



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Rules Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Katy Tang, Eric Mar, Malia Cohen*

*Clerk: Derek Evans (415) 554-7702*

---

Thursday, September 8, 2016

11:00 AM

City Hall, Committee Room 263

---

**Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Katy Tang, Eric Mar, and Malia Cohen

*The Rules Committee met in regular session on Thursday, September 8, 2016, with Chair Katy Tang presiding.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*Chair Tang called the meeting to order at 11:17 a.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Tang and Member Cohen were noted present. Vice Chair Mar was noted not present. There was a quorum.*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

### **Supervisor Katy Tang Excused from Voting**

**Vice Chair Mar, seconded by Member Cohen, moved to excuse Chair Tang from voting on File No. 160917. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Mar, Cohen

Excused: 1 - Tang

### **160917 [Appointment, Children and Families First Commission - Supervisor Katy Tang]**

Motion appointing Supervisor Katy Tang, for an indefinite term, to the Children and Families First Commission. (Rules Committee)

08/19/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.*

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED... The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Mar, Cohen

Excused: 1 - Tang

**160927 [Appointment, Reentry Council - Supervisor John Avalos]**

Motion appointing Supervisor John Avalos, term ending June 7, 2018, to the Reentry Council. (Rules Committee)

08/19/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.*

**Member Cohen moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED... The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Tang, Cohen

Absent: 1 - Mar

*Vice Chair Mar was noted present at 11:30 a.m.*

*Chair Tang requested that File Nos. 160910, 160911, and 160912 be called and heard together.*

**160910 [Confirming Reappointment, Public Utilities Commission - Francesca Vietor]**

**Sponsor: Mayor**

Motion confirming the mayoral reappointment of Francesca Vietor, to the Public Utilities Commission, Seat No. 1, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending August 1, 2020.

(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors. Transmittal date: August 8, 2016.)

08/08/16; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

08/09/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Commissioner Francesca Vietor (Public Utilities Commission); spoke on their qualifications. Harlan Kelly, General Manager (Public Utilities Commission); Michael Theriault (San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council); Shamann Walton, Executive Director (Young Community Developers); Joshua Arce; Emilio Cruz; Eddie Ahn, Executive Director (Brightline Defense Project); spoke in support of Francesca Vietor.*

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen

**160911 [Confirming Reappointment, Public Utilities Commission - Ann Moller Caen]**

**Sponsor: Mayor**

Motion confirming the mayoral reappointment of Ann Moller Caen, to the Public Utilities Commission, Seat No. 3, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending August 1, 2020.

(Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors. Transmittal date: August 8, 2016.)

08/08/16; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

08/09/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Commissioner Ann Moller Caen (Public Utilities Commission); spoke on their qualifications. Harlan Kelly, General Manager (Public Utilities Commission); Michael Theriault (San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council); Shamann Walton, Executive Director (Young Community Developers); Joshua Arce; Emilio Cruz; spoke in support of Ann Moller Caen.*

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen

**160912 [Confirming Reappointment, Public Utilities Commission - Vince Courtney, Jr.]****Sponsor: Mayor**

Motion confirming the mayoral reappointment of Vince Courtney, Jr., to the Public Utilities Commission, Seat No. 5, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending August 1, 2020. (Charter, Section 4.112, provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors. Transmittal date: August 8, 2016.)

08/08/16; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

08/09/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Commissioner Vince Courtney Jr. (Public Utilities Commission); spoke on their qualifications. Harlan Kelly, General Manager (Public Utilities Commission); David J. Canepa, Vice Mayor of Daly City; Tom Harrison; Tim Paulson, Executive Director (San Francisco Labor Council); Larry Mazzola Jr.; Michael Theriault (San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council); Eddie McCaffrey (Assessor-Recorder's Office); Robert Watkins (Recreation and Park Department); Theresa Foglio (Laborers Local 261); Bruce Agid; Shamann Walton, Executive Director (Young Community Developers); Donna Kotake; Hala Hijazi; Joshua Arce; DeShelia Mixon (Laborers Local 261); Emilio Cruz; Kevin Hughes (IBEW Local 6); Margot Reed; Jackie Flin (A. Philip Randolph Institute); Eddie Ahn, Executive Director (Brightline Defense Project); Elouise Patton; Jackie Omotalade; Javier Flores; Victor Parra; Edgar Wilson; spoke in support of Vince Courtney.*

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen

**160913 [Confirming Appointment, Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors - Sam Moss]****Sponsor: Mayor**

Motion approving the mayoral appointment of Sam Moss to the Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending April 28, 2018. (Appointments of Directors who are not City officers are effective only upon approval by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. Transmittal date: August 10, 2016.)

08/10/16; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

08/11/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Sam Moss; spoke on their qualifications. Eddie Ahn, Executive Director (Brightline Defense Project); Erick Arguello (Calle 24 Latino Cultural District); Myrna Melgar; Barbara Lopez, Legislative Aide (Office of Supervisor Jane Kim); Peter Cohen; Scott Malcon; Marie Sorensen; Oscar Grande; spoke in support of Sam Moss.*

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen

**160952 [Confirming Appointment, Planning Commission - Myrna Melgar]**

Motion approving/rejecting President of the Board of Supervisors London Breed's nomination of Myrna Melgar to the Planning Commission, for the unexpired portion of a term ending July 1, 2020. (Rules Committee)

(Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: August 31, 2016.)

09/02/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Myrna Melgar; spoke on their qualifications. Marie Sorensen; Oscar Grande, Laura Melgarejo, Amy Aguilera, and Miriam Duran (People Organizing to Demand Environmental and Economic Rights - PODER); Erick Arguello, and Moises Garcia (Calle 24 Latino Cultural District); Eddie Ahn (Brightline Defense Project); Peter Cohen; Charlie Sciammas, and Teresa Almaguer (PODER); April Veneracion Ang, Legislative Aide (Office of Supervisor Jane Kim); Leticia Alcantar; spoke in support of Myrna Melgar.*

*Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT to the September 13, 2016, Board of Supervisors meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen*

*Vice Chair Mar moved that the previous vote be RESCINDED. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen*

**Vice Chair Mar, seconded by Member Cohen, moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to confirm the appointment. The motion carried by the following vote:**

*Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen*

Motion approving President of the Board of Supervisors London Breed's nomination of Myrna Melgar to the Planning Commission, for the unexpired portion of a term ending July 1, 2020. (Rules Committee)

(Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: August 31, 2016.)

**Vice Chair Mar, seconded by Member Cohen, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT to the September 13, 2016, Board of Supervisors meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

*Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen*

**160953 [Confirming Appointment, Planning Commission - Joel Koppel]**

Motion approving/rejecting the mayoral nomination of Joel Koppel to the Planning Commission, for the unexpired portion of a term ending July 1, 2020. (Rules Committee) (Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: September 2, 2016.)

09/02/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Joel Koppel; spoke on their qualifications. Tim Paulson, Executive Director (San Francisco Labor Council); Michael Theriault (San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council); Kevin Hughes (IBEW Local 6); Sabrina Hernandez (International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers Local 6); Vince Courtney; Ken Cleveland; Eddie Ahn, Executive Director (Brightline Defense Project); Larry Mazzola Jr.; Javier Flores; Dennis Richards; spoke in support of Joel Koppel.*

*Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT to the September 13, 2016, Board of Supervisors meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen*

*Vice Chair Mar moved that the previous vote be RESCINDED. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen*

**Vice Chair Mar, seconded by Member Cohen, moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to confirm the appointment. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen**

Motion approving the mayoral nomination of Joel Koppel to the Planning Commission, for the unexpired portion of a term ending July 1, 2020. (Rules Committee) (Charter, Section 4.105, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: September 2, 2016.)

**Vice Chair Mar, seconded by Member Cohen, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT to the September 13, 2016, Board of Supervisors meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen**

**160915 [Appointments, Child Care Planning and Advisory Council - Beverly Melugin and Graham Dobson]**

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending March 19, 2019, and one member, term ending March 19, 2018, to the Child Care Planning and Advisory Council. (Rules Committee)  
Vacant seat 6, succeeding Deepa Mehta, term expired, must be a nominee of the District 6 Supervisor and represent one of the following categories: consumers, child care providers, discretionary, community representatives, or public agency representatives, for a three-year term ending March 19, 2019.

Vacant seat 12, succeeding Michelle Rutherford, term expired, must be a nominee of the President of the Board of Supervisors and represent one of the following categories: consumers, child care providers, discretionary, community representatives, or public agency representatives, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending March 19, 2018.

08/19/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Beverly Melugin and Graham Dobson; spoke on their qualifications. Barbara Lopez, Legislative Aide (Office of Supervisor Jane Kim); spoke in support of Beverly Melugin.*

*Appointment of Beverly Melugin (residency requirement waived), seat 6, recommended.*

*Appointment of Graham Dobson, seat 12, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Beverly Melugin (residency requirement waived), term ending March 19, 2019, and Graham Dobson, term ending March 19, 2018, to the Child Care Planning and Advisory Council. (Rules Committee)

Beverly Melugin (residency requirement waived), seat 6, succeeding Deepa Mehta, term expired, must be a nominee of the District 6 Supervisor and represent one of the following categories: consumers, child care providers, discretionary, community representatives, or public agency representatives, for a three-year term ending March 19, 2019.

Graham Dobson, seat 12, succeeding Michelle Rutherford, term expired, must be a nominee of the President of the Board of Supervisors and represent one of the following categories: consumers, child care providers, discretionary, community representatives, or public agency representatives, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending March 19, 2018.

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen

**160916 [Appointments, Municipal Fines and Fees Task Force - Dion Libutti, Scott Nelson, Elisa Della-Piana, and Kendra Amick]**

Hearing to consider appointing four members, terms ending June 26, 2018, to the Municipal Fines and Fees Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Vacant seat 8, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

Vacant seat 9, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

Vacant seat 10, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

Vacant seat 11, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

08/19/16; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dion Libutti; Scott Nelson; spoke on their qualifications. Nicholas Kimura; spoke in support of all the applicants and further withdrew their application. Jeremy Pollock, Legislative Aide (Office of Supervisor John Avalos); spoke in support of all the applicants. Christina; spoke in support of Elisa Della-Piana.*

*Appointment of Dion Libutti, seat 8, recommended.*

*Appointment of Scott Nelson, seat 9, recommended.*

*Appointment of Elisa Della-Piana(residency requirement waived), seat 10, recommended.*

*Appointment of Kendra Amick, seat 11, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Dion Libutti, Scott Nelson, Elisa Della-Piana (residency requirement waived), and Kendra Amick, terms ending June 26, 2018, to the Municipal Fines and Fees Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Dion Libutti, seat 8, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

Scott Nelson, seat 9, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

Elisa Della-Piana (residency requirement waived), seat 10, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

Kendra Amick, seat 11, new appointment, must be held by a person with lived experience as, or experience providing services or assistance to, low-income people regarding court-ordered debt, suspended driver's licenses, or payment of municipal fines or fees, for a two-year term ending on June 26, 2018.

**Member Cohen, seconded by Vice Chair Mar, moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT to the September 13, 2016, Board of Supervisors meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Tang, Mar, Cohen

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 2:03 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*