



City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

Rules Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai

*Clerk: Victor Young
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

Monday, July 15, 2024

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Hillary Ronen, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, July 15, 2024, with Chair Hillary Ronen presiding. Chair Ronen called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Ronen, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Safai were noted present. A quorum of the Committee was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

240495 [Charter Amendment - Electing the Director of the Department of Police Accountability]**Sponsors: Walton; Safai, Ronen and Preston**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to provide for the election of the Director of the Department of Police Accountability; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/14/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/13/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and Police Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

06/27/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Barbara Attard; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

07/08/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Speaker; Jordan Davis; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): H. Brown; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Walton moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240545 [Charter Amendment - Accountability for Funding Children and Youth Services for City Departments and the School District; Clarifying Uses of the Student Success Fund]

Sponsors: Melgar; Ronen, Walton, Stefani, Safai, Dorsey, Engardio and Preston

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to 1) create an Our Children, Our Families Initiative (“Initiative”) to coordinate efforts by City departments and the San Francisco Unified School District (“School District”) to deliver outcomes-based services for children, youth, and families; 2) require the Initiative to use an objective and measurable outcomes framework (“Outcomes Framework”) to evaluate the budget and spending of each City department with expenditures that are eligible to be included in the Children and Youth Fund baseline, the Public Education Enrichment Fund (“PEEF”), the PEEF baseline, or any discretionary funding allocated from the General Fund for children, youth, and families; 3) require the Mayor and Board of Supervisors to consider the Initiative’s findings during their consideration of the City budget each year, including by the Board of Supervisors holding a public hearing and adopting findings about the expenditures; 4) require the School District to submit a proposal once every five years describing how it will spend the City’s general fund contribution to the PEEF consistent with the San Francisco Children and Families Plan and the Outcomes Framework, and prohibit the City from providing PEEF funding to the School District until the Board of Supervisors and Mayor have approved the School District’s proposal; 5) require the School District to submit annual reports describing how it has spent the City’s general fund contribution and the PEEF funding for arts, music, sports, and library programs; 6) authorize the Board of Supervisors and Mayor to place PEEF funding to the School District on reserve if the School District’s expenditures are inconsistent with the Charter, the Outcomes Framework, or the School District’s spending plan or its internal guidelines regarding student educational outcomes; 7) provide that money set aside for the School District in the Student Success Fund cannot replace, supplant, count as, or substitute for other City funding for the School District or children and youth required under the Children and Youth Fund, the PEEF, or other provisions in the Charter; and 8) prohibit the City from providing discretionary funds to the School District unless it has entered into a data-sharing agreement with the City; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor’s Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, Children and Families Commission, Human Services Agency, Department of Early Childhood and Dept of Children, Youth and Their Families and pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4. Referred to the Youth Commission for review and report.

07/01/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Myrma Melgar (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter.

07/11/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Leslie Blue; Algaline; Ms. Esperata; John Trasvina; spoke in support of the matter.

07/11/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE.

07/11/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE.

07/11/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/11/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor’s Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, Children and Families Commission, Human

Services Agency, Department of Early Childhood and Dept of Children, Youth and Their Families and pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4. Referred to the Youth Commission for review and report.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240549 [Charter Amendment - Inspector General in Controller's Office; Expanding Controller's Investigative Powers]

Sponsors: Peskin; Safai, Ronen and Preston

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish the position of Inspector General in the Controller's Office; to provide that the Inspector General be nominated by the Controller subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor; to authorize the Inspector General to initiate and lead investigations regarding potential violations of laws or policies involving fraud, waste, or abuse; to expand the authority of the Controller's Office to issue subpoenas; and to authorize the Controller's Office to execute search warrants to the extent permitted by State law; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and Sheriff's Department pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

06/27/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Barbara Attard; spoke in support of the matter.

Supervisor Ronen requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

07/08/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Speaker; Jordan Davis; spoke in support of the matter.

07/08/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/09/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and Sheriff's Department pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): H. Brown; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240550 [Charter Amendment - Affordable Housing Opportunity Fund for Seniors, Families, and Persons with Disabilities]**Sponsors: Peskin; Safai, Ronen, Walton, Preston, Chan, Dorsey, Mandelman and Melgar**

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to establish the Affordable Housing Opportunity Fund for Seniors, Families, and People with Disabilities to fund project-based rental subsidies for extremely low-income households consisting of seniors, families, and persons with disabilities, and to require the City to appropriate at least \$8.25 million to the Fund annually starting in Fiscal Year 2026-2027; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, and Ethics Commission pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/01/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

07/08/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): President Aaron Peskin (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Matt; Speaker; Ming Tou Hue; Hi Ling Lee; Lou Lin Chan; Ma Hing Wong; Ann Lim; Jordan Davis; Leah McGeever; Brenda Coprea; Mira Morales; Marales; Violetta; Betty Traynor; Selia Keponnon; Lelanie Chin; Luchelle Red; Allie Canto; Zach Wisenberg; Speaker; E. Meadow; A. Ramo; Pete Alonso; Janet Daniels; Miles Spachun; Mitch Mankin; Colene Rebecca; Theresa Imperial; Charlie Shawn; Molly Goldberg; Curtis Bradford; Speaker; Ms. Simmer; Albiam; Speaker; Meg Hesler; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Supervisors Safai, Ronen, and Walton request to be added as co-sponsors.

07/08/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/09/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, and Ethics Commission pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): John Avalos; spoke in support of the matter. H. Brown; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240551 [Charter Amendment - Per Diem Nurse Retirement Credit and Public Safety Communications Personnel Retirement Plan]**Sponsors: Safai; Melgar, Preston, Walton and Chan**

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to allow registered nurses, who are or become members of the San Francisco Employees' Retirement System and have worked an average of 32 hours or more per week for at least one year, to purchase up to three years of service credit for time previously worked as per diem nurses; and to move public safety communications personnel (911 dispatchers, supervisors, and coordinators) from the miscellaneous retirement plans to the miscellaneous safety retirement plan, for compensation earned on and after January 4, 2025; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and SF Employees' Retirement System pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/08/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Burt Wilson; Aubrey; Nash Daniels; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter.

07/08/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/09/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, and SF Employees' Retirement System pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.

Member Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

240552 [Charter Amendment - Fire Department Service Retirement Pension]**Sponsors: Stefani, Melgar, Safai and Chan**

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to shorten to one year the period to calculate "final compensation" for retirement benefits for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages; and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, SF Employees' Retirement System and the Fire Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/08/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Lorenzo Rosas (Office of Supervisor Catherine Stefani); Adam Woods (Fire Department); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Sam Geller (Local 798); Dan Casey; Mario Flaherty; Stan Lee (Asian Firefighter's Association); Steve Summers; Sina Riahi; Jeremiah Cadigan; Idel Wilson; Tim Finch; Floyd Rollins, President (Local 798); spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter. Preston Gary; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

07/08/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/09/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, SF Employees' Retirement System and the Fire Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Janice Levy (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Chief Jeanine Nicholson (Fire Department); Alison Romano, Chief Executive (San Francisco Employees' Retirement System); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Secretary Adam Wood and President Floyd Rollins (Local 798); spoke in support of the matter. H. Brown; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, on Page 1, Lines 4-5, to strike 'shorten to one year the period to calculate "final compensation" for retirement benefits for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; Page 1, Lines 21-23, to strike 'it increased to three years the final compensation time period for calculating retirement benefits for employees who were hired on and after January 7, 2012. Further; Page 7, Line 17-19, to strike 'any one year of credited service in which the member's average compensation is the highest; to strike Section A.8.601 (Members of the Fire Department on and after July 1, 2010), A8.601.1 (Definitions), and A8.601.17 (Applicability); and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Walton

Noes: 1 - Safai

Charter Amendment (Third Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED AS AMENDED to the July 22, 2024, Rules Committee Meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Walton

Noes: 1 - Safai

240544 [Charter Amendment - Police Staffing and Voluntary Deferred Retirement Option Program for the Police Department]

Sponsors: Dorsey; Peskin, Stefani, Melgar, Mandelman, Safai and Chan

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to define the term "Full-Duty Sworn Officer"; modify the criteria for establishing recommended staffing levels for sworn officers; change the requirement for the Chief of Police to submit a staffing report from every two years to every three years; and establish a new voluntary Deferred Retirement Option Program ("DROP") for the period from July 2025 - July 2030, for eligible members of the Police Department (in the rank of officer, sergeant, or inspector) that allows those members to earn additional deferred compensation in the Retirement System for up to 60 months in exchange for agreeing to perform neighborhood patrol or investigative work; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, Employees' Retirement System and the Police Dept pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/08/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Matt Dorsey (Board of Supervisors); Deputy Chief Walsh and Speaker (Police Department); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Richard Neil; spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; Leah McGeever; Jordan Davis; spoke in opposition of the matter. Supervisor Safai requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

07/08/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/11/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, Employees' Retirement System and the Police Dept pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Matt Dorsey (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Adam; spoke in support of the matter. H. Brown; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Charter Amendment be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Walton

Noes: 1 - Safai

240706 [Hearing - Initiative Ordinance - Park Code - Parkway at Upper Great Highway]**Sponsors: Engardio; Melgar, Preston, Mandelman and Dorsey**

Hearing to consider the proposed Initiative Ordinance submitted by four or more Supervisors to the voters for the November 5, 2024, Election, entitled "Ordinance amending the Park Code to establish new recreation and open space by restricting private vehicles at all times on the Upper Great Highway between Lincoln Way and Sloat Boulevard, subject to the City obtaining certain required approvals; making associated findings under the California Vehicle Code; and reaffirming the existing restriction of private vehicles on the Great Highway Extension."

06/18/24; RECEIVED.

06/18/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

06/24/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, and Ethics Commission pursuant to Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/01/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Youth Commission for review and report.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Joel Engardio (Board of Supervisors); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Lucas Lux; Speaker; spoke in support of the matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Walton, Safai

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:57 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.