



# City and County of San Francisco

## Meeting Minutes

### Rules Committee

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai*

*Clerk: Victor Young  
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

---

**Monday, January 8, 2024**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

### **Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, January 8, 2024, with Chair Matt Dorsey presiding. Chair Dorsey called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Dorsey. Vice Chair Walton, and Member Safai were noted present. A quorum of the Committee was present.*

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email ([victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **240014 [Appointment, Sunshine Ordinance Task Force - Ankita Mukhopadhyay]**

Hearing to consider appointing two members, terms ending April 27, 2025, to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Seat 4, succeeding Jaya Padmanabhan, resigned, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be either a journalist from a racial/ethnic-minority-owned news organization, a journalist whose work focuses on issues impacting minority racial or ethnic communities, or a journalist who works with a media organization or publication whose target audience is a minority racial or ethnic community. For purposes of this subsection (a), the term “journalist” shall be interpreted broadly, including but not limited to freelance journalists, photographers, and videographers, for a two-year term ending April 27, 2025.

01/02/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Ankita Mukhopadhyay; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Richard Knee Ida Mojah (Society of Professional Journalists); spoke in support of the appointment of Ankita Mukhopadhyay.*

*Ankita Mukhopadhyay, seat 4, recommended.*

#### **PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Ankita Mukhopadhyay, term expiring April 27, 2025, to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Ankita Mukhopadhyay, seat 4, succeeding Jaya Padmanabhan, resigned, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be either a journalist from a racial/ethnic-minority-owned news organization, a journalist whose work focuses on issues impacting minority racial or ethnic communities, or a journalist who works with a media organization or publication whose target audience is a minority racial or ethnic community. For purposes of this subsection (a), the term “journalist” shall be interpreted broadly, including but not limited to freelance journalists, photographers, and videographers, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2025.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231076 [Administrative Code - Composition of Behavioral Health Commission]****Sponsor: Dorsey**

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to reduce the membership of the Behavioral Health Commission from 17 to 12 seats; provide that the full Board of Supervisors rather than individual Supervisors makes these appointments; require that at least one seat be held by a veteran or veteran advocate; reduce the minimum number of seats reserved for consumers and families of consumers from nine to six; provide two seats for mental health professionals; update staggered terms for all seats; retain existing members; and remove seat requirements for child advocates.

10/17/23; ASSIGNED to Rules Committee. 30 Day Rule Waived by President Peskin.

10/23/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referral to the Behavioral Health Commission for information purposes.

11/06/23; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Wynship Hillier; spoke neither in support nor opposition on the matter.

12/11/23; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Jessica Brown and Ms. Bulluck (Department of Public Health); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Wynship Hillier; spoke in opposition of the matter. Lea McGiver; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

12/11/23; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Speaker; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter. Wynship Hillier; spoke in opposition of the matter (see Addendum on Page 6). Mark Roth; provided information on the matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to insert a requirement that one member of the Commission shall be a child advocate. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to reduce the membership of the Behavioral Health Commission from 17 to 12 seats; provide that the full Board of Supervisors rather than individual Supervisors makes these appointments; require that at least one seat be held by a veteran or veteran advocate; reduce the minimum number of seats reserved for consumers and families of consumers from nine to six; provide two seats for mental health professionals; update staggered terms for all seats; and retain existing members.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231124 [Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code - Form 700 Filers - General Services Agency - City Administrator]**

Ordinance amending the Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code to update and clarify the Conflict of Interest Code's Form 700 (Statement of Economic Interests) filing requirements for officers and employees in the General Services Agency under the City Administrator. (City Administrator) 10/30/23; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

11/07/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 12/7/2023.

11/07/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Ethics Commission for informational purposes.

12/11/23; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

12/11/23; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231217 [Administrative Code - Surveillance Technology Policy - City Administrator - Security Camera Systems]**

Ordinance approving a modified Surveillance Technology Policy for the City Administrator's Office's acquisition and use of security camera systems. (City Administrator)

11/27/23; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

12/05/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 1/4/2024.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**231263 [Calling for Sustained Ceasefire in Gaza, Humanitarian Aid, Release of Hostages, and Condemning Antisemitic, Anti-Palestinian, and Islamophobic Rhetoric and Attacks]**

**Sponsors: Preston; Ronen**

Resolution calling for a sustained ceasefire in Gaza, humanitarian aid, release of hostages, and condemning antisemitic, anti-Palestinian, and Islamophobic rhetoric and attacks.

12/05/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Dean Preston (Board of Supervisors); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Robert Bomen; Mr. Saparo; Askenda; Ellen; Soape; Gabriela Abraha; Miko; Speaker; Michelle; Speaker Rapasato; Rosetta; Speaker; Maneel Alkura; Chase Garman; Stanley Wolf; Iman Khalil; Jill Shanker; Diane Block; Speaker; Dr. Nela Bahjwa; Speaker; Speaker; Speaker; Speaker; Speaker; Speaker; Speaker Jude; Elizabeth; Ringal Bassie; Richard Rocheios; Beckal; Jack Brown; Hadidi; Sara Schorer; Leslie Dodiaday; Amana; Gloria Waggar; Judy Gerber; Denhi Donis; Sara Norman; Wendy Spatt; Speaker; Sana; Kayla; Nadine; Zana Hindi; Martha Hawthorne; Richard Girling; Damien; Aya; Hariah Cutler; Chris Tuiey; Speaker; Suri Goya; Jenny; Muhammad Abdul Rahim; Tucker Owen; Debra Frankis; Joe; Linda Barrick; Tania LaFleur; Martha Golden; Laura Golden; Zana; Emily; Salam; Jane; Eric Levy; Grey; Ola; Amy Bienhardt; Jessica Darimas; Kayla Williams; Julio Gonzalez; Joy George; Nayali Velasquez; Linda Koffman; Speaker; Speaker; Amina; Ana; Kyle; Sammy Berheim; Amilia Rapesa; Tony; Ms. Lopez; ;Moz; Joe; Sheila; Donna; Speaker; Daniel Dunn; Izzy; Nater Corey; Ibrahim; Jamie Richardson; Melissa Chan; Nora; Ms. Suarez; Speaker; Laurie Lederman; Allison; Dashier Urcharish; Nick Navinski; Asia; Bell; Sarah Powell; Speaker; Speaker; Speaker; Gates; Floyd; Laila; Sobia; Jennifer; Arafigi; Speaker; Dr. Danny Gullum; Asia; Nickel; Regan; Shara; Trina; Joel Lopez; Dr. Emma Chew Murphy; Ryan Mar; Karen; Glenn McGloughlin; Alejandro Palasios; Soware; Keith; Speaker; Adrienne; Patrice Sutton; Dr. Robert Gould; Mara Saunders; Speaker; Bonnie Dundy; Don Misumi; Christian Alcaza; Steve Leets; Speaker; John; Dr. Oscar Echeverria; Sameer; Kate; Swaki Risum; Lana Cosana; Lara Kiswani; Simone; Elias; L.H.; Isaac;; Brett; M.V.; Laura Cohen; Allison; Alex; Semore; Zoey; Charlie Shamus; Jade; Andy Gillis; Fern; Celia; Faqua; Zimbria; Speaker; Izmin; Sammie; Karen Langusen; Sydney Simpson; Musuuf; Javary Azim; M.B. Mariel; Charles Lewis; Speaker; Speaker; Dr. Saban; Naseen; Nora; Mr. Freeman; Speaker; Stacey; Kizan; Speaker; Speaker; Martha Hubert; Suni; Speaker; Ms. Yow; Muhammad; Steve Zeltzer; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; Speaker; Jay Conner B. Ortega; Boren; Nina Block; Nathan; Speaker; Celeste Ransdell; Dory Esell; Tyler Gregory; Alexa Asher; Eileen Lee; Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter. Jill Jordan; Mr. Greenberg; Eileen; Dr. Novell Pierce; Speaker; Jane Richer; Allison; Debra Levee; Ruth; Bella Beranni; Speaker; Rebecca Goodman; Linda Wolf; Afini Glosso; Jimmy Shimia; Francisco DaCosta; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE. The motion FAILED by the following vote:**

Ayes: 1 - Dorsey

Noes: 2 - Walton, Safai

**Member Safai moved that this Resolution be REFERRED WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Noes: 1 - Dorsey

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 4:15 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*

**ADDENDUM**

*Pursuant to Administrative Code, Section 67.16, the following statement was provided by a speaker during the public comment period who supplied a brief written summary of their comments, which shall be included in the meeting minutes and are incorporated by individual reference as fully set forth herein. The content is neither generated by, nor subject to approval or verification of accuracy by, the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors.*

*Wynship Hillier submitted the following additional information during Public Comment for File No. 231076, as follows: "Mr. Hillier opposed the ordinance, and said that the best determinant for the size of a public body was the strength of its applicant stream. He said that the Commission's applicant stream was more than enough to support its current size, but that the Supervisors needed to make appointments from it. He said that there were eight applications to the Behavioral Health Commission last year, but only one appointment to the Commission. As a result, the Commission struggled with ten active members for most of the year and a quorum requirement of nine. Under such circumstances, quorum faults were predictable, but they were due to the Supervisors' nonfeasance. The Supervisors should have made seven appointments, which they could have done from the eight applications with current seat requirements. This would have had more of an impact on the ability of the Commission to make quorum than the proposed ordinance would."*