



# City and County of San Francisco

## Meeting Minutes

### Rules Committee

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai*

*Clerk: Victor Young  
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

---

**Monday, October 23, 2023**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

### **Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, October 23, 2023, with Chair Matt Dorsey presiding. Chair Dorsey called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Dorsey, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Safai were noted present. A quorum of the Committee was present.*

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **230985 [Charter Amendment - Minimum Police Department Staffing and Five-Year Annual Funding Requirement]**

#### **Sponsors: Dorsey; Engardio**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish minimum staffing levels for sworn officers of the Police Department, requiring for a period of five years that the Mayor and Board of Supervisors appropriate funds to meet staffing levels, establishing a Police Full Staffing Fund for a period of five years for purposes of facilitating minimum police staffing, and allowing for a temporary freeze of appropriations to the Police Full Staffing Fund in a budget or economic emergency; at an election to be held on March 5, 2024.

09/19/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 10/19/2023.

09/26/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and the Police Department per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/03/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines.

10/19/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Chief William Scott; Commander Nicole Jones, Deputy Chief Peter Walsh, and Patrick Leung (Police Department); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Mary Harris (All My Neighbors in Action); Henry Kolonowitz (SFPD Small Business Advisory Forum); Shelley Costantini; Isabella Gomide; Speaker; Alan Burradell; Chema Hernandez Gil (SEIU Local 1021); Karina Velasquez (Stop Crime SF); Charlotte Wolfstern; Speaker; Tenika; Carlie Matthews; Ms. Portay; Marlene Tran; May Lai Yeung; Jake Conner Otega; Marie Hurabiell; Richard Purino; Leah McGeever; Speaker; Tiffany Good; Donna Herwitz; Harry Fludermersh; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter. George Wooding; Steven Johnson; Jordan Davis; Jasmine Nazari; Speaker; Steve Cotton; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, to adjust the minimum staffing number proposed from 2,182 down to 2,074, and adjust each prior annual target downward by 100 officers; clarifying that the Fund will provide additional resources to the Department that will be used exclusively to support full staffing; and enabled private philanthropic donations as the source of revenue into the Full Staffing Fund. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Dorsey, Safai

Noes: 1 - Walton

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish minimum staffing levels for sworn officers of the Police Department, requiring for a period of five years that the Mayor and Board of Supervisors appropriate funds to meet staffing levels, establishing a Police Full Staffing Fund for a period of five years for purposes of facilitating minimum police staffing, and allowing for a temporary freeze of appropriations to the Police Full Staffing Fund in a budget or economic emergency; at an election to be held on March 5, 2024.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Charter Amendment be NOT AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, to adjust the process for establishing the minimum staffing number after the initial 5 year period and allow the Chief to request the Board of Supervisors review the Commission's action. The motion FAILED by the following vote:**

Ayes: 1 - Dorsey

Noes: 2 - Walton, Safai

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the October 30, 2023, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

### **231008 [Administrative Code - Community Policing and Foot and Bike Patrols]**

**Sponsors: Safai; Engardio, Peskin, Ronen, Chan, Walton and Dorsey**

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require the Chief of Police to adopt a foot and bike patrol strategy for the Police Department, and to require the Police Commission to hold annual hearings regarding community policing and foot and bike patrols.

09/26/23; ASSIGNED to Rules Committee. 9/27/23 - President Peskin waived the 30-day rule pursuant to Board Rule No. 3.22.

10/10/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Police Department and Police Commission for information purposes.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Chief William Scott (Police Department); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Mary Harris (All My Neighbors in Action); spoke in support of the matter. Lea McGeever; Jordan Davis; spoke in opposition of the matter.*

*Supervisors Walton and Dorsey requested to be added as a co-sponsors.*

**Member Safai moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED to the October 30, 2023, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

### **230986 [Charter Amendment - Mayor Approval Required for Certain SFMTA Budget Proposals]**

**Sponsors: Safai; Peskin**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to provide that the Mayor must affirmatively approve in writing certain San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) proposals as part of the SFMTA's proposed budget or budget amendment; proposals subject to the approval requirement include changes to fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of parking meter operation; at an election to be held on March 5, 2024.

(Supervisor Dorsey dissented in committee.)

09/19/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 10/19/2023.

09/26/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and Municipal Transportation Agency per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/03/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not Defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines.

10/19/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Joel Ramos (SFMTA); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Abdul Algahim, Esperanza Ruelas, and Mariella (SEIU Local 87); Maria Hrabie; spoke in support of the matter. Cyrus Hall; J. Wesley; spoke in opposition of the matter.*

**Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Noes: 1 - Dorsey

**230987 [Charter Amendment - Establishing the Department of Emergency Management in the Charter]****Sponsor: Safai**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish within the Charter the Department of Emergency Management, the position of the Director of the Department, and the Director's qualifications and appointing authority; at an election to be held on March 5, 2024.

09/19/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 10/19/2023.

09/26/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and Department of Emergency Management per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/03/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines.

10/19/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.*

**Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 12:03 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*