisors, the Clerk of the *said bB* oard shall be notified immediately of the disapproval without the necessity for an appeal.

(f)(g) Hearing and Decision by the Board of Supervisors. The Board of Supervisors, or a committee thereof, shall hold a public hearing on any such proposal appealed to it or initiated by it. The Board of Supervisors may uphold the Planning Commission HPC, overrule the Planning Commission HPC and approve, or modify and approve, the designation or boundary change by a majority vote of all its members.

(g)(h) Notice of <u>Board of Supervisors</u> Proceedings. Notice of the hearing scheduled <u>pursuant to this Section before the Planning Commission</u> shall be given by mail <u>no less than 20 days</u> <u>prior to the date of the hearing</u> to: the <u>initiators of applicants for</u> the designation or alteration, <u>if any</u>; the owners of all lots within <u>300 feet of</u> the proposed new district or <u>of that portion of</u> the district being altered; <u>appellants, if any</u>; <u>as well as and</u> to interested individuals or organizations who request such notice <u>in writing to the Planning Department</u>.

(h)(i) Standards Applicable to Designation or Boundary Change. The standards governing the designation and change of District boundaries are those set forth in Section

1103. Areas may be removed from Conservation Districts if the character of the area has changed such that the area no longer qualifies under the standards set forth in Section 1103.

SEC. 1108. NOTICE OF DESIGNATION.

When a building has been designated Significant or Contributory or its designation is changed pursuant to Section 1106, or when a new Conservation District is established or the boundary of a Conservation District changed pursuant to Section 1107, the Zoning Administrator Planning Department Shall notify each affected property owner by mail and shall cause a copy of the ordinance, or notice thereof, to be recorded in the office of with the County Recorder. The Planning Department shall file in its permanent records any new designation or change of designation of a Significant or Contributory Building or a new Conservation District or change of a Conservation District boundary and shall notify the Central Permit Bureau pursuant to Section 1117 of this Article.

SEC. 1109. PRESERVATION LOTS: ELIGIBILITY FOR TRANSFER OF DEVELOPMENT RIGHTS.

For the purpose of transfer of development rights (TDR) as provided in Section 128 of this

Code, IL ots on which are located Significant or Contributory Buildings, or Category V Buildings in those certain Conservation Districts and portions thereof as indicated in Section 8 of the Appendix relating to that District are eligible preservation lots as provided in Section 128 of this Code for the purposes of Transferable Development Rights ("TDR"), as provided in this Section:

(a) Significant Buildings. Lots on which are located buildings designated as Significant Buildings - Category I or Category II - are eligible to transfer the difference between the allowable gross floor area permitted on the lot by Section 124 of this Code and the gross floor area of the development on the lot, if all the requirements for transfer set forth in Section 128 are met. Lots on which are located Significant Buildings which have been

21

22

23

24

25

altered in conformance with the provisions of this Article retain eligibility for the transfer of TDR.

- (b) Contributory Buildings. Lots on which are located buildings designated as Contributory Buildings - Category III or Category IV - are eligible to transfer the difference between the allowable gross floor area permitted on the lot by Section 124 of the this Code and the gross floor area of the development on the lot, if all the requirements for transfer set forth in Section 128 are met. Alteration or demolition of such a building in violation of Section 1110 or Section 1112, or alterations or demolitions made without a permit issued pursuant to Sections 1111 through 1111.67, eliminates eligibility for the transfer of TDR; provided. however, that such eligibility may nonetheless be retained or acquired again if, pursuant to Section $\frac{1114(b)1116(b)}{1116(b)}$: the property owner demonstrates as to any alteration that it was not major, or if the property owner restores the demolished or altered building a Minor Alteration as defined in this Article and has applied for a Permit for Minor Alteration pursuant to Section 1111.1; or that the property owner has obtained a Permit to Alter to restore the original distinguishing qualities and character-defining features that were altered. Once any TDR have been transferred from a Contributory Building, the building is subject to the same restrictions on demolition and alteration as a Significant Building. These restrictions may not be removed by the transfer of TDR back to the building.
- (c) Category V Buildings in Conservation Districts. Where explicitly permitted in Section 8 of the Appendix establishing a Conservation District, lots located in such a District on which are located Category V Buildings (designated as neither Significant nor Contributory) are eligible to transfer the difference between the allowable gross floor area permitted on the lot under Section 124 of the Code and the gross floor area of the development on the lot, if all the requirements for transfer set forth in Section 128 are met; provided, however, that a lot is eligible as a Preservation Lot pursuant to this Section only if: (1) the exterior of the building is

substantially altered so as to make it compatible with the scale and character of the Significant and Contributory Buildings in the district, including those features described in Sections 6 and 7 of the Appendix to Article 11 describing the relevant district, and has thus been determined by the HPC to be a Compatible Rehabilitation, and the building meets or has been reinforced to meet the standards for seismic loads and forces of the 1975 Building Code; or (2) the building on the lot is new, having replaced a Category V Building, and has received approval by the HPC as a Compatible Replacement Building, pursuant to Section 1113. The procedures governing these determinations are set forth in Section 309.

SEC. 1110. <u>CONSTRUCTION</u>, ALTERATION <u>OR DEMOLITION</u> OF SIGNIFICANT OR CONTRIBUTORY BUILDINGS OR BUILDINGS IN CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.

With respect to a designated Significant or Contributory Building or any Category V Building in a Conservation District, no person shall carry out or cause to be carried out any alteration to the exterior of a building for which a permit is required pursuant to the Building Code unless the permit is approved pursuant to the provisions of Sections 1111 through 1111.6 of this Article; provided, however, that this approval is not required with respect to the owner of a Contributory Building of Category III who has not transferred any TDR and who elects to proceed with a major alteration without reference to Sections 1111 through 1111.6. Election to proceed without a permit pursuant to this Section may be made at the time that the Zoning Administrator determines that the proposed alteration is major pursuant to Section 1111.1. If no election is made at the time of the Zoning Administrator's determination that an alteration is major, the applicant may make such election at any time thereafter. Review under Sections 1111 through 1111.6 shall cease after such election has been made and the permit shall be processed without regard to the requirements of that Section. Election shall be made in writing on a form provided by the Zoning Administrator. Where an owner elects not to proceed pursuant to Sections 1111 through 1111.6, the proposed alteration for which the application is filed shall be deemed not to meet the requirements of Section 1111.6, and if the alteration permit is Planning Commission

issued and work commenced thereunder, the Zoning Administrator shall not issue a Statement of Eligibility for the lot on which the building is located.

- (a) No person shall carry out or cause to be carried out any construction, alteration, removal or demolition of a structure or any work involving a sign, awning, marquee, canopy, mural, or other appendage, or any new or replacement construction for which a permit is required pursuant to the Building Code, on any designated Significant or Contributory Building or any building in a Conservation District unless a permit for such work has been approved pursuant to the provisions of this Article 11. Notwithstanding the foregoing, when the application is for a permit to maintain, repair, rehabilitate, or improve streets and sidewalks, including sidewalk widening, accessibility, and bulbouts, the Planning Department shall process the permit without further reference to this Article 11, unless such streets and sidewalks have been explicitly called out in a conservation district's designating ordinance as character-defining features of the district.
- (b) The HPC shall approve, disapprove, or modify all applications for permits to alter or demolish any Significant or Contributory Buildings or buildings within Conservation Districts, and permits for any new and replacement construction within Conservation Districts, subject to appeal as provided in Section 1115 of this Article 11. The HPC shall review and act on such permits prior to any other Planning approval action(s). Buildings or areas within the C-3 District designated pursuant to the provisions of both Article 10 and Article 11 shall be regulated pursuant to the procedures of both Articles. In case of conflict, the more restrictive provisions shall apply.
- (c) If the proposed work would constitute a demolition as defined in Section 1005(f) of this Code, such work shall, in addition to any other requirements, be subject to the provisions of this Article 11 governing demolitions and shall require a "Permit to Demolish." All other proposed construction or alteration of a structure, including any new or replacement construction, or any work involving a sign, awning, marquee, canopy, mural, or other appendage work, but excepting ordinary maintenance and repairs, shall require a "Permit to Alter."

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

SEC. 1111. APPLICATIONS FOR PERMITS TO ALTER, <u>PERMITS TO DEMOLISH</u>, AND PERMITS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION IN CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.

The Zoning Administrator may define categories of alterations which are deemed to be minor alterations and individual permits falling within those categories shall be reviewed and acted upon without referral to the Zoning Administrator for review pursuant to Sections 1111 through 1111.6. All other applications for permits to undertake any alteration of a building designated Significant or Contributory or a building in any Conservation District shall be referred to the Zoning Administrator by the Central Permit Bureau within five days of receipt. An applicant for a major alteration permit for a Category V Building in any of the Conservation Districts which provides for such eligibility may request on the application a determination that if the proposed alteration is completed as approved, the building will be deemed a Compatible Rehabilitation under Section 1109(e) so that the lot on which the building is located becomes eligible as a Preservation Lot for the transfer of TDR.

Upon receipt of any application for a building permit, demolition permit, site permit, alteration permit, or any other permit relating to a Significant or Contributory Building or a building within a Conservation District, the Central Permit Bureau shall forward such application to the Planning Department for determination as to whether the application is subject to the provisions of this Article and, if so, for approval under this Article. An application for a Permit to Alter or Permit to Demolish or for new and replacement construction in any Conservation District shall be filed by the owner or authorized agent for the owner of the property for which the permit is sought with the Planning Department. Each application shall be verified by at least one property owner or his or her authorized agent attesting to the truth and correctness of all facts, statements and information presented.

(a) Content of Applications. The content of applications shall be in accordance with the policies, rules and regulations of the Department and the HPC. All applications shall be on forms prescribed therefore and shall contain or be accompanied by all information required to assure the

1	presentation of all pertinent facts for proper consideration of the case and for the permanent record.
2	Applications shall include the following information:
3	(1) Plans, sections and elevations showing all existing and proposed work, including but not
4	limited to color, texture of materials, architectural design, profile, and detail;
5	(2) All demolition calculations and associated detail drawings showing all interior and
6	exterior alterations associated with the proposed scope of work, including but not limited to any
7	changes to the exterior and internal structural framework, floor plates, removal of interior walls, or
8	changes to the foundation;
9	(3) Specifications describing the means and methods associated with the proposed scope of
10	work, including any technical specifications for all exterior restoration or cleaning work;
11	(4) Photographs showing the property and the context of its surroundings;
12	(5) Any other information that the Department determines may be necessary for the
13	particular scope of work proposed; and
14	(6) Information needed for the preparation and mailing of notices as specified in Section
15	<u>1111.4.</u>
16	(b) In addition to the contents specified for applications in (1) above, any application for a
17	Permit to Demolish a Significant Building or a Contributory Building from which TDR have been
18	transferred shall also contain the following information:
19	(1) An updated historic resource evaluation and conditions assessment report that includes
20	any pertinent information on the condition of the building and historical, architectural, and cultural
21	documentation about the building:
22	(2) The amount paid for the property;
23	(3) The date of purchase, the party from whom purchased, and a description of the business
24	or family relationship, if any, between the owner and the person from whom the property was
25	purchased;
	Planning Commission BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 25

1	(4) The cost of any improvements since purchase by the applicant and date the
2	improvements were made;
3	(5) The assessed value of the land, and improvements thereon, according to the most recent
4	assessments;
5	(6) Real estate taxes for the previous five years;
6	(7) Annual debt service, if any, for the previous five years;
7	(8) All appraisals obtained within the previous five years by the owner or applicant in
8	connection with his or her purchase, financing or ownership of the property;
9	(9) Any listing of the property for sale or rent, price asked and offers received, if any;
10	(10) Any consideration by the owner for profitable and adaptive uses for the property,
11	including renovation studies, plans, and bids, if any;
12	(11) If it is a Preservation Lot eligible to transfer TDR, the amount and value of such
13	untransferred TDR;
14	(12) Annual gross income from the property for the previous five years;
15	(13) Itemized operating and maintenance expenses for the previous five years;
16	(14) Annual cash flow for the previous four years;
17	(15) Building plans, elevations, sections, detail drawings, and any other information required
18	for the Replacement Building;
19	(16) The Statement of Eligibility as set forth in Section 128;
20	(17) An itemized list of the amount of TDR that has been transferred from the property;
21	(18) The amount received for rights transferred;
22	(19) The transferee(s); and
23	(20) A copy of each document effecting a transfer of such rights.
24	(c) An application for a Permit to Demolish any building located in a Conservation District
25	or an application for new construction on vacant lots shall include plans, specifications and elevations

1	showing the proposed exterior appearance, including but not limited to color, texture of materials, and
2	architectural design and detail, for the replacement construction.
3	(d) Category V Buildings (Unrated). The owner or owner's representative of a Category V
4	building located in a Conservation District may apply for one of the following:
5	(1) Compatible Rehabilitation. An applicant for a Permit to Alter a Category V Building
6	(Unrated) may request on the application a determination by the HPC that if the proposed alteration is
7	completed as approved, the building will be deemed a Compatible Rehabilitation under Section 1109(c)
8	so that the lot on which the building is located becomes eligible as a Preservation Lot for the transfer
9	of TDR.
0	(2) Compatible Replacement Building. An applicant for new construction in a Conservation
1	District on a lot where a Category V Building (Unrated) has been lawfully demolished may request on
2	the application a determination by the HPC that if the proposed new construction is completed as
3	approved, the new building will be deemed a Compatible Replacement Building under Section 1109(c)
4	so that the lot on which the building is located becomes eligible as a Preservation Lot for the transfer
5	of TDR.
6	(e) Permit and Application Fee Waivers. In cases of economic hardship, an applicant may
7	be partially or fully exempt from paying fees pursuant to Section 350(e)(2).
8	SEC. 1111.1. DETERMINATION OF <u>MINOR AND</u> MAJOR ALTERATION <u>S</u> .
9	Within 10 days after referral by the Central Permit Bureau, the Zoning Administrator shall
20	determine in writing if the proposed alteration is a Major Alteration or a Minor Alteration.
21	(a) An alteration is considered Major if any of the following apply:
22	(1) The alteration will substantially change, obscure or destroy exterior character-defining
23	spaces, materials, features or finishes; or
24	(2) The alteration would affect all or any substantial part of a building's structural
25	elements, exterior walls or exterior ornamentation; or
	Planning Commission BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 27 5/9/2012

originated at: n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc

revised on: 5/9/2012 - n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc

(c) All applications for a Permit to Alter that are not Min	or Alterations delegated to
Department staff shall be approved, approved with modifications, or	disapproved by the HPC pursuant
to the procedures in Section 1111.4 and 1111.5 below.	

- (c) The Zoning Administrator shall mail to the applicant and any individuals or organizations who so request the written determination as to the category of the proposed alteration.

 Decisions of the Zoning Administrator may be appealed to the Board of Permit Appeals within 10 days of the written determination in the manner provided in Section 308.2.
- (d)—Permits determined to be for minor alterations shall be returned, with that

 determination noted, to the Central Permit Bureau for further processing; provided, however, that the

 Zoning Administrator may take any action with respect to the application otherwise authorized.
- SEC. 1111.2. REFERRAL OF APPLICATIONS FOR MAJOR ALTERATIONS TO
 LANDMARKS PRESERVATION ADVISORY BOARD: REVIEW BY THE DEPARTMENT OF CITY
 PLANNING.
- (a) Upon determination that the proposed alteration is a major alteration, the Director of Planning shall refer applications for permits to alter Significant and Contributory Buildings to the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board for its report and recommendation, which shall be rendered within 30 days. Said time limit for the Board to render its report may be extended by the Department of City Planning for an additional 30 days to render its report in the case of complex alterations, multiple hearings, or upon request of the applicant. If the Board fails to submit a report and recommendation within the time allowed, the matter may be considered without reference to such report and recommendation.
- (b) Simultaneously with the proceedings before the Landmarks Board, the application shall be reviewed by the Department of City Planning.

	(c)	Applicati	ons for per	mits to ali	ter any Ca	itegory V	building i	n a Conse	rvation D	istrict
which	alterati	on is deter	mined to b	e major si	hall be go	verned by	the stana	lards of Se	ction 111	1.6(c) and
the pro	ocedure:	s set forth	in Section .	309SIG	N PERMI	<u>TS.</u>	• .			

- (a) New general advertising signs are prohibited in any Conservation District or on any historic property regulated by this Article 11.
- (b) If a permit for a sign is required pursuant to Article 6 of this Code, the requirements of this Section shall apply to such permit in addition to those of Article 6.
- (c) In addition to the requirements of Article 6, an application for a business sign, general advertising sign, identifying sign, or nameplate to be located on a Significant or Contributory Building or any building in a Conservation District shall be subject to review by the HPC pursuant to the provisions of this Article. The HPC shall disapprove the application or approve it with modifications if the proposed location, materials, typeset, size of lettering, means of illumination, method of replacement, or the attachment would adversely affect the special architectural, historical or aesthetic significance of the subject building or the Conservation District. No application shall be denied on the basis of the content of the sign.

SEC. 1111.3. RECOMMENDATION BY THE DIRECTOR OF PLANNING.

Advisory Board, the Director of Planning shall make a determination on the application and shall submit a written recommendation containing findings to the Planning Commission. The recommendation may be to approve, to approve with conditions, or disapprove the application for alteration, and, where applicable, the application for a determination that the building is a Compatible Rehabilitation. The Commission, the applicant and any other person who so requests shall be supplied with a copy of reports and recommendations of the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board and the findings and recommendations of the Director of Planning. REVIEW BY THE PLANNING

DEPARTMENT.

Planning Commission

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Page 30 5/9/2012

The Department shall review all applications and shall determine within 30 days after the
application is filed whether the application is complete. Applications for Minor Alterations that have
been delegated to Department staff may be approved by the Department pursuant to Section 1111.1
without a hearing before the HPC. Upon acceptance as complete of an application that is not a Minor
Alteration or upon appeal to or a request by the HPC to exercise its review powers over a Minor
Alteration as set forth in 1111.1, the HPC shall hold a hearing and approve, approve with
modifications, or disapprove the application in accordance with the procedures set forth in this Section
<u>1111.</u>

SEC. 1111.4. CONSIDERATION AND DECISION BY THE CITY PLANNING
COMMISSION.

- (a) The recommendation of the Director of Planning shall be placed on the consent calendar of the City Planning Commission; provided, however, that upon the request of the applicant or of any person prior to the City Planning Commission meeting or by a member of the Commission at the meeting, the matter may be removed from the consent calendar and calendared for a public hearing before the Planning Commission at a later meeting, which shall be the next regular meeting of the Commission unless the applicant otherwise consents.
- (b) Notice of the time, place and purpose of the hearing before the City Planning

 Commission shall begin given as follows:
 - (1) By mail to the applicant;
- (2) When the application is for alteration of a building located in a Conservation District, by mail not less than 10 days prior to the date of the hearing to the owners of all real property within 300 feet of property that is the subject of the application. SCHEDULING AND NOTICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HEARINGS
- (a) If a public hearing before the HPC is required under this Section 1111, the Department shall set a time and place for the hearing within a reasonable period. Notice of the time, place, and

1	purpose of the hearing shall be given by the Department not less than 20 days prior to the date of the
2	hearing as follows:
3	(1) By mail to the owner of the subject property;
4	(2) By mail to the applicant;
5	(3) By mail to any interested parties who make a request in writing to the Department;
6	(4) For applications for a building located in a Conservation District, by mail to the owners
7	of all real property within 300 feet of the subject property;
8	(5) For applications for a building not located in a Conservation District, by mail to the
9	owners of all real property within 150 feet of the subject property;
10	(6) By posting notice on the site; and
11	(7) By any other means as the Department deems appropriate.
12	(b) Notice for HPC review of Minor Permits to Alter. A hearing for the HPC to exercise its
13	review powers over a Minor Permit to Alter shall be noticed:
14	(1) By mail not less than 10 days prior to the date of the hearing to the applicant, all owner.
15	within 150 feet of the subject property, as well as to any other interested parties who so request in
16	writing to the Department; and
17	(2) By posted notice on the site not less than 10 days prior to the date of the hearing.
18	SEC. 1111.5. DECISION BY THE CITY PLANNING HISTORIC PRESERVATION
19	COMMISSION.
20	(a) The Planning Commission HPC may approve, disapprove, or approve with
21	conditions an application for an alteration permit a Permit to Alter or a Permit to Demolish and,
22	where applicable for new or replacement construction, for a determination that the building is a
23	Compatible Rehabilitation under Section 1113 or a Compatible Replacement Building under Section
24	1109(c), and shall make findings in support of its decision. If the Planning Commission approves
25	the recommendation of the Director of Planning, it may adopt or modify the findings of the Director of
	Planning Commission BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 3

Page 32 5/9/2012 originated at : n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc revised on: 5/9/2012 - n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc

Planning as appropriate. Where the Planning Commission disapproves the recommendations of the
Director of Planning, it shall make findings supporting its decision. If the Commission disapproves the
application for a permit to alter, it shall recommend disapproval to the Central Permit Bureau which
shall deny the application. The Planning Commission's determination that a building qualifies or fails
to qualify as a Compatible Rehabilitation is a final administrative decision. Any decision of the
Planning Commission rendered pursuant to this Section shall be rendered within 30 days from the date
of conclusion of the hearing.

- (b) For applications for a Permit to Demolish, the applicant has the burden of establishing that the criteria governing the approval of applications set forth in Section 1111.7 have been met.
- (c) The decisions of the HPC shall be final except upon modification by the Planning

 Commission as provided in Section 1114 or upon the filing of a timely appeal to the Board of Appeals

 or Board of Supervisors as provided in Section 1115.

SEC. 1111.6. STANDARDS AND REQUIREMENTS FOR REVIEW OF APPLICATIONS FOR ALTERATIONS.

The <u>HPC, the</u> Board of <u>Permit</u> Appeals, <u>the Board of Supervisors</u>, the <u>City</u>-Planning Commission <u>and the Department</u>, <u>the Director of Planning</u>, <u>and the Landmarks Board</u> shall be governed by the following standards in the review of applications for <u>major alteration permits</u>

<u>Permits to Alter. In the case of conflict with other requirements, including the requirements of Article</u>

10, the more restrictive standards shall apply.

- (a) The proposed alteration shall be consistent with and appropriate for the effectuation of the purposes of this Article 11.
- (b) The proposed work shall comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties for significant and contributory buildings, as well as any applicable guidelines, local interpretations, bulletins, or other policies. Development of local interpretations and guidelines based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards shall be led by the Planning Department

through a public participation process; such local interpretations and guidelines shall be found in conformance with the General Plan and Planning Code by the Planning Commission and shall be adopted by both the HPC and the Planning Commission. If either body fails to act on any such local interpretation or guideline within 180 days of either body's initial hearing where the matter was considered for approval, such failure to act shall constitute approval by that body. In the case of any apparent inconsistency among the requirements of this Section, compliance with the requirements of the designating ordinance shall prevail.

(b)(c) For Significant Buildings - Categories I and II, and for Contributory Buildings - Categories III and IV, proposed alterations of structural elements and exterior features shall be consistent with the architectural character of the building, and shall comply with the following specific requirements:

- (1) The distinguishing original qualities or character of the building may not be damaged or destroyed. Any distinctive architectural feature which affects the overall appearance of the building shall not be removed or altered unless it is the only feasible means to protect the public safety.
- (2) The integrity of distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building shall be preserved.
- (3) Distinctive architectural features which are to be retained pursuant to Paragraph (1) but which are deteriorated shall be repaired rather than replaced, whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features shall be based on accurate duplication of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence, if available, rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

Replacement of nonvisible structural elements need not match or duplicate the material being replaced.

- (4) Contemporary design of alterations is permitted, provided that such alterations do not destroy significant exterior architectural material and that such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the building and its surroundings.
- (5) The degree to which distinctive features need be retained may be less when the alteration is to exterior elements not constituting a part of a principal facade or when it is an alteration of the ground-floor frontage in order to adapt the space for ground-floor uses.
- (6) In the case of Significant Buildings Category I, any additions to height of the building (including addition of mechanical equipment) shall be limited to one story above the height of the existing roof, shall be compatible with the scale and character of the building, and shall in no event cover more than 75 percent of the roof area.
- (7) In the case of Significant Buildings Category II, a new structure or addition, including one of greater height than the existing building, may be permitted on that portion of the lot not restricted in Appendix B even if such structure or addition will be visible when viewing the principal facades at ground level, provided that the structure or addition does not affect the appearance of the retained portion as a separate structure when so viewing the principal facades and is compatible in form and design with the retained portion. Alteration of the retained portion of the building is permitted as provided in Paragraphs (1) through (6) of this Subsection (b)(c).
- (e)(d) Within Conservation Districts, all major exterior alterations, of Category V
 Buildings, shall be compatible in scale and design with the District as set forth in Sections 6 and 7 of the Appendix which describes the District.

(e) If TDR have been transferred from any Con	<u>itributory Building, the building shall</u>	<u>be</u>
	n ur m	. 1
subject to the same restrictions on alterations as a Signific	cant Building. These restrictions may i	not be
removed by the transfer of TDR back to the building.		

SEC. 1111.7. PERMITS FOR SIGNS.

- (a) Installation of a new general advertising sign is prohibited in any Historic District or Conservation District or on any historic property regulated by this Article 11.
- (b) Wherever a permit for a sign is required pursuant to Article 6 of this Code, an application for such permit shall be governed by the provisions of this Section in addition to those of Article 6.
- (c) Apart from and in addition to any grounds for approval or disapproval of the application under Article 6, an application involving a permit for a business sign, or general advertising sign, identifying sign, or nameplate to be located on a Significant or Contributory Building or any building in a Conservation District may be disapproved, or approved subject to conditions if the proposed location, materials, means of illumination or method or replacement of attachment would adversely affect the special architectural, historical or aesthetic significance of the building or the Conservation District. No application shall be denied on the basis of the content of the sign.
- (d) The Director of Planning shall make the determination required pursuant to Subsection (b). Any permit applicant may appeal the determination of the Director of Planning to the City Planning Commission by filing a notice of appeal with the Secretary of the Commission within 10 days of the determination. The City Planning Commission shall hear the appeal and make its determination within 30 days of the filing of the notice of appeal. STANDARDS AND REQUIREMENTS FOR REVIEW OF APPLICATIONS FOR DEMOLITION.
- (a) The HPC, Planning Commission, Board of Appeals, and the Board of Supervisors (each referred to as a "Decisionmaker" for the purposes of this Section) shall apply the following standards

Prevention and Public Safety determines, after consultation to the extent feasible with the HPC and the

25

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Page 37 5/9/2012

originated at: n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc revised on: 5/9/2012 - n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc

1	Planning Department, that an imminent safety hazard exists and that demolition of the structure is the
2	only feasible means to secure the public safety; or
3	(C) The Decisionmaker determines based on substantial evidence in the record that:
4	(i) The rehabilitation and reuse of the building will not meet most of the goals and
5	objectives of the proposed replacement project;
6	(ii) The proposed replacement project is compatible with the Conservation District in which
7	the property is located; and
8	(iii) Specific economic, social, or other benefits of the proposed replacement project
9	significantly outweigh the benefit conferred from the historic preservation of the particular structure or
10	<u>feature.</u>
11	(3) For Category V Buildings (Not Rated) in Conservation Districts: The Decisionmaker
12	determines that: (A) the building has not gained additional historical or architectural significance that
13	may make it eligible for classification as a Category I, II, or IV Building; and (B) the proposed
14	Replacement Building is compatible with the Conservation District in which the property is located. If
15	the Decisionmaker determines based on new documentation presented that a Category V Building has
16	gained significance such that it is eligible for classification as a Category I, II, or IV Building and
17	reclassification of the Category V Building is initiated as provided in Section 1106, the Permit to
18	Demolish shall be reviewed under Subsection (a)(1) or (a)(2) above, and not under this Subsection
19	(a)(3). Additionally, if the building has completed a Compatible Rehabilitation pursuant to Section
20	1109(c), and has transferred development rights from the property, then the building shall be treated as
21	a Significant Building (Category I or II). Any determination that a Category V Building may be
22	eligible for reclassification shall be void if, within 180 days of such determination, the Board of
23	Supervisors has not re-designated the building to a Category I, II, or IV Building.
24	(b) The cumulative effects on the integrity of the Conservation District associated with
25	demolition of a Contributory Building shall be considered and may be grounds for denial of the Permit
	Planning Commission BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 3

Page 38 5/9/2012 originated at : n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc revised on: 5/9/2012 – n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc

1	to Demolish, if it is found that the demolition would substantially diminish the integrity of the
2	Conservation District.
3	(c) In addition to the above requirements, no demolition permit shall be issued by the
4	Department of Building Inspection or any other agency for any building located in a Conservation
5	District until an application for the new or replacement building has been approved in accordance with
6	the standards for new construction in a Conservation District as provided in this Article, and the
7	building or site permit conforming to such approval has been lawfully issued.
8	SEC. 1112. <u>INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK.</u> <u>DEMOLITION OF SIGNIFICANT AND</u>
9	CONTRIBUTORY BUILDINGS AND BUILDINGS IN CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.
0	No person shall demolish or cause to be demolished all or any part of a Significant or
1	Contributory Building or any building in a Conservation District without obtaining a demolition or
2	alteration permit pursuant to the provisions of this Article. Applications for permits to demolish
3	Category V Buildings located outside a Conservation District may be processed without reference to
4	this Article.
5	SEC. 1112.1. APPLICATIONS FOR A PERMIT TO DEMOLISH.
6	Applications for a permit to demolish any Significant or Contributory Building or any building
7	in a Conservation District shall comply with the provisions of Section 1006.1 of Article 10 of this Code.
8	In addition to the contents specified for applications in Section 1006.1 of Article 10, any
9	application for a permit to demolish a Significant Building, or a Contributory Building from which
20	TDR have been transferred, on the grounds stated in Section 1112.7(a)(1), shall contain the following
21	information:
22	(a) For all property:
23	(1)—The amount paid for the property;
24	
25	

Page 39 5/9/2012

originated at : n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc revised on: $5/9/2012 - n:\land\as2012\1100459\00772700.doc$

	N .
1	(2) The date of purchase, the party from whom purchased, and a description of the business
2	or family relationship, if any, between the owner and the person from whom the property was
3	purchased;
4	(3) The cost of any improvements since purchase by the applicant and date incurred;
5	(4) — The assessed value of the land, and improvements thereon, according to the most recent
6	assessments;
7	(5) Real estate taxes for the previous two years;
8	(6) Annual debt service, if any, for the previous two years;
9	(7) All appraisals obtained within the previous five years by the owner or applicant in
10	connection with his or her purchase, financing or ownership of the property;
11	(8) Any listing of the property for sale or rent, price asked and offers received, if any;
12	(9) Any consideration by the owner for profitable and adaptive uses for the property,
13	including renovation studies, plans, and bids, if any; and
14	(b) For income-producing property:
15	(1) Annual gross income from the property for the previous four years;
16	(2) Itemized operating and maintenance expenses for the previous four years;
17	(3) Annual cash flow for the previous four years.
18	Applications for the demolition of any Significant or Contributory Building shall also contain a
19	description of any Transferable Development Rights or the right to such rights which have been
20	transferred from the property, a statement of the quantity of such rights and untransferred rights
21	remaining, the amount received for rights transferred, the transferee, and a copy of each document
22	effecting a transfer of such rights.
23	SEC. 1112.2. DISPOSITION OF APPLICATIONS TO DEMOLISH CONTRIBUTORY
24	BUILDINGS AND UNRATED BUILDINGS IN CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.
25	

- (a) The Zoning Administrator shall determine, within five days of acceptance of a complete application, the designation of the building and, with respect to Contributory Buildings, whether any TDR have been transferred from the lots of such buildings.
- (b) If the Zoning Administrator determines that TDR have been transferred from the lot of a Contributory Building, the application for demolition of that building shall be reviewed and acted upon as if it applied to a Significant Building.
- (c) The Zoning Administrator shall approve any application for demolition of a

 Contributory Building in a Conservation District from which no TDR have been transferred, or an

 Unrated Building located in a Conservation District, if a building or site permit has been lawfully

 issued for a replacement structure on the site, in compliance with Section 1113. The Zoning

 Administrator shall approve an application for demolition of a Significant Building Category II if a

 building or site permit has been lawfully issued for an alteration or replacement structure on the

 portion of the site which would be affected by the demolition, in compliance with Section 1111.6(b)(7).

The Zoning Administrator shall disapprove any application for a demolition permit where the foregoing requirement has not been met; provided, however, that the Zoning Administrator shall approve any otherwise satisfactory application for such a permit notwithstanding the fact that no permit has been obtained for a replacement structure if the standards of Section 1112.7 for allowing demolition of a Significant Building are met.

(d) The Zoning Administrator shall approve applications to permit demolition of a

Contributory Building - Category III from which no TDR have been transferred only if a building or

site permit for a replacement building on the same site has been approved, and it has been found,

pursuant to review under the procedural provisions of Section 309, that the proposed replacement will

not adversely affect the character, scale or design qualities of the general area in which it is located,

either by reason of the quality of the proposed design or by virtue of the relation of the replacement

structure or structures to their setting. Notwithstanding the preceding sentence, the Zoning

The decision of the Planning Commission shall be rendered within 30 days from the date of conclusion of the hearing.

SEC. 1112.7. STANDARDS AND REVIEW OF APPLICATIONS TO DEMOLISH.

The Board of Permit Appeals, the City Planning Commission, the Director of Planning, and the Landmarks Board shall follow the standards in this Section in their review of applications for a permit to demolish any Significant or Contributory Building from which TDR have been transferred.

No demolition permit may be approved unless: (1) it is determined that under the designation, taking into account the value of Transferable Development Rights and costs of rehabilitation to meet the requirements of the Building Code or other City, State or federal laws, the property retains no substantial remaining market value or reasonable use; or (2) the Superintendent of the Bureau of Building Inspection or the Chief of the Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety determines, after consultation, to the extent feasible, with the Department of City Planning, that an imminent safety hazard exists and that demolition of the structure is the only feasible means to secure the public safety. Costs of rehabilitation necessitated by alterations made in violation of Section 1110, by demolition in violation of Section 1112, or by failure to maintain the property in violation of Section 1117, may not be included in the calculation of rehabilitation costs under Subsection (1).

SEC. 1113. <u>STANDARDS OF REVIEW FOR NEW AND REPLACEMENT</u> CONSTRUCTION IN CONSERVATION DISTRICTS.

- (a) The HPC, Planning Commission, Board of Appeals, and Board of Supervisors shall find in their review of applications for No person shall construct or cause to be constructed any new or replacement structure or for an addtion to any existing structure in a Conservation District unless it is found that such construction is compatible in scale and design with the District as set forth in Sections 6 and 7 of the Appendix which that describes the District.
- (b) Applications for a building or site permit to construct or add to a structure in any Conservation District shall be reviewed <u>and approved, approved with modifications, or disapproved</u>
 Planning Commission
 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
 Page 43

1	by the HPC before any other Planning approval action that may be required, including review by the
2	Planning Commission pursuant to the procedures set forth in Section 309 and shall only be
3	approved pursuant to Section 309 if they meet the standards set forth herein. in this Article.
4	For projects that require Section 309 review, the Planning Commission may modify the decision of the
5	HPC pursuant to Section 1114, provided that the project does not concern a designated Significant
6	(Categories I and II) or a Contributory (Category III) building.
7	(c) , if If a building or site permit application for construction of a building to construct or
8	add to a structure in any Conservation District is approved by the HPC pursuant to this Section
9	Article without modification by the Planning Commission and if the building is constructed in
10	accordance with such approval, and if the building \underline{is} located in a Conservation District for
11	which, pursuant to Section 8 of the Appendix establishing that district, such a transfer is
12	permitted, the building shall be deemed a Compatible Replacement Building, and the lot on
13	which such building is located shall be eligible as a Preservation Lot for the transfer of TDR.
14	SEC. 1114. <u>MODIFICATION OF A DECISION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION</u>
15	COMMISSION.
16	For projects that require multiple planning approvals, the HPC shall review and act on any
17	Permit to Alter or Permit to Demolish before any other Planning approval action.
18	(a) For projects that require a Conditional Use Authorization or Permit Review under
19	Section 309 and do not concern a Significant Building (Categories I & II) or a Contributory Building
20	(Category III only), the Planning Commission may modify any decision on a Permit to Alter or Permit
21	to Demolish by a two-thirds vote, provided that the Planning Commission shall apply all applicable
22	historic resources provisions of this Code.
23	(b) For projects to be located on vacant lots, the Planning Commission may modify any
24	decision on a Permit to Alter by a two-thirds vote, provided that the Planning Commission shall apply
25	all applicable historic resources provisions of this Code.

Page 44

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

The HPC's or the Planning Commission's decision on a Permit to Alter or a Permit to

Demolish shall be final unless appealed to the Board of Appeals, which may modify the decision by a

four-fifths vote; provided however, that if the project requires Board of Supervisors approval or is

appealed to the Board of Supervisors as a Conditional Use Authorization, the decision shall not be

appealed to the Board of Appeals but rather to the Board of Supervisors, which may modify the

decision by a majority vote. Any appeal must be made within 30 days after the date of the final action

by the HPC or Planning Commission.

SEC. 1116. UNLAWFUL ALTERATION OR DEMOLITION.

- (a) In addition to any other penalties provided in Section ##191120 or elsewhere, alteration or demolition of a Significant or Contributory Building or any building within a Conservation District in violation of the provisions of this Article shall eliminate the eligibility of the building's lot as a Preservation Lot__, and such_Such a lot, if it is the site of an unlawfully demolished Significant Building, or Contributory Building from which TDR have been transferred, may not be developed in excess of the floor area ratio of the demolished building for a period of 20 years from the unlawful demolition, if it is the site of an unlawfully demolished Significant Building (Category I or II), or Contributory Building (Category III) or the site of an unlawfully demolished Contributory Building (Category IV) from which TDR have been transferred, No department shall approve or issue a permit that would authorize construction of a structure contrary to the provisions of this Section.
 - (b) A property owner may be relieved of the penalties provided in Subsection (a) if:
- (1) as to an unlawful alteration-or demolition, the owner can demonstrate to the Zoning Administrator HPC that the violation would have constituted a Minor Alteration and has applied for a Permit for Minor Alteration to legalize the violation did not constitute a major alteration as defined in Section 1111.1; or

qualities and character of the building destroyed or altered, including exterior character-defining spaces, materials, features, finishes, exterior walls and exterior ornamentation. A property owner who wishes to effect a restoration pursuant to Subsection (b)(2) shall, in connection with the filing of a building or site permit application, seek approval of the proposed restoration by reference to the provisions of this Section. If the <u>HPC approves the</u> application is approved and it is determined determines that the proposed work will effect adequate restoration, the City Planning CommissionHPC shall so find. Upon such approval, and the completion of such work, the lot shall again become an eligible Preservation Lot and the limitation on floor area ratio set forth in Subsection (a) shall not thereafter apply. The City Planning CommissionHPC may not approve the restoration unless it first finds that the restoration can be done with a substantial degree of success. The determination under this Subsection (b)(2) is a final administrative decision.

SEC. 11151117. CONFORMITY WITH OTHER CITY PERMIT PROCESSES.

Except where explicitly so stated, nothing in this Article shall be construed as relieving any person from other applicable permit requirements. The following requirements are intended to insure conformity between existing City permit processes and the provisions of this Article:

(a) Upon the designation of a building as a Significant or Contributory Building, or upon the designation of the Conservation District, the *Zoning Administrator Planning Department* shall inform the Central Permit Bureau of said designation or, in the case of a Conservation District, of the boundaries of said District and a complete list of all the buildings within said District and their designations. The Central Permit Bureau shall maintain a current record of such Buildings and Conservation Districts.

1

(b) Upon receipt of any application for a building permit, demolition permit, site permit, alteration permit, or any other permit relating to a Significant or Contributory Building or a building within a designated Conservation District, the Central Permit Bureau shall forward such application to the *Planning Department of City Planning, except as provided in* Section 1111. If the Zoning Administrator Planning Department determines that the application is subject to provisions of this Article, processing shall proceed under the provisions of this Article. The Central Permit Bureau shall not issue any permit for construction, alteration, removal or demolition of any structure, or for any work involving a Significant or Contributory Building or a building within a Conservation District unless either the Zoning Administrator Planning Department has determined that such application is exempt from the provisions of this Article, or processing under this Article is complete and necessary approvals under this Article have been obtained. The issuance of any permit by a City department or agency that is inconsistent with any provision of this Article may be revoked by the Superintendent of the Bureau Director of the Department of Building Inspection pursuant to Section 303(e)the provisions of the San Francisco Building Code.

(c) No abatement proceedings or enforcement proceedings shall be undertaken by any department of the City for a Significant or Contributory building or a building within a Conservation District without, to the extent feasible, prior notification of the *Department of City* Planning *Department and the HPC*. Such proceedings shall comply with the provisions of this Article where feasible.

SEC. 11161118. UNSAFE OR DANGEROUS CONDITIONS.

Where the Superintendent of the Bureau Director of the Department of Building Inspection or the Chief of the Bureau of Fire Prevention and Public Safety determines that a condition on or within a Significant or Contributory Building is unsafe or dangerous and determines further that repair or other work rather than demolition will not threaten the public safety, said official Planning Commission

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

shall, after consulting with the <u>Planning</u> Department-of <u>City Planning and the HPC</u>, to the extent feasible, determine the measures of repair or other work necessary to correct the condition in a manner which, insofar as it does not conflict with State or local requirements, is consistent with the purposes and standards set forth in this Article.

SEC. <u>1117</u>1119. MAINTENANCE REQUIREMENTS AND ENFORCEMENT THEREOF.

- (a) Maintenance. The owner, lessee, or other person in actual charge of a Significant or Contributory Building shall comply with all applicable codes, laws and regulations governing the maintenance of property. It is the intent of this Section to preserve from deliberate or inadvertent neglect the exterior features of buildings designated Significant or Contributory, and the interior portions thereof when such maintenance is necessary to prevent deterioration and decay of the exterior. All such buildings shall be preserved against such decay and deterioration and free from structural defects through prompt corrections of any of the following defects:
 - (1) Facades which may fall and injure members of the public or property;
- (2) Deteriorated or inadequate foundation, defective or deteriorated flooring or floor supports, deteriorated walls or other vertical structural supports;
- (3) Members of ceilings, roofs, ceiling and roof supports or other horizontal members which sag, split or buckle due to defective material or deterioration;
- (4) Deteriorated or ineffective waterproofing of exterior walls, roofs, foundations or floors, including broken windows or doors;
- (5) Defective or insufficient weather protection for exterior wall covering, including lack of paint or weathering due to lack of paint or other protective covering;
- (6) Any fault or defect in the building which renders it not properly watertight or structurally unsafe.

(b) Enforcement Procedures. The procedures set forth in Building Code Sections 203114 through 116 governing unsafe buildings or property shall be applicable to any violations of this Section.

SEC. 11191120. ENFORCEMENT AND PENALTIES.

Enforcement and Penalties shall be as provided in Sections 176 and 176.1 of this Code.

SEC. 11201121. RELATIONSHIP TO ARTICLE 10.

Buildings or areas within the C-3 District designated pursuant to the provisions of both Article 10 and Article 11 shall be regulated pursuant to the procedures of both Articles. In case of conflict, the more restrictive provision shall control.

Notwithstanding the rating of a building in a C-3 District pursuant to the provisions of Article 11, buildings may be designated as landmarks according to the provisions of Article 10.

Where an appeal is taken from a decision regarding alteration of a building which is both a landmark under Article 10 and a Significant or Contributory Building under Article 11, the appeal shall be taken to the Board of Supervisors pursuant to the provisions of Article 10.

SEC. 11211122. NOTICE OF AMENDMENT.

Notice of *anythe* hearing before the *City Planning Commission, or, if no hearing, notice of HPC and* the first hearing before the Board of Supervisors, of a proposed amendment to this Article which materially alters the limitations and requirements applicable to any building or class of buildings shall be given to the owners of such buildings by mail.

SEC. 11221123. NOTICE PROCEDURE.

When any provision of this Article requires notice by mail to a property owner, the officer or body providing the notice shall use for this purpose the names and addresses as shown on the latest citywide Assessment Roll in the Assessor's Office.

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Page 49 5/9/2012

By:

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

SEC. <u>1123</u>1124. TIME PROVISIONS.

Unless otherwise indicated, all time provisions governing the taking of action by City officials are directory and not mandatory.

SEC. 11241125. SEVERABILITY.

If any part of this Article 11 is held to be unconstitutional or invalid, such decision shall not affect the validity of the remaining portions of this Article 11 or any part thereof. The Board of Supervisors hereby declares that it would have passed all portions of this Article <u>and any amendments thereto</u> irrespective of the fact that any one or more portions be declared unconstitutional or invalid.

Section 3. The Appendices to Article 10 are not amended by this ordinance and thus have not been included here for brevity.

Section 4. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days from the date of passage.

Section 5. In enacting this Ordinance, the Board intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles, numbers, punctuation, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent part of the Planning Code that are explicitly shown in this legislation as additions, deletions, Board amendment additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under the official title of the legislation.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

Marlena G. Byrne

Page 50 5/9/2012

Deputy City Attorney

Planning Commission
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Page 51 5/9/2012



City and County of San Francisco Tails

City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Ordinance

File Number: 120301

Date Passed: May 15, 2012

Ordinance amending the San Francisco Planning Code, Article 11, entitled "Preservation of Buildings and Districts of Architectural, Historical, and Aesthetic Importance in the C-3 Districts," in its entirety; and making findings, including environmental findings and findings of consistency with the General Plan and Planning Code Section 101.1(b).

(Supervisor Mar dissented in committee.)

April 30, 2012 Land Use and Economic Development Committee - AMENDED

April 30, 2012 Land Use and Economic Development Committee - RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED

May 08, 2012 Board of Supervisors - NOT RE-REFERRED

Ayes: 3 - Avalos, Campos and Mar

Noes: 8 - Chiu, Chu, Cohen, Elsbernd, Farrell, Kim, Olague and Wiener

May 08, 2012 Board of Supervisors - AMENDED

Ayes: 11 - Avalos, Campos, Chiu, Chu, Cohen, Elsbernd, Farrell, Kim, Mar, Olague and Wiener

May 08, 2012 Board of Supervisors - NOT AMENDED

Ayes: 3 - Avalos, Campos and Mar

Noes: 8 - Chiu, Chu, Cohen, Elsbernd, Farrell, Kim, Olague and Wiener

May 08, 2012 Board of Supervisors - AMENDED

Ayes: 6 - Avalos, Campos, Chiu, Kim, Mar and Olague

Noes: 5 - Chu, Cohen, Elsbernd, Farrell and Wiener

May 08, 2012 Board of Supervisors - PASSED ON FIRST READING AS AMENDED

Ayes: 8 - Chiu, Chu, Cohen, Elsbernd, Farrell, Kim, Olague and Wiener

Noes: 3 - Avalos, Campos and Mar

May 15, 2012 Board of Supervisors - FINALLY PASSED

Ayes: 8 - Chiu, Chu, Cohen, Elsbernd, Farrell, Kim, Olague and Wiener

Noes: 3 - Avalos, Campos and Mar

I hereby certify that the foregoing Ordinance was FINALLY PASSED on 5/15/2012 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

> Angela Calvillo lerk of the Board

Mayor

Date Approved