



City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Agenda

Government Audit and Oversight Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Dean Preston, Catherine Stefani, Connie Chan

Clerk: Monique Crayton
(415) 554-7750 ~ monique.crayton@sfgov.org

Thursday, November 21, 2024

10:00 AM

Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

COMMUNICATIONS

AGENDA CHANGES

LITIGATION

Conference with City Attorney

*[Convene in Closed Session - Existing Litigation - City as Plaintiff and/or Defendant]
Motion that the Government Audit and Oversight Committee of the Board of Supervisors convene in closed session with the City Attorney for the purpose of conferring with, or receiving advice from, the City Attorney regarding the following existing litigation and anticipated litigation. Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) permit this closed session. Discussion in open session concerning these matters would likely and unavoidably prejudice the position of the City in the pending lawsuits and claims listed below.*

1. [241013](#) **[Settlement of Unlitigated Claims - Chevron U.S.A. Holdings Inc. and Chevron U.S.A. Inc. - Kern County Property]**

Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claims between the City and County of San Francisco, and Chevron U.S.A. Holdings Inc. and Chevron U.S.A. Inc., including the conveyance of real property owned by the City in Kern County, California; the claims involve the condition of and liability for the property; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; finding that the disposition of property is consistent with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and authorizing the Director of Property or their designee to make certain modifications to the settlement and conveyance documents, and take certain actions in furtherance of this Resolution. (City Attorney)

10/7/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/15/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
2. [240952](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Scott Edwards - \$650,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Scott Edwards against the City and County of San Francisco for \$650,000; the lawsuit was filed on October 17, 2023, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-23-609826; entitled Scott Edwards v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit involves an employment dispute. (City Attorney)

9/30/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/8/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
3. [240953](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Annamarie Faro and Howard Kevin White - \$195,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Annamarie Faro and Howard Kevin White against the City and County of San Francisco for \$195,000; the lawsuit was filed on November 9, 2023, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-23-610311; entitled Annamarie Faro, et al. v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit alleged property damage arising from flooding. (City Attorney)

9/30/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/8/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

4. [240959](#) **[Settlement of Unlitigated Claim - 24th and Mission Partners - \$90,201]**
Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claim filed by 24th and Mission Partners against the City and County of San Francisco for \$90,201; the claim was filed on May 7, 2024; the claim involves property damage arising from flooding alleged to be caused by a sewer main obstruction. (City Attorney)

9/30/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/8/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
5. [240960](#) **[Settlement of Unlitigated Claim - Awad Faddoul - \$108,681.38]**
Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claim filed by Awad Faddoul against the City and County of San Francisco for \$108,681.38; the claim was filed on May 7, 2024; the claim involves property damage arising from flooding alleged to be caused by a sewer main obstruction. (City Attorney)

9/30/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/8/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
6. [240961](#) **[Settlement of Unlitigated Claim - Pacific Gas and Electric Company - \$250,000]**
Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claim filed by Pacific Gas and Electric Company against the City and County of San Francisco for \$250,000; the claim was filed on January 11, 2024; the claim involves property damage arising from flooding alleged to be caused by a water main rupture. (City Attorney)

9/30/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/8/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
7. [240962](#) **[Settlement of Unlitigated Claim - 150 Post Street LLC - \$272,566.05]**
Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claim filed by 150 Post Street LLC against the City and County of San Francisco for \$272,566.05; the claim was filed on March 21, 2024; the claim involves property damage arising from flooding alleged to be caused by a water main rupture. (City Attorney)

9/30/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/8/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
8. [241014](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Rick Lam - \$350,000]**
Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Rick Lam against the City and County of San Francisco for \$350,000; the lawsuit was filed on December 27, 2021, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-21-597312; entitled Rick Lam v. City and County of San Francisco et al.; the lawsuit involves an employment dispute. (City Attorney)

10/11/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/22/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

9. [241015](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Maria Elena Rosales - \$95,000]**
Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Maria Elena Rosales against the City and County of San Francisco for \$95,000; the lawsuit was filed on August 17, 2022, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-22-601310; entitled Maria Elena Rosales v. City and County of San Francisco; the lawsuit involves alleged personal injury on a City street. (City Attorney)

10/11/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/22/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
10. [241016](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Steven Benvenuto - \$70,000]**
Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Steven Benvenuto against the City and County of San Francisco for \$70,000; the lawsuit was filed on February 15, 2023, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-23-604629; entitled Steven Benvenuto v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit involves alleged property damage and personal injury arising from a vehicle collision. (City Attorney)

10/11/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/22/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
11. [241017](#) **[Settlement of Unlitigated Claims - Constellation New Energy - Gas Division, LLC - \$51,902.60; Energy Center San Francisco, LLC - \$566,384.44]**
Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claims filed by Constellation New Energy - Gas Division, LLC and Energy Center San Francisco, LLC against the City and County of San Francisco for \$51,902.60 and \$566,384.44, respectively; the claims were respectively filed on April 29, 2024, and April 30, 2024; the claims involve a refund of utility user taxes. (City Attorney)

10/11/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

10/22/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.
12. [241053](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Paul Wildes and Reed Sandberg]**
Ordinance authorizing settlement of a lawsuit filed by Paul Wildes and Reed Sandberg against London Breed, José Cisneros, and Carmen Chu, each sued in their official capacities as employees of the City and County of San Francisco; the lawsuit was filed on January 29, 2024, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-24-611915; entitled Michael Phillips, et al., v. London Breed, et al.; the lawsuit involves alleged violations of California Constitution, article I, Section 7 - Transgender Status Discrimination; California Constitution, article I, Section 7 - Sex Discrimination; California Constitution, article I, Section 7 - Race/Ethnicity Discrimination; the proposed terms of settlement are a payment of \$3,250 in attorney's fees and costs and injunctive relief. (City Attorney)

10/21/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

11/5/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

13. [241054](#) **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Michael J. Turon - 2722–2724 Folsom Street]**
Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Michael J. Turon against the City and County of San Francisco; the lawsuit was filed on October 1, 2021, in the United States District Court, Northern District of California, Case No. 21-cv-07724; entitled Michael J. Turon v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit involves challenges to suspension of certain building permits for the property at 2722-2724 Folsom Street; material terms of the settlement are plaintiff agrees to seek conditional use authorization to remove an unauthorized dwelling unit through merger and agrees to construct a detached accessory dwelling unit in an existing rear-yard structure at the property, construction of which will be secured by a stipulated injunction requiring plaintiff to pay liquidated damages to the City if the accessory dwelling unit is not completed, and in exchange the City will lift the suspension on the subject permits, issue the pending permit to complete work at the property, and close its pending enforcement actions. (City Attorney)

10/28/24; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

11/5/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

After a closed session, if one occurs, the Committee shall adopt a motion either to disclose or not to disclose.

[Elect To Disclose]

Motion that the Board finds it is in the public interest to disclose information discussed in closed session, and directs the Chair immediately to disclose that information.

[Elect Not To Disclose]

Motion that the Committee finds that it is in the best interest of the public that the Committee elect at this time not to disclose its closed session deliberations listed above.

ADJOURNMENT

LEGISLATION UNDER THE 30-DAY RULE

NOTE: The following legislation will not be considered at this meeting. Board Rule 3.22 provides that when an Ordinance or Resolution is introduced which would CREATE OR REVISE MAJOR CITY POLICY, the Committee to which the legislation is assigned shall not consider the legislation until at least thirty days after the date of introduction. The provisions of this rule shall not apply to the routine operations of the departments of the City or when a legal time limit controls the hearing timing. In general, the rule shall not apply to hearings to consider subject matter when no legislation has been presented, nor shall the rule apply to resolutions which simply URGE action to be taken.

(There is no legislation pending under the 30-Day Rule.)

The Levine Act

Pursuant to California Government Code, Section 84308, Members of the Board who have received campaign contributions totaling more than \$250 may be required to disclose that fact on the record of the proceeding. Parties and their paid agents may also be required to disclose on the record any campaign contributions made to a Member of the Board that meets the following qualifications for disclosure. A Member of the Board of Supervisors is disqualified and must recuse themselves on any agenda item involving business, professional, trade, and land use licenses or permits and all other entitlements for use, if they received more than \$250 in campaign contributions from the applicant or contractor, an agent of the applicant or contractor, or any financially interested participant within the 12 months prior to the final decision; and for 12 months following the date of the final decision, a Member of the Board shall not accept, solicit, or direct a campaign contribution of \$250 or more from the applicant or contractor, an agent of the applicant or contractor, or any financially interested participant. The foregoing statements do not constitute legal advice. Parties, participants, and their agents are urged to consult their own legal counsel regarding the requirements of the law. For more information about these disclosures, visit www.sfethics.org.

Agenda Item Information

Each item on the Consent or Regular agenda may include the following 1) Legislation; 2) Budget and Legislative Analyst report; 3) Department or Agency cover letter and/or report; 4) Public correspondence. These items are available for review at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 or at www.sfbos.org/legislative-research-center-lrc.

Meeting Procedures

The Board of Supervisors is the legislative body of the City and County of San Francisco. The Board has several standing committees where legislation is the subject of hearings at which members of the public are urged to testify. The full Board does not hold a second public hearing on measures which have been heard in committee.

Board procedures do not permit: 1) vocal or audible support or opposition to statements by Supervisors or by other persons testifying; 2) ringing and use of cell phones or electronic devices; 3) bringing in or displaying signs in the meeting room; or 4) standing in the meeting room. Each member of the public will be allotted the same maximum number of minutes to speak as set by the President or Chair at the beginning of each item or public comment, excluding City representatives; except that public speakers using interpretation assistance will be allowed to testify for twice the amount of time. Members of the public who want to display a document should place it on the overhead during their public comment and remove the document when they want the screen to return to live coverage of the meeting.

IMPORTANT INFORMATION: The public is encouraged to testify at Board and Committee meetings. Persons unable to attend the meeting may submit to the City, by the time the proceedings begin, written comments regarding agenda items for the official public record. Written communications should be submitted to the Clerk of the Board or the Clerk of the Committee: 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102. Communications not received prior to the hearing may be delivered to the Clerk of the Board or the Clerk of the Committee and will be shared with the Members.

COPYRIGHT: All system content that is broadcasted live during public proceedings is secured by High-bandwidth Digital Content Protection (HDCP), which prevents copyrighted or encrypted content from being displayed or transmitted through unauthorized devices. Members of the public who wish to utilize chamber digital, audio and visual technology may not display copyrighted or encrypted content during public proceedings.

LANGUAGE INTERPRETERS: Language services are available in Spanish, Chinese and Filipino for requests made at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting, to help ensure availability. For more information or to request services, contact bos@sfgov.org or call (415) 554-5184.

傳譯服務：所有常規及特別市參事會會議和常務委員會會議將提供西班牙文，中文以及菲律賓文的傳譯服務，但必須在會議前最少兩（2）個工作日作出請求，以確保能獲取到傳譯服務。將因應請求提供交替傳譯服務，以便公眾向有關政府機構發表意見。如需更多資訊或請求有關服務，請發電郵至 bos@sfgov.org 或致電（415）554-5184 聯絡我們。

INTÉRPRETES DE IDIOMAS: Para asegurar la disponibilidad de los servicios de interpretación en chino, filipino y español, presente su petición por lo menos con dos (2) días hábiles de antelación previo a la reunión. Para más información o para solicitar los servicios, envíe su mensaje a bos@sfgov.org o llame al (415) 554-5184.

TAGA SALIN-WIKA: Ipaabot sa amin ang mga kahilingan sa pag salin-wika sa Kastila, Tsino at Pilipino ng hindi bababa sa dalawang araw bago ang pulong. Makakatulong ito upang tiyakin na ang mga serbisyo ay nakalaan at nakahanda. Para sa dagdag kaalaman o para humiling ng serbisyo, maki pagugnayan po sa bos@sfgov.org o tumawag sa (415) 554-5184.

Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and Reasonable Accommodations

Title II of the ADA requires that all programs offered through the state and local government such as the City and County of San Francisco be accessible and usable to people with disabilities. The ADA and City policy require that people with disabilities have equal access to all City services, activities, and benefits. If you believe your rights under the ADA are violated, contact the ADA Coordinator. Ordinance No. 90-10 added Section 2A.22.3 to the Administrative Code, which adopted a Citywide Americans with Disabilities Act Reasonable Modification Policy.

Meetings are real-time captioned and cablecast open-captioned on SFGovTV (www.sfgovtv.org) or Cable Channels 26, 28, 78 or 99 (depending on your provider). Board and Committee meeting agendas and minutes are available on the Board's website www.sfbos.org and adhere to web development Federal Access Board's Section 508 Guidelines. For reasonable accommodations, please contact (415) 554-5184 or (415) 554-5227 (TTY). Board of Supervisors' Rules of Order 1.3.3 does not permit remote public comment by members of the public at meetings of the Board and its committees, except as legally required to enable people with disabilities to participate in such meetings. If you require remote access as a means of reasonable accommodation under ADA, please contact the Clerk's Office to request remote access, including a description of the functional limitation(s) that precludes your ability to attend in person. Requests made at least two (2) business days in advance of the meeting will help to ensure availability. For further assistance, please call (415) 554-5184.

Know Your Rights Under The Sunshine Ordinance

Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (San Francisco Administrative Code, Chapter 67) or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact by mail Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102; phone at (415) 554-7724; fax at (415) 554-5163; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org. Citizens may obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance by printing the San Francisco Administrative Code, Chapter 67, on the Internet at www.sfbos.org/sunshine.

Ethics Requirements

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (Campaign & Governmental Conduct Code, Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102; (415) 252-3100; fax (415) 252-3112; website www.sfgov.org/ethics.

Under Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code, Section 1.127, no person or entity with a financial interest in a land use matter pending before the Board of Appeals, Board of Supervisors, Building Inspection Commission, Commission on Community Investment and Infrastructure, Historic Preservation Commission, Planning Commission, Port Commission, or the Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors, may make a campaign contribution to a member of the Board of Supervisors, the Mayor, the City Attorney, or a candidate for any of those offices, from the date the land use matter commenced until 12 months after the board or commission has made a final decision, or any appeal to another City agency from that decision has been resolved. For more information about this restriction, visit www.sfethics.org.