



# City and County of San Francisco

## Meeting Minutes

### Rules Committee

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai*

*Clerk: Victor Young  
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

---

**Monday, July 17, 2023**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

### **Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, in-person with remote access and public comment via telephone, on Monday, July 17, 2023, with Chair Matt Dorsey presiding. Chair Dorsey called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.*

### **Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*The Board of Supervisors ([www.sfbos.org](http://www.sfbos.org)) and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, in-person public comment (prioritized before remote public comment), remote access (watch: [www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)), and remote public comment via teleconference (<https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>).*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Dorsey and Vice-Chair Walton were noted present. Member Safai was noted not present. A quorum of the committee was present.*

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, that when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments in-person or by dialing the telephone number published on the agenda and scrolling across the screen. Clerk Young further announced that in-person public comment will be taken before remote public comment is called.*

*(Those who are providing public comment remotely must dial \*3 to be added to the remote queue to speak. Written comments may be submitted through email ([victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.)*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### 221161 [Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code - Campaign Advertisement Disclaimer Requirements]

**Sponsor: Chan**

Ordinance amending the Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code to modify disclaimer requirements for campaign advertisements, to conform to a court order.  
(Pursuant to Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code, Section 1.103, this matter requires two-thirds vote of the full membership of the Board of Supervisors (8 votes) for passage.)

11/15/22; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 12/15/2022.

11/17/22; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Department of Elections for informational purposes and the Ethics Commission for review and approval.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: Supervisor Connie Chan (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Dorsey, Walton

Absent: 1 - Safai

### 230689 [Administrative Code - Surveillance Technology Policy - Social Media Management Software]

Ordinance approving Surveillance Technology Policy for Human Services Agency use of social media management software. (Human Services Agency)

05/26/23; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

06/13/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 7/13/2023.

06/18/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Department of Technology for informational purposes.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: Theresa Young, Director of Communications, (Human Services Agency); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Dorsey, Walton

Absent: 1 - Safai

Member Safai was noted present at 10:16 a.m.

Chair Dorsey requested that File Nos. 230747 and 230748 be called together.

**230747 [Mayoral Reappointment, Entertainment Commission - Ben Bleiman]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the reappointment of Ben Bleiman to the Entertainment Commission, for a term ending July 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.117, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 14, 2023.)

Seat 5, succeeding Ben Bleiman, term expiring July 1, 2023, nominated by the Mayor and must represent interests of entertainment associations/groups, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2027.  
06/13/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Ben Bleiman; Cynthia Wang; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the reappointment of Ben Bleiman to the Entertainment Commission, for a term ending July 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.117, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 14, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230748 [Mayoral Reappointment, Entertainment Commission - Cynthia Wang]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for reappointment of Cynthia Wang to the Entertainment Commission, term ending July 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.117, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 14, 2023.)

Seat 6, Cynthia Wang, term expiring July 1, 2023, nominated by the Mayor and must represent interests of urban planning community, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2027.

06/13/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Ben Bleiman; Cynthia Wang; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for reappointment of Cynthia Wang to the Entertainment Commission, term ending July 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.117, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 14, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230697 [Reappointment, Entertainment Commission - Dori Caminong]**

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending July 1, 2027, to the Entertainment Commission. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Theodora Marie Caminong, term expiring July 1, 2023, must represent the interests of City neighborhood associations or groups, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending July 1, 2027.

06/05/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: Dori Caminong; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion reappointing Dori Caminong, term ending July 1, 2027, to the Entertainment Commission. (Rules Committee)

Dori Caminong, seat 1, succeeding themselves, term expired July 1, 2023, must represent the interests of City neighborhood associations or groups, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending July 1, 2027.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230827 [Mayoral Appointment, Building Inspection Commission - Earl Shaddix]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Earl Shaddix to the Building Inspection Commission, term ending July 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.121, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: July 11, 2023.)

Seat 2, inaugural appointment, nominated by the Mayor and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors within 60 days, for the unexpired portion of a two-year ending July 1, 2025.

07/11/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Earl Shaddix; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Jordan Davis; spoke neither in support nor against the appointment of Earl Shaddix.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Earl Shaddix to the Building Inspection Commission, term ending July 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board)  
(Charter, Section 4.121, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: July 11, 2023.)

**Member Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230828 [Mayoral Appointment, Homelessness Oversight Commission - Dena Aslanian-Williams]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Dena Aslanian-Williams to the Homelessness Oversight Commission, term ending May 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 4.133, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors within and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: July 12, 2023.)

Seat 4, inaugural appointment, appointed by the Mayor subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors within 60 days and must be held by a person with a record of participation in a merchants' or small business association, or neighborhood association, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending May 1, 2025.

07/11/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dena Aslanian-Williams; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Jack Shay; Gabe Shrier; Stephen Martin-Pinto (West of Twin Peaks Neighborhood Council); Mike Dorer; Kimberly Wong; spoke in support of the appointment of Dena Aslanian-Williams. Jordan Davis; Sarah Short (Homerise); spoke in opposition to the appointment of Dena Aslanian-Williams.*

**Member Safai moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Dena Aslanian-Williams to the Homelessness Oversight Commission, term ending May 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 4.133, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors within and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: July 12, 2023.)

**Member Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230809 [Park Code - PROSAC Membership]****Sponsors: Peskin; Walton, Safai and Chan**

Ordinance amending the Park Code to 1) reduce the number of seats on the Parks, Recreation, and Open Space Advisory Committee (PROSAC), 2) provide for alternate members, 3) allow members to serve for more than four consecutive terms, 4) provide for the appointment of members having experience with environmental justice, racial equity, and disability issues; and 5) provide that meetings shall occur at City Hall.

07/11/23; RE-REFERRED to Rules Committee. Duplicated from File No. 230482.

07/11/23; DUPLICATED. Supervisor Safai DUPLICATED the Ordinance in File No. 230482 on Final Passage.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Richard Rothman; Wenda Aragon; Steven Depont-Kalani; spoke in support of the matter. David Pilpel; provided information on the matter.*

**Member Safai moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to strike 'environmental justice' throughout the legislation; to add the expectation that alternates are expected to attend and participate as nonvoting members; on Page 2, Lines 12-19, by inserting 'Where a voting seat that is subject to appointment by a Supervisor is vacant for more than 30 days, the Committee shall advise the appointing Supervisor of the vacancy. If the vacancy is not filled within 30 days of transmission of the notice of vacancy to the appointing Supervisor, the President shall appoint a member to the vacant seat, subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors, and shall become the member's appointing authority for the remainder of the member's term, at the end of which the authority to appoint a member to the seat shall revert back to the appointing Supervisor', and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Ordinance amending the Park Code to 1) reduce the number of seats on the Parks, Recreation, and Open Space Advisory Committee (PROSAC), 2) provide for alternate members, 3) allow members to serve for more than four consecutive terms, 4) provide for the appointment of members having experience with racial equity and disability issues; and 5) provide that meetings shall occur at City Hall.

**Member Safai moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 24, 2023, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:25 a.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*