

City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

Rules Committee

City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Aaron Peskin, Rafael Mandelman, Connie Chan

Clerk: Victor Young (415) 554-7723

Monday, October 24, 2022

10:00 AM

Regular Meeting

IN-PERSON MEETING City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

(remote access provided) (remote public comment provided via teleconference)

Present: 3 - Aaron Peskin, Rafael Mandelman, and Connie Chan

The Rules Committee met in regular session, in-person with remote access and public comment via telephone, on Monday, October 24, 2022, with Chair Aaron Peskin presiding. Chair Peskin called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

The Board of Supervisors and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, remote access, and public comment via teleconference. Visit the SFGovTV website at (www.sfgovtv.org) to stream the live meetings and watch meetings on demand or watch live meetings on San Francisco Cable Channels 26, 28, 78 or 99 (depending on your provider). Members of the public may provide public comment in-person or remotely via teleconference (detailed instructions available at: https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call).

Members of the public may submit their comments by email to: victor.young@sfgov.org; all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Regularly scheduled Rules Committee Meetings begin at 10:00 a.m. every Monday of each month. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at https://sfbos.org/committees.

Please visit the Board's website (www.sfbos.org) regularly to be updated on the current situation as it affects the legislative process. For more information contact the Clerk, Victor Young, at (415) 554-7723 or victor.young@sfgov.org.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Peskin, Vice Chair Mandelman, and Member Chan were noted present. A quorum was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments for up to two minutes by dialing the provided telephone number. When connected, they will receive another prompt to dial * 3 to be added to the queue to speak. Make sure to call from a quiet location, speak clearly and slowly, and turn down your television or radio. Written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

221000 [Appointments, Reentry Council - Jusef Nathan, Joanna Hernandez, Linda Hurshman, and Jabari Jackson]

Hearing to consider appointing four members, terms ending June 1, 2024, to the Reentry Council. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Yolanda Morrissette, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must self-identify as a survivor of violence or crime, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

Seat 2, succeeding Michael Brown, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also have expertise in providing services to individuals exiting the criminal justice system, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

Seat 3, succeeding Oscar Salinas, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have been released from custody within three years of his/her appointment, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

Seat 4, succeeding Jabari Jackson, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have served multiple terms of incarceration, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

09/20/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/17/22; CONTINUED. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Chan Lam; Jusef Nathan; Andra Lamar Gadson; Jabari Jackson; Jamila McCoy; Jesse Foshay; Linda Hurshman; Riccci Wynne; John Michael; Speaker (on behalf of Joanna Hernandez); Tiffany Holmes; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Suzanna Rojas; Cederick Agar; Liz Jackson; Andrew Brooks; Ms. Gosto; Craig Johnson; Francisco Da Costa; Ricardo Garcia Costa; Katya; spoke in support of the appointment of various applicants.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Andra Lamar Gadson; Jabari Jackson; Jesses Foshay; Jermila McCoy; Linda Hurshman; Ricci Wynne; John Medina; Joanna Hernandez; Tiffany Holmes; Jusef Nathan; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Susanna Rojas; Ivan; Julio Escobar; Michael Davis; Eliana Binder; David Moroff; Laura Thomas; spoke in support of the appointment of various applicants. Speaker; Speaker; Speaker; Sarah Short; Lydia Branson; Speaker; spoke in opposition of the appointment of Ricci Wynne and support of the appointing of other various applicants.

Jusef Nathan, Seat 1, recommended. Joanna Hernandez, Seat 2, recommended (residency requirement waived). Linda Hurshman, Seat 3, recommended. Jabari Jackson, Seat 4, recommended.

Motion appointing Jusef Nathan, Joanna Hernandez (residency requirement waived), Linda Hurshman, and Jabari Jackson, terms ending June 1, 2024, to the Reentry Council. (Rules Committee) Jusef Nathan, seat 1, succeeding Yolanda Morrissette, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must self-identify as a survivor of violence or crime, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

Joanna Hernandez (residency requirement waived), seat 2, succeeding Michael Brown, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also have expertise in providing services to individuals exiting the criminal justice system, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

Linda Hurshman, seat 3, succeeding Oscar Salinas, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have been released from custody within three years of his/her appointment, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024. Jabari Jackson, seat 4, succeeding themself, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have served multiple terms of incarceration, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2024.

Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Chair Peskin request that File Nos. 221045, 221046, and 221047 be called together.

<u>221045</u> [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board No. 1 - Adena Gilbert, Jeffrey Morris, and Kristine Nelson]

Hearing to consider appointing two members, term ending September 2, 2024, and two members, terms ending September 1, 2025, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 1. (Rules Committee) Seat 1, succeeding Jeffrey Morris, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Seat 2, succeeding Scott Spertzel, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 2, 2024.

Seat 4, succeeding Kristine Nelson, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Seat 8 (Alternate Member), succeeding Paul Bellar, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 2, 2024.

10/06/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Jeffrey Morris; Adena Gilbert; Mervin Conlan; Yosef Tahbazof; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Jeffrey Morris, Seat 1, recommended. Adena Gilbert, Seat 2, recommended. Kristine Nelson, Seat 4, recommended (residency requirement waived).

Motion appointing Adena Gilbert (residency requirement waived), term ending September 2, 2024, and Jeffrey Morris and Kristine Nelson, terms ending September 1, 2025, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 1. (Rules Committee)

Adena Gilbert, seat 2, succeeding Scott Spertzel, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 2, 2024.

Jeffrey Morris, seat 1, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Kristine Nelson, seat 4, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025;

Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

<u>221046</u> [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board No. 2 - John Lee, Mervin Conlan, and Yosef Tahbazof]

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending September 2, 2024, and three members, terms expiring September 1, 2025, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 2. (Rules Committee) Seat 2, succeeding John Lee, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Seat 3, succeeding Mervin Conlan, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Seat 4, succeeding Yosef Tahbazof, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Vacant Seat 5, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 2, 2024.

10/06/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Jeffrey Morris; Adena Gilbert; Mervin Conlan; Yosef Tahbazof; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

John Lee, Seat 2, recommended. Mervin Conlan, Seat 3, recommended. Yosef Tahbazof, Seat 4, recommended (residency requirement waived).

Motion appointing Mervin Conlan, and Yosef Tahbazof, terms ending September 1, 2025, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 2. (Rules Committee)

John Lee, seat 2, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Mervin Conlan, seat 3, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Yosef Tahbazof, seat 4, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

221047 [Appointments, Assessment Appeals Board No. 3 - Shawn Ridgell and James Reynolds]

Hearing to consider appointing two members, term ending September 2, 2024, and three members, terms ending September 1, 2025, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 3. (Rules Committee) Seat 1, succeeding Shawn Ridgell, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Vacant Seat 2, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 2, 2024.

Seat 4, succeeding James Reynolds, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Vacant Seat 5, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 2, 2024.

Vacant Seat 6, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

10/06/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Jeffrey Morris; Adena Gilbert; Mervin Conlan; Yosef Tahbazof; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Shawn Ridgell, Seat 1, recommended. James Rynolds, Seat 4, recomended.

Motion appointing Shawn Ridgell and James Reynolds, terms ending September 1, 2025, to the Assessment Appeals Board No. 3. (Rules Committee)

Shawn Ridgell, seat 1, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

James Reynolds, seat 4, succeeding themself, term expired, must have a minimum of five years professional experience in the State of California as one of the following: certified public accountant or public accountant; licensed real estate broker; attorney; or a property appraiser accredited by a nationally recognized professional organization, certified by the Office of Real Estate Appraisers, or certified by the State Board of Equalization, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending September 1, 2025.

Chair Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

221043 [Administrative Code - Approval of Surveillance Technology Policies for Multiple City Departments]

Ordinance approving Surveillance Technology Policies governing the use of 1) Body-Worn Cameras by the Recreation and Park Department, 2) Security Cameras by the Department of Elections, 3) Third-Party Security Cameras by the Airport, and 4) Location Management Systems by the Recreation and Park Department; and making required findings in support of said approvals. (City Administrator)

10/03/22; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Duplicted from File No. 220843

10/03/22; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

10/03/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/17/22; CONTINUED. Heard in Committee. Speakers: John Arntz, Director (Department of Elections); Ms. Ng (Recreation and Park Department); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

Ordinance approving Surveillance Technology Policies governing the use of Body-Worn Cameras by the Recreation and Park Department, Security Cameras by the Department of Elections, and Third-Party Security Cameras by the Airport, and making required findings in support of said approvals. (City Administrator)

Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the October 31, 2022, Rules Committe meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

220641 [Administrative Code - Funding, Acquisition, and Use of Certain Police Department Equipment]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require Board of Supervisors approval of a policy governing the funding, acquisition, and use of certain law enforcement equipment consistent with the criteria set forth in state law, and approving the Police Department's use of Equipment Policy.

05/24/22; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/23/2022.

06/01/22; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Police Department for Informational Purposes.

07/11/22; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Asja Steeve; Deputy Chief of Special Operations; (Police Department); Tom Paulino (Mayor's Office); Ann Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Jennifer Tu; Marshall Lawler; spoke in opposition to the matter. David Pilpel; Rene Curran; Donna Mandel; Westley Saver; Speaker; provided information on the matter.

07/11/22; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR AS AMENDED.

10/17/22; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.

10/17/22; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Asja Steeves (Police Department); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. John Lindsey Poland; Eiana Binder; Paul Briley; Tatiana Luis; provided information on the matter.

Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED to the October 31, 2022, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Peskin, Mandelman, Chan

220702 [Administrative Code - Definitions of Prohibited Discrimination in Contracting Ordinances and Human Rights Commission Ordinance]

Sponsors: Mayor; Mandelman and Dorsey

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to revise the definitions of gender identity, sex, and sexual orientation, and add the definition of gender expression, in Chapters 12B and 12C (ordinances prohibiting discrimination in contracting including property contracts); revise the definition of age in Chapters 12A (the Human Rights Commission ordinance) and 12B; and revise the definition of disability in Chapters 12A, 12B, and 12C.

(Meet and confer obligations not met.)

06/07/22; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 7/7/2022.

06/18/22; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Human Rights Department and Purchaser for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.

Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:41 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.