

City and County of San Francisco Meeting Minutes

City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Government Audit and Oversight Committee

Members: Jane Kim, Aaron Peskin, London Breed

Clerk: John Carroll (415) 554-4445

Wednesday, April 4, 2018

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Jane Kim, Aaron Peskin, and London Breed

The Government Audit and Oversight Committee met in regular session on April 4, 2018, with Chair Jane Kim presiding.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Kim called the meeting to order at 10:06 a.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Kim, Vice Chair Peskin, and Member Breed were noted present. There was a quorum.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

171316 [Reward - Property Tax Underpayment Information - Natasha Khoruzhenko - \$7,095.42]

Sponsor: Peskin

Ordinance approving Assessor's recommended reward of \$7,095.42 to Natasha Khoruzhenko for information that led to detection of underpayment of property tax from an unreported change in ownership.

12/12/17; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 1/11/2018.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.

Vice Chair Peskin, seconded by Member Breed, moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Chair Kim requested that File Nos. 180247, 180242, and 180245 be heard together.

180247 [Castro/Upper Market Community Benefit District - Annual Report - FY2016-2017] Sponsor: Sheehy

Resolution receiving and approving an annual report for the Castro/Upper Market Community Benefit District for FY2016-2017, submitted as required by the Property and Business Improvement District Law of 1994 (California Streets and Highways Code, Sections 36600, et seq.), Section 36650, and the District's management agreement with the City, Section 3.4.

03/13/18; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

03/20/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller and the Office of Economic and Workforce Development for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Chris Corgas (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Andrea Aiello, Executive Director (Castro/Upper Market Community Benefit District); Cathy Maupin, Executive Director (Yerba Buena Community Benefit District); Helen Mar (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Karin Flood, Executive Director (Union Square Business Improvement District); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. John Nulty; Ken; Michael Nulty; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180242 [Yerba Buena Community Benefit District - Annual Report - FY2016-2017] Sponsor: Kim

Resolution receiving and approving an annual report for the Yerba Buena Community Benefit District for FY2016-2017, submitted as required by the Property and Business Improvement District Law of 1994 (California Streets and Highways Code, Sections 36600, et seq.), Section 36650, and the District's management agreement with the City, Section 3.4.

03/13/18; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

03/20/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller and the Office of Economic and Workforce Development for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Chris Corgas (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Andrea Aiello, Executive Director (Castro/Upper Market Community Benefit District); Cathy Maupin, Executive Director (Yerba Buena Community Benefit District); Helen Mar (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Karin Flood, Executive Director (Union Square Business Improvement District); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. John Nulty; Ken; Michael Nulty; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180245 [Greater Union Square Business Improvement District - Annual Report - FY2016-2017]

Sponsor: Peskin

Resolution receiving and approving an annual report for the Greater Union Square Business Improvement District for FY2016-2017, submitted as required by the Property and Business Improvement District Law of 1994 (California Streets and Highways Code, Sections 36600, et seq.), Section 36650, and the District's management agreement with the City, Section 3.4

03/13/18; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

03/20/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller and the Office of Economic and Workforce Development for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Chris Corgas (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Andrea Aiello, Executive Director (Castro/Upper Market Community Benefit District); Cathy Maupin, Executive Director (Yerba Buena Community Benefit District); Helen Mar (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Karin Flood, Executive Director (Union Square Business Improvement District); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. John Nulty; Ken; Michael Nulty; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Chair Kim requested that File Nos. 180033 through 180052 be heard together.

180033 [Memorandum of Understanding - Service Employees International Union, Local 1021]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Service Employees International Union, Local 1021, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180034 [Memorandum of Understanding - San Francisco District Attorney Investigators' Association]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the San Francisco District Attorney Investigators' Association, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180035 [Memorandum of Understanding - Service Employees International Union, Local 1021: Staff & Per Diem Nurses]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2016-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Service Employees International Union, Local 1021: Staff & Per Diem Nurses, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180036 [Memorandum of Understanding - Teamsters, Local 856, Multi-Unit] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Teamsters, Local 856, Multi-Unit, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180037 [Memorandum of Understanding - Transport Workers Union, Local 200] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Transport Workers Union, AFL-CIO, Local 200, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180038 [Memorandum of Understanding - Committee of Interns and Residents, Service Employees International Union]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2017-2021 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Committee of Interns and Residents, Service Employees International Union, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180039 [Memorandum of Understanding - Union of American Physicians and Dentists (Unit 18)]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2015-2018 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Union of American Physicians and Dentists (Unit 18), to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180040 [Memorandum of Understanding - Union of American Physicians and Dentists (Unit 17)]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2015-2018 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Union of American Physicians and Dentists (Unit 17), to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180041 [Memorandum of Understanding - San Francisco City Workers United (Painters)] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the San Francisco City Workers United (Painters), to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180042 [Memorandum of Understanding - International Union of Operating Engineers Stationary Engineers, Local 39]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the International Union of Operating Engineers Stationary Engineers, Local 39, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180043 [Memorandum of Understanding - Municipal Executives Association] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Municipal Executives Association, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180044 [Memorandum of Understanding - Operating Engineers, Local Union 3 - International Union of Operating Engineers]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Operating Engineers, Local Union 3, of the International Union of Operating Engineers, AFL-CIO, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180045 [Memorandum of Understanding - Machinists Union, Local 1414] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 2 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Machinists Union, Local 1414, International Association of Machinists & Aerospace Workers Machinists Automotive Trades District Lodge 190, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180046 [Memorandum of Understanding - Municipal Attorneys Association] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 2 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Municipal Attorneys Association, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180047 [Memorandum of Understanding - Laborers International Union, Local 261] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Laborers International Union, Local 261, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180048 [Memorandum of Understanding - United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices of the Plumbing and Pipe Fitting Industry, Local No. 38] Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices of the Plumbing and Pipe Fitting Industry, Local No. 38, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180049 [Memorandum of Understanding - International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 2 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21, AFL-CIO, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aves: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180050 [Memorandum of Understanding - Teamsters, Local 856: Supervising Registered Nurses]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2016-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the Teamsters, Local 856: Supervising Registered Nurses, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

180051 [Memorandum of Understanding - International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 6]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 6, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

180052 [Memorandum of Understanding - San Francisco Building Inspectors' Association]

Sponsor: Mayor

Ordinance adopting and implementing Amendment No. 1 to the 2014-2019 Memorandum of Understanding between the City and County of San Francisco and the San Francisco Building Inspectors' Association, to implement a "Union Access to New Employees" program.

01/09/18; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Government Audit and Oversight Committee, expires on 2/8/2018.

01/17/18; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for cost analysis.

03/07/18; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received cost analysis from the Office of the Controller pursuant to Ordinance No. 92-94.

Heard in Committee. Speaker: Carol Isen (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Peskin moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Kim, Peskin, Breed

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Government Audit and Oversight Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:07 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.