



City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

Rules Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai

*Clerk: Victor Young
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

Monday, May 6, 2024

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, May 6, 2024, with Chair Hillary Ronen presiding. Chair Ronen called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Ronen and Vice Chair Walton were noted present. Member Safai was noted not present. A quorum of the Committee was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

Member Safai was noted present at 10:21 a.m.

Supervisor Ronen Excused

Vice-Chair Walton moved that Supervisor Ronen be excused from attendance for File No. 240432. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Ronen

240432 [Appointment, Local Agency Formation Commission - Supervisor Hillary Ronen]

Motion appointing Supervisor Hillary Ronen, term ending February 4, 2027, to the Local Agency Formation Commission. (Clerk of the Board)

04/30/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Walton, Safai

Excused: 1 - Ronen

240461 [Reappointment, Sanitation and Streets Commission - Thomas Richard Harrison]

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending July 1, 2028, to the Sanitation and Streets Commission. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Thomas Richard Harrison, term expiring July 1, 2024, appointed by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028.

05/01/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Thomas Richard Harrison; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Thomas Richard Harrison, seat 1, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion reappointing Thomas Richard Harrison, term ending July 1, 2028, to the Sanitation and Streets Commission. (Rules Committee)

Thomas Richard Harrison, seat 1, succeeding themselves, appointed by the Board of Supervisors, for a four-year term beginning July 1, 2024, and ending July 1, 2028.

Chair Ronen moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Walton

Absent: 1 - Safai

Chair Ronen requested that File Nos. 230868 and 240144 be called together.

230868 [Administrative, Campaign and Governmental Conduct Codes - Language Access Ordinance]

Sponsors: Walton; Chan, Safai and Ronen

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to amend the Language Access Ordinance to clarify Departments' responsibilities to provide language access services to members of the public, and to clarify the role of the Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs in administering the Language Access Ordinance; to require language access service be provided in Chinese, Spanish, Filipino, and any other language for which the requisite number of person qualifies as a Substantial Number of Limited English Proficient Persons; to amend the formula for determining when a language becomes eligible for language access services; to require Departments to translate signage; to require Departments to translate digital content provided on digital platforms; to clarify that crisis situations also includes but is not limited to pandemics, emergency response, and public safety incidents that impact and effect the community; to rename the Annual Compliance Plan to Annual Compliance Report; to impose requirements for the Language Access Ordinance Summary Report; to require Departments to inform members of the public of their right to file a complaint, and of a process for providing feedback on the Department's Language Access Services; to require Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs to create a know-your-rights brochure; to require Departments' posting notice of the availability of Language Access Services and a know-your-rights brochure; to require Departments to budget and plan for delivery of Language Access Services; to require Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs to prepare an investigation summary report of each investigation that will include findings and recommendation to address the issues raised, and to create and maintain a website for the posting of investigation summary reports; and to delete the financial disclosure requirement for Immigrant Rights Commission members.

07/25/23; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 8/24/2023.

08/08/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrants Affairs for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Jorge Rivas, Director, and Chloe Noonan (Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs); Celine Kennelly, Chair (Immigrant Rights Commission); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Anthony Friel; spoke in support of the matter. Arlene Tran; Tran Lan Lee; Ms. Yee; Speaker; Anita Terani; Jose Gunn; Speaker; Jenel; Jerad; Jemori; Speaker; Marti Guiles; Speaker; Ani; Ms. Negoa; Tela Neva; Celaya; Abdul; Ned Gee; Ronia Guitar; Fatu; Amir; Speaker; Sara Sing (Human Rights Commission); Ms. Detroti (Immigrant Rights Commission); Joy Zhan (Youth Commission); spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Supervisors Safai and Ronen requested to be added as co-sponsors.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to lower the threshold amount for the requisite number of persons needed to meet the definition of Substantial Number of Limited English Proficient Persons; to clarify that crisis situations also include refugee relief and disaster-related activities; to require departments that provide emergency response services in the event of a crisis situation or disaster-related services, involving an immediate threat of serious harm, mass casualties, conditions of natural disaster, or conditions posing extreme peril to the safety of persons and property to provide language access services; and make other clarifying and confirming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to amend the Language Access Ordinance to clarify Departments' responsibilities to provide language access services to members of the public, and to clarify the role of the Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs in administering the Language Access Ordinance; to require language access service be provided in Chinese, Spanish, Filipino, and any other language for which the requisite number of persons qualify as a Substantial Number of Limited English Proficient Persons; to lower the threshold amount for the requisite number of persons needed to meet the definition of Substantial Number of Limited English Proficient Persons; to amend the formula for determining when a language becomes eligible for language access services; to require Departments to translate signage; to require Departments to translate digital content provided on digital platforms; to clarify that crisis situations also includes but is not limited to pandemics, refugee relief, and disaster-related activities; to require departments that provide emergency response services in the event of a crisis situation or disaster-related services, involving an immediate threat of serious harm, mass casualties, conditions of natural disaster, or conditions posing extreme peril to the safety of persons and property to provide language access services; to rename the Annual Compliance Plan to Annual Compliance Report; to impose requirements for the Language Access Ordinance Summary Report; to require Departments to inform members of the public of their right to file a complaint, and of a process for providing feedback on the Department's Language Access Services; to require Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs to create a know-your-rights brochure; to require Departments' posting notice of the availability of Language Access Services and a know-your-rights brochure; to require Departments to budget and plan for delivery of Language Access Services; to require Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs to prepare an investigation summary report of each investigation that will include findings and recommendation to address the issues raised, and to create and maintain a website for the posting of investigation summary reports; and to delete the financial disclosure requirement for Immigrant Rights Commission members.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the May 13, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240144 [Hearing - Departmental Compliance - Language Access]**Sponsor: Walton**

Hearing to discuss departmental compliance with the City's Language Access Ordinance, including the review of the 2024 Language Access Summary Report from the Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs, as well as File No. 230868 (Administrative, Campaign and Governmental Conduct Codes - Language Access Ordinance), and requesting community organizations who provide language access to present feedback; and requesting the Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs to report.

02/13/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

02/22/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs for Informational Purposes

03/15/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Youth Commission for review and report.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Jorge Rivas, Director, and Chloe Noonan (Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs); Celine Kennelly, Chair (Immigrant Rights Commission); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Anthony Friel; spoke in support of the matter. Arlene Tran; Tran Lan Lee; Ms. Yee; Speaker; Anita Terani; Jose Gunn; Speaker; Jenel; Jerad; Jemori; Speaker; Marti Guiles; Speaker; Ani; Ms. Negoa; Tela Neva; Celaya; Abdul; Ned Gee; Ronia Guitar; Fatu; Amir; Speaker; Sara Sing (Human Rights Commission); Ms. Detroti (Immigrant Rights Commission); Joy Zhan (Youth Commission); spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:45 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.