



# City and County of San Francisco

## Meeting Minutes

### Rules Committee

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai*

*Clerk: Victor Young  
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

---

**Monday, November 13, 2023**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

### **Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, November 13, 2023, with Chair Matt Dorsey presiding. Chair Dorsey called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Dorsey, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Safai were noted present. A quorum of the Committee was present.*

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email ([victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **231041 [Appointments, Ballot Simplification Committee - Christine Unruh, Betty Packard, and Ruth Grace Wong]**

Hearing to consider appointing three members, terms ending November 30, 2024, to the Ballot Simplification Committee. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Scott Patterson, term expired, must be nominated by the National Academy of Television Arts and Sciences, Northern California Chapter or the Northern California Broadcasters Association, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

Seat 2, succeeding Betty Packard, term expired, must be nominated by the National Academy of Television Arts and Sciences, Northern California Chapter or the Northern California Broadcasters Association, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

Seat 3, succeeding Ann Merrill, term expired, must be nominated by the League of Women Voters of San Francisco, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

10/11/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Betty Packard; Ruth Grace Wong; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Speaker; spoke in support of the appointment of various applicant(s).*

*Christine Unruh, seat 1, recommended.*

*Betty Packard, seat 2, recommended.*

*Ruth Grace Wong, seat 3, recommended.*

### **PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Christine Unruh, Betty Packard, and Ruth Grace Wong, terms ending November 30, 2024, to the Ballot Simplification Committee. (Rules Committee)

Christine Unruh, Seat 1, succeeding Scott Patterson, term expired, must be nominated by the National Academy of Television Arts and Sciences, Northern California Chapter or the Northern California Broadcasters Association, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

Betty Packard, Seat 2, succeeding themselves, term expired, must be nominated by the National Academy of Television Arts and Sciences, Northern California Chapter or the Northern California Broadcasters Association, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

Ruth Grace Wong, Seat 3, succeeding Ann Merrill, term expired, must be nominated by the League of Women Voters of San Francisco, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Chair Dorsey requested File Nos. 231017 and 231019 be called together.

**231017 [Hearing - Declaration of Policy - Eighth Grade Algebra and SFUSD Math Curriculum Development]**

**Sponsors: Engardio; Safai, Melgar, Stefani and Dorsey**

Hearing to consider the proposed Declaration of Policy submitted by four or more Supervisors to the voters for the March 5, 2024, Election, entitled "Declaration of Policy urging the San Francisco Unified School District (SFUSD) to offer Algebra 1 to students by the eighth grade, and supporting the SFUSD in its efforts to develop its math curriculum for students at all grade levels."

09/26/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/10/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning for CEQA Determination and the Controller for financial analysis. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission and SFUSD for informational purposes.

10/25/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. CEQA does not apply to a measure submitted to the voters by the Mayor or 4+ Supervisors.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Joel Engardio (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Brent Safeway; Jeff Lucas; John Selvania; Selina Chu; Autumn Lowe; Lawrence Lee; Chanel; Mimi; Speaker; Yen; Angela; Jimmy; Louies; spoke in support of the matter. Alec Bartolai; Lola Bartolai; provided information on the matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231019 [Declaration of Policy - Eighth Grade Algebra and SFUSD Math Curriculum Development]**

**Sponsors: Engardio; Safai, Melgar, Stefani and Dorsey**

Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on March 5, 2024, a Declaration of Policy urging the San Francisco Unified School District (SFUSD) to offer Algebra 1 to students by the eighth grade, and supporting the SFUSD in its efforts to develop its math curriculum for students at all grade levels.

09/26/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/10/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning for CEQA Determination and the Controller for financial analysis. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission and SFUSD for informational purposes.

10/25/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Joel Engardio (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Brent Safeway; Jeff Lucas; John Selvania; Selina Chu; Autumn Lowe; Lawrence Lee; Chanel; Mimi; Speaker; Yen; Angela; Jimmy; Louies; spoke in support of the matter. Alec Bartolai; Lola Bartolai; provided information on the matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231098 [Hearing - Initiative Ordinance - Business and Tax Regulations, Planning Codes - Transfer Tax Exemption for Conversion to Residential Use; Office Development Allocations]**

**Sponsor: Mayor**

Hearing to consider the proposed Initiative Ordinance submitted by the Mayor to the voters for the March 5, 2024, Election, entitled "Ordinance amending the Business and Tax Regulations Code to exempt from the real property transfer tax the first transfer of property that has been converted from nonresidential to residential use and to authorize the Board of Supervisors to amend or repeal any aspect of the real property transfer tax, including adopting additional exemptions from the tax, without voter approval to the extent constitutionally permitted; and amending the Planning Code to allow square footage of office space that is converted to non-office use or demolished to be available for allocation to office developments of at least 50,000 square feet in gross floor area, and to allow demolished office space that is preexisting on a site to be deducted from the required allocation for an office development on that same site."

10/17/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/17/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, Human Resources and the Treasurer and Tax Collector per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/25/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. CEQA does not apply to a measure submitted to the voters by the Mayor or 4+ Supervisors.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Andres Power (Mayor's Office); Anne Taupier (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Supervisor Dean Preston (Board of Supervisors); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Lamar Haystack; provided information on the matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231097 [Hearing - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - Police Department Policies and Procedures and Use of Technology]****Sponsor: Mayor**

Hearing to consider the proposed Initiative Ordinance submitted by the Mayor to the voters for the March 5, 2024, Election, entitled "Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to 1) require a standardized community engagement process before the Police Commission changes policies or procedures regarding Police Department operations; 2) require the Commission and Department to consider administrative burdens on staff before changing such policies or procedures, and to streamline reporting and recordkeeping procedures; 3) modify the Department's use of force and vehicle pursuit policies, and establish a technology policy, to allow officers to use body-worn cameras and drones under certain circumstances; 4) limit new restrictions on the Department's use of technology unless approved by the Board of Supervisors; 5) streamline the process for the Department to install community safety cameras; and 6) permit the Department to use Surveillance Technology for at least one year before the corresponding Surveillance Technology Policy may be disapproved by the Board of Supervisors."

10/17/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/17/23; RECEIVED.

10/23/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and the Police Department per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/25/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. CEQA does not apply to a measure submitted to the voters by the Mayor or 4+ Supervisors.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Andres Power (Mayor's Office); Chief William Scott (Police Department); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Tess Woolworth; Mr. Yolauf; Julie Traun (BAR Association); Matt Sus; spoke in opposition of the matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231096 [Hearing - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - Substance Abuse Screening, Evaluation, and Treatment Requirements for CAAP Assistance]****Sponsor: Mayor**

Hearing to consider the proposed Initiative Ordinance submitted by the Mayor to the voters for the March 5, 2024, Election, entitled "Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require recipients of aid under the County Adult Assistance Program (CAAP) who are reasonably believed to be dependent on illegal drugs to be screened for substance abuse, and to participate in appropriate substance abuse treatment where recommended by a professional evaluator; providing that failure to comply with the drug screening, evaluation, and treatment requirements without good cause will render a recipient ineligible for assistance under the CAAP program; allowing CAAP recipients who become ineligible for assistance due to non-compliance with the screening, evaluation, or treatment requirements to receive a housing stipend or access to in-kind shelter for 30 days beyond the discontinuance of their aid, with possible extensions as necessary to prevent eviction; and establishing a special fund to support the costs of the substance abuse screening and treatment program, using savings realized from implementation of the program."

10/17/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

10/17/23; RECEIVED.

10/23/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and Human Services Agency per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/25/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. CEQA does not apply to a measure submitted to the voters by the Mayor or 4+ Supervisors.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Andres Power (Mayor's Office); Trent Rhorer, Director (Human Services Agency); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); Janice Levy (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Tess Welbourne; spoke in opposition of the matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231101 [Hearing - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - Community Policing and Foot and Bike Patrols]****Sponsors: Safai; Engardio, Ronen and Peskin**

Hearing to consider the proposed Initiative Ordinance submitted by four or more Supervisors to the voters for the March 5, 2024, Election, entitled "Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require the Chief of Police to adopt a foot and bike patrol strategy for the Police Department."

10/17/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee. CEQA does not apply to a measure submitted to the voters by the Mayor or 4+ Supervisors.

10/17/23; RECEIVED.

10/23/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and the Police Department per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/25/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230987 [Charter Amendment - Establishing the Department of Emergency Management in the Charter]****Sponsor: Safai**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish within the Charter the Department of Emergency Management, the position of the Director of the Department, and the Director's qualifications and appointing authority; at an election to be held on March 5, 2024.

09/19/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 10/19/2023.

09/26/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Dept. of Elections, Ethics Commission, Office of the Controller, and Department of Emergency Management per Rules of Order. Referred to the Planning Department for CEQA Determination.

10/03/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines.

10/19/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED.

10/23/23; RECOMMENDED. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.

10/31/23; CONTINUED.

11/07/23; RE-REFERRED to Rules Committee.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to amend the date of the elections to be held from 'March 5, 2024' to 'November 5, 2024'. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish within the Charter the Department of Emergency Management, the position of the Director of the Department, and the Director's qualifications and appointing authority; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

## **ADJOURNMENT**

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 12:31 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*