



City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

Rules Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Ahsha Safai, Shamann Walton, Aaron Peskin

*Clerk: Victor Young
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

Monday, July 22, 2024

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Ahsha Safai, Shamann Walton, and Aaron Peskin

The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, July 22, 2024, with Chair Ahsha Safai presiding. Chair Safai called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Safai, Vice Chair Walton, and Member Peskin were noted present. A quorum of the Committee was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

240552 [Charter Amendment - Fire Department Service Retirement Pension]**Sponsors: Stefani; Melgar, Safai, Chan, Peskin, Engardio and Dorsey**

Charter Amendment (Third Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

05/21/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 6/20/2024.

05/28/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, SF Employees' Retirement System and the Fire Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/08/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Lorenzo Rosas (Office of Supervisor Catherine Stefani); Adam Woods (Fire Department); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Sam Geller (Local 798); Dan Casey; Mario Flaherty; Stan Lee (Asian Firefighter's Association); Steve Summers; Sina Riahi; Jeremiah Cadigan; Idel Wilson; Tim Finch; Floyd Rollins, President (Local 798); spoke in support of the matter. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the matter. Preston Gary; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

07/08/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/09/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, SF Employees' Retirement System and the Fire Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

07/15/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Janice Levy (Office of the Controller); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Chief Jeanine Nicholson (Fire Department); Alison Romano, Chief Executive (San Francisco Employees' Retirement System); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Secretary Adam Wood and President Floyd Rollins (Local 798); spoke in support of the matter. H. Brown; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

07/15/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

07/16/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, Ethics Commission, SF Employees' Retirement System and the Fire Dept. pursuant to BOS Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Floyd Rollins, President (Local 798); spoke in support of the matter. H. Brown; provided information on the matter.

Chair Safai moved that this Charter Amendment be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240692 [Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund]**Sponsors: Safai; Walton**

Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, an Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff's Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators.
(President Peskin dissented in Committee.)

06/13/24; RECEIVED.

06/18/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 7/18/2024.

06/24/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Planning Department for environmental determination; referred to Controller for fiscal analysis; and referred to Department of Human Resources for determination of meet and confer requirements. Referred to the Mayor's Office, Office of the City Attorney, Department of Elections, and Ethics Commission pursuant to Rules of Order 2.22.4.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Walton

Noes: 1 - Peskin

240761 [Appointment, Ballot Simplification Committee - Pamela Troy]

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending November 30, 2024, to the Ballot Simplification Committee. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Christine Unruh, resigned, must be nominated by the National Academy of Television Arts and Sciences, Northern California Chapter or the Northern California Broadcasters Association, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Pamela Troy; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Pamela Troy, seat 1, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion appointing Pamela Troy, term ending November 30, 2024, to the Ballot Simplification Committee. (Rules Committee)

Pamela Troy, seat 1, succeeding Christine Unruh, resigned, must be nominated by the National Academy of Television Arts and Sciences, Northern California Chapter or the Northern California Broadcasters Association, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 30, 2024.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240669 [Appointments, Reentry Council - Billey Hoang Le, Anthony Partee, Joanna Pulido, Lorenzo Juan Castaneda, and David Mauroff]

Hearing to consider appointing five members, terms ending June 1, 2026, to the Reentry Council.
(Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Jusef Nathan, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must self-identify as a survivor of violence or crime, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026.

Seat 2, succeeding Joanna Hernandez, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also have expertise in providing services to individuals exiting the criminal justice system, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026.

Seat 3, succeeding Linda Hurshman, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have been released from custody within three years of his/her appointment, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026.

Seat 4, succeeding Jabari Jackson, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have served multiple terms of incarceration, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026.

Seat 6, succeeding David Mauroff, term expired, must be a representative of the entity or agency primarily responsible for administering pretrial services involving alternatives to incarceration in San Francisco, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026.

06/09/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Tyler James Hart; Tabari Alonzo Morris; Anthony Partee; Billey Hoang Le; Lorenzo Juan Castaneda; Lucas Cruz; Michelle Marie Maxwell; Joanna Pulido; Emilio Bustamante; Jay Harrison Sutter; David Mauroff; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Billey Hoang Le, seat 1, recommended.

Anthony Partee, seat 2, recommended.

Joanna Pulido, seat 3, recommended.

Lorenzo Juan Castaneda, seat 4, recommended.

David Mauroff, seat 6, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion appointing Billey Hoang Le, Anthony Partee, Joanna Pulido, Lorenzo Juan Castaneda, and David Mauroff, terms ending June 1, 2026, to the Reentry Council. (Rules Committee)

Billey Hoang Le, seat 1, succeeding Jusef Nathan, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must self-identify as a survivor of violence or crime, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026;

Anthony Partee, seat 2, succeeding Joanna Hernandez, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also have expertise in providing services to individuals exiting the criminal justice system, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026;

Joanna Pulido, seat 3, succeeding Linda Hurshman, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have been released from custody within three years of his/her appointment, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026;

Lorenzo Juan Castaneda, seat 4, succeeding Jabari Jackson, term expired, must be a former inmate in the San Francisco County Jail, a California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation facility, and/or a United States Bureau of Prison facility; and also must have served multiple terms of incarceration, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026;

David Mauroff, seat 6, succeeding himself, term expired, must be a representative of the entity or agency primarily responsible for administering pretrial services involving alternatives to incarceration in San Francisco, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending June 1, 2026.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240585 [Mayoral Reappointment, Board of Appeals - Jose Lopez]

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayoral nomination for the reappointment of Jose Lopez to the Board of Appeals, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 4.106, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: May 28, 2024.)

06/04/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Jose Lopez; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Rick Swig; spoke in support of the appointment of Jose Lopez.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

Motion approving the Mayoral nomination for the reappointment of Jose Lopez to the Board of Appeals, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)
(Charter, Section 4.106, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: May 28, 2024.)

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240735 [Presidential Reappointment, Building Inspection Commission - Kavin Williams]

Motion approving/rejecting President Aaron Peskin's nomination for the reappointment of Kavin Williams to the Building Inspection Commission, for a two-year term ending July 1, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 4.121, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 25, 2024.)

Seat 7, succeeding Kavin Williams, nominated by the President of the Board of Supervisors and subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending July 1, 2026.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Kavin Williams; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the President of the of the Board of Supervisors' nomination for reappointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

Motion approving President Aaron Peskin's nomination for the reappointment of Kavin Williams to the Building Inspection Commission, for a two-year term ending July 1, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)
(Charter, Section 4.121, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 25, 2024.)

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240713 [Mayoral Appointment, Planning Commission - Sean McGarry]

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayoral nomination for the appointment of Sean McGarry to the Planning Commission, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)
(Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 21, 2024.)

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Sean McGarry; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Jay Anthony; Ethan Wesler; Joshua Arce; Pedro Mendez (Local 22); Speaker; spoke in support of the appointment of Sean McGarry.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

Motion approving the Mayoral nomination for the appointment of Sean McGarry to the Planning Commission, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)
(Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 21, 2024.)

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240712 [Mayoral Appointment, Planning Commission - Amy Campbell]

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayoral nomination for the appointment of Amy Campbell to the Planning Commission, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)
(Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 21, 2024.)

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Jesse Mainardi (Mayor's Office) read a statement on behalf of Amy Campbell and their qualifications.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

Motion approving the Mayoral nomination for the appointment of Amy Campbell to the Planning Commission, for a four-year term ending July 1, 2028. (Clerk of the Board)
(Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: June 21, 2024.)

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

240589 [Mayoral Appointment, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors - Mike Chen]

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Mike Chen to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a four-year term ending March 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: May 30, 2024.

06/04/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Mike Chen; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Bob Axlefender; Dillon Favors; Somar Ricken; spoke in support of the appointment of Mike Chen.

Chair Safai moved that this Motion be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Walton, Peskin

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:57 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.