



City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

Rules Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai

*Clerk: Victor Young
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

Monday, July 8, 2024

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, July 8, 2024, with Chair Hillary Ronen presiding. Chair Ronen called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Ronen, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Safai were noted present. A quorum of the Committee was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

240495 [Charter Amendment - Electing the Director of the Department of Police Accountability]**Sponsors: Walton; Safai, Ronen and Preston**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to provide for the election of the Director of the Department of Police Accountability; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/14/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/13/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and Police Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

06/27/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Barbara Attard; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Speaker; Jordan Davis; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240549 [Charter Amendment - Inspector General in Controller's Office; Expanding Controller's Investigative Powers]**Sponsors: Peskin; Safai and Ronen**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish the position of Inspector General in the Controller's Office; to provide that the Inspector General be nominated by the Controller subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor; to authorize the Inspector General to initiate and lead investigations regarding potential violations of laws or policies involving fraud, waste, abuse, or misconduct; to expand the authority of the Controller's Office to issue subpoenas; and to authorize the Controller's Office to execute search warrants to the extent permitted by State law; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and Sheriff's Department pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

06/27/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Barbara Attard; spoke in support of the matter.

Supervisor Ronen requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Speaker; Jordan Davis; spoke in support of the matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to remove the word 'misconduct' throughout the Charter Amendment; clarify the mandate of the Inspector General; include the Department of Human Resources in Coordination language; and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish the position of Inspector General in the Controller's Office; to provide that the Inspector General be nominated by the Controller subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor; to authorize the Inspector General to initiate and lead investigations regarding potential violations of laws or policies involving fraud, waste, or abuse; to expand the authority of the Controller's Office to issue subpoenas; and to authorize the Controller's Office to execute search warrants to the extent permitted by State law; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 15, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240550 [Charter Amendment - Affordable Housing Opportunity Fund for Seniors, Families, and Persons with Disabilities]**Sponsors: Peskin; Safai, Ronen, Walton and Preston**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to require the Board of Supervisors set aside specified funds in the City's budget each year, beginning in Fiscal Year 2026-2027, to fund project-based rental subsidies for extremely low-income households consisting of seniors, families with children, and persons with disabilities; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

07/01/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Matt; Speaker; Ming Tou Hue; Hi Ling Lee; Lou Lin Chan; Ma Hing Wong; Ann Lim; Jordan Davis; Leah McGeever; Brenda Coprea; Mira Morales; Marales; Violetta; Betty Traynor; Selia Keponnon; Lelanie Chin; Luchelle Red; Allie Canto; Zach Wisenberg; Speaker; E. Meadow; A. Ramo; Pete Alonso; Janet Daniels; Miles Spachun; Mitch Mankin; Colene Rebecca; Theresa Imperial; Charlie Shawn; Molly Goldberg; Curtis Bradford; Speaker; Ms. Simmer; Albiam; Speaker; Meg Hesler; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Supervisors Safai, Ronen, and Walton request to be added as co-sponsors.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE to add sections to establish the Affordable Housing Opportunity Fund; require the City to appropriate at least \$8,250,000 to the Fund annually; and make clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish the Affordable Housing Opportunity Fund for Seniors, Families, and People with Disabilities to fund project-based rental subsidies for extremely low-income households consisting of seniors, families, and persons with disabilities, and to require the City to appropriate at least \$8.25 million to the Fund annually starting in Fiscal Year 2026-2027; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 15, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240547 [Charter Amendment - Commission Reform]**Sponsors: Peskin; Ronen**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish the Commission Streamlining Task Force charged with making recommendations to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors about ways to modify, eliminate, or combine the City's appointive boards and commissions to improve the administration of City government; require the City Attorney to prepare a Charter Amendment to implement the Task Force's recommendations relating to Charter commissions, for consideration by the Board of Supervisors; and authorize the Task Force to introduce an ordinance to effectuate its recommendations relating to appointive boards and commissions codified in the Municipal Code, which ordinance shall go into effect within 90 days unless rejected by a two-thirds vote of the Board of Supervisors; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, and Ethics Commission pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/01/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Speaker; John Motsay; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; Donna Herwitz; Adelle; Speaker; Barbara Kletz; Speaker; Jennifer; Sophie; Lucy Junice; Ms. Yee; Randy; Speaker; Debra; Edward Cadweld; Mark Robin; Larry Barnoff; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Supervisor Ronen requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

07/01/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR AS AMENDED.

07/01/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Re-referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, and Ethics Commission pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Jordan Davis; spoke in support of the matter. Alan Burradell; spoke in opposition of the matter. Speaker; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240684 [Supporting The Justice for Renters Act - California State Proposition - November 5, 2024 Ballot]

Sponsors: Preston; Peskin, Ronen, Walton and Chan

Resolution supporting The Justice for Renters Act, a California State Proposition on the November 5, 2024, ballot; and reaffirming the City and County of San Francisco's support for repeal of the Costa-Hawkins Rental Housing Act.

06/11/24; REFERRED FOR ADOPTION WITHOUT COMMITTEE REFERENCE AGENDA AT THE NEXT BOARD MEETING.

06/18/24; CONTINUED.

06/25/24; CONTINUED.

07/02/24; REFERRED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Dean Preston (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Speaker; Fred; Ann Lin; Speaker; Mr. Henial; Jordan Davis; Leah McGeever; Charlie Chavez; Julie; Ms. Kantinar; Amalia; Molly Goldberg; David George Jonston; Theresa Imperial; Theresa Flawless; Janet Thanos; Mia Sotas; Naxole; Maya Scotham; Roselia Meadow; Romell Sofario; Rainy Castillio; Speaker; Adjokio; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter. Alan Burradell; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240551 [Charter Amendment - Per Diem Nurse Retirement Credit and Public Safety Communications Personnel Retirement Plan]**Sponsors: Safai; Melgar, Preston and Walton**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to allow registered nurses, who are or become members of the San Francisco Employees' Retirement System and have worked an average of 32 hours or more per week for at least one year, to purchase up to three years of service credit for time previously worked as per diem nurses; and to move public safety communications personnel (911 dispatchers, supervisors, and coordinators) from the miscellaneous retirement plans to the miscellaneous safety retirement plan, for compensation earned on and after January 1, 2025; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and SF Employees' Retirement System pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Burt Wilson; Aubrey; Nash Daniels; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter.

Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE to replace the compensation earned on or after date from 'January 1, 2025' to 'January 4, 2025' throughout the Charter Amendment; on Page 4, Lines 21-22, by inserting 'prior to becoming a member of the Retirement System'; Page 5, Lines 17-18, by inserting 'based on the contribution rate percentage in effect at the time the service was rendered'; Page 5, Lines 18-19, by inserting 'prior to the effective date of retirement. A member cannot receive more than 80 hours of service credit in a pay period and cannot receive more than one year of services credit in a fiscal year, as a result of such prior service credit purchase'; and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to allow registered nurses, who are or become members of the San Francisco Employees' Retirement System and have worked an average of 32 hours or more per week for at least one year, to purchase up to three years of service credit for time previously worked as per diem nurses; and to move public safety communications personnel (911 dispatchers, supervisors, and coordinators) from the miscellaneous retirement plans to the miscellaneous safety retirement plan, for compensation earned on and after January 4, 2025; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 15, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240552 [Charter Amendment - Fire Department Service Retirement Pension]**Sponsors: Stefani, Melgar and Safai**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to shorten to one year the period to calculate “final compensation” for retirement benefits for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; calculate “final compensation” on the basis of average compensation earnable rather than compensation earned for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages; and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor’s Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, SF Employees’ Retirement System and the Fire Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Lorenzo Rosas (Office of Supervisor Catherine Stefani); Adam Woods (Fire Department); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Sam Geller (Local 798); Dan Casey; Mario Flaherty; Stan Lee (Asian Firefighter’s Association); Steve Summers; Sina Riahi; Jeremiah Cadigan; Idel Wilson; Tim Finch; Floyd Rollins, President (Local 798); spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter. Preston Gary; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, on Page 1, Lines 6-9, to strike 'calculate "final Compensation" on the basis of average compensation earnable rather than compensation earned for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010'; strike 'earnable' throughout the Charter Amendment; and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to shorten to one year the period to calculate “final compensation” for retirement benefits for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages; and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 15, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240544 [Charter Amendment - Police Staffing and Voluntary Deferred Retirement Option Program for the Police Department]**Sponsors: Dorsey; Peskin, Stefani, Melgar, Mandelman and Safai**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish minimum staffing levels for sworn officers of the Police Department for the period from July 2025 through July 2028; requiring the Police Commission to set the minimum staffing level, based on a report from the Chief of Police, at least every three years thereafter; requiring the Police Commission to approve and submit to the Board of Supervisors a budget for the Police Department that accounts for the minimum staffing level of sworn officers; and establishing a new voluntary deferred retirement option program ("DROP") for the period from July 2025 through July 2030, for eligible members of the Police Department that allows those members to earn additional deferred compensation in the Retirement System for up to 60 months in exchange for agreeing to perform patrol or investigative work; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, Employees' Retirement System and the Police Dept pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Matt Dorsey (Board of Supervisors); Deputy Chief Walsh and Speaker (Police Department); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Richard Neil; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; Leah McGeever; Jordan Davis; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Supervisor Safai requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to define the term "Full-Duty Sworn Officer"; modify the criteria for establishing recommended staffing levels for sworn officers; change the requirement for the Chief of Police to submit a staffing report from every two years to every three years; and establish a new voluntary Deferred Retirement Option Program ("DROP") for the period from July 2025 - July 2030, for eligible members of the Police Department (in the rank of officer, sergeant, or inspector) that allows those members to earn additional deferred compensation in the Retirement System for up to 60 months in exchange for agreeing to perform neighborhood patrol or investigative work; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 15, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 2:25 p.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.