



City and County of San Francisco
Meeting Minutes
Government Audit and Oversight Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Dean Preston, Connie Chan, Rafael Mandelman

Clerk: Alisa Somera (415) 554-4447

Thursday, September 29, 2022

10:00 AM

Special Meeting

IN-PERSON MEETING
City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

(remote access provided)

(remote public comment provided via teleconference)

President Shamann Walton appointed himself, in place of Supervisor Rafael Mandelman, to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee for File Nos. 220720 and 220721 at the special meeting of September 29, 2022.

Present: 3 - Dean Preston, Connie Chan, and Shamann Walton

Excused: 1 - Rafael Mandelman

The Government Audit and Oversight Committee met in special session, in-person with remote access and public comment via telephone on Thursday, September 29, 2022, with Chair Dean Preston presiding. Chair Preston called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

Remote Access to Information and Participation

The Board of Supervisors and its committees will convene hybrid meetings that will allow in-person attendance, remote access, and public comment via teleconference. Visit the SFGovTV website at (www.sfgovtv.org) to stream the live meetings and watch meetings on demand or watch live meetings on San Francisco Cable Channels 26, 28, 78 or 99 (depending on your provider). Members of the public may provide public comment in-person at the above noticed location or remotely via teleconference (detailed instructions available at: <https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>). Individuals who wish to share documents during a hearing must provide them to the Clerk 48 hours in advance (alisa.somera@sfgov.org); equipment is not available to share hard copy documents received in-person.

Members of the public attending in-person may be required to wear masks or adhere to current orders, please visit https://sfbos.org/in_person_meeting_guidelines for the current guidelines.

Members of the public may also submit their comments by email to: alisa.somera@sfgov.org; all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Regularly scheduled Government Audit and Oversight Meetings begin at 10:00 a.m. every first and third Thursday of each month. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at <https://sfbos.org/committees>.

Please visit the Board's website (www.sfbos.org) regularly to be updated on the current situation as it affects the legislative process. For more information contact the Clerk, Alisa Somera, at (415) 554-7711 or alisa.somera@sfgov.org.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Preston, Vice Chair Chan, and Member Walton were noted present.

Supervisor Mandelman was noted not present. A quorum was present.

Supervisor Rafael Mandelman Excused from Attendance

Chair Preston moved that Member Mandelman be excused from the Government Audit and Oversight Committee special meeting of September 29, 2022. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Walton

Excused: 1 - Mandelman

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

COMMUNICATIONS

*Stephanie Cabrera, Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments for up to two minutes in-person or by dialing the provided telephone number. In-person public comment will be taken before remote public comment is called. Those who are providing public comment remotely must dial * 3 to be added to the remote queue to speak. Written comments may be submitted through email Stephanie.Cabrera@sfgov.org or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

REGULAR AGENDA

Chair Preston requested File Nos. 220720 and 220721 be called together.

220720 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - “Buried Problems and a Buried Process - The Hunters Point Naval Shipyard in a Time of Climate Change.”]

Sponsors: Walton; Chan

Hearing on the report released on June 1, 2022, by the Civil Grand Jury titled, “Buried Problems and a Buried Process - The Hunters Point Naval Shipyard in a Time of Climate Change,” for departments to review and report back to the Board of Supervisors on what each agency’s response to the recommendations are; and requesting San Francisco Public Utilities Commission, Department of Public Health, Environmental Protection Agency, Navy, and other related agencies to report.

06/07/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

09/15/22; CONTINUED. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Jeff Weitzel (Civil Grand Jury); Dr. Susan Philip (Department of Public Health); Thor Kaslofsky, Executive Director (Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure); Sara Miles (Civil Grand Jury); Patrick Fosdahl (Department of Public Health); Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); Tom Paulino (Mayor’s Office); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Nate Smart; Arianne Harrison; Dr. Ahmisa Porter Sumchai; Chala Kumpari; Tony Parker; Julia Dowell; Alma Tse-Beck; Speaker; Bradley Angel; Dr. Marce Aidelman; Terri; Jasmine; Tonya Randell; Ford Warner; Francisco Da Costa; Dr. Udvino; Dennis Williams; Laura Feinstein; Camilla Elan; Daniel Hirsch; Regina Jenkins; Eric Brooks; Sara Greenwald; Naya Lazar; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Angeles Herrera (Environmental Protection Agency); Nelline Kowbel (Department of Toxic Substance Control); Tom Paulino (Mayor’s Office); Thor Kaslofsky, Executive Director (Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Arianne Harrison; Dr. Ahmisa Porter Sumchai; Charlita Holmes-Fox; Speaker; Yolanda Cartsanto; Tonya Randell; Speaker; Speaker; Ashi Dane; Gerald Gubadi; Erick Brooks; Speaker; Steve Zeltser; Dr. Robert Gould; Dan Hersch; Elliot Helman; Rene Jenkins; Michael Vine; Patrice Sutton; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Preston moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee meeting on October 6, 2022. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Chan

Excused: 1 - Mandelman

Absent: 1 - Walton

220721 [Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Buried Problems and a Buried Process: The Hunters Point Naval Shipyard in a Time of Climate Change]**Sponsor: Walton**

Resolution responding to the Presiding Judge of the Superior Court on the findings and recommendations contained in the 2021-2022 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Buried Problems and a Buried Process: The Hunters Point Naval Shipyard in a Time of Climate Change;" and urging the Mayor to cause the implementation of accepted findings and recommendations through her department heads and through the development of the annual budget. (Clerk of the Board)

07/12/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

09/15/22; CONTINUED.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Angeles Herrera (Environmental Protection Agency); Nelline Kowbel (Department of Toxic Substance Control); Tom Paulino (Mayor's Office); Thor Kaslofsky, Executive Director (Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Arianne Harrison; Dr. Ahmisa Porter Sumchai; Charlita Holmes-Fox; Speaker; Yolanda Carlsanto; Tonya Randell; Speaker; Speaker; Ashi Dane; Gerald Gubadi; Erick Brooks; Speaker; Steve Zeltser; Dr. Robert Gould; Dan Hersch; Elliot Helman; Rene Jenkins; Michael Vine; Patrice Sutton; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be CONTINUED to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee meeting on October 6, 2022. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Chan
Excused: 1 - Mandelman
Absent: 1 - Walton

220781 [Hearing - Plan for Comprehensive Overdose Prevention]**Sponsor: Preston**

Hearing on the City's plan for comprehensive overdose prevention; and requesting the Department of Public Health to report.

06/21/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dr. Hillary Kunis (Department of Public Health); Alex Kral (RTI International); Jeanette Zanipatin (Drug Policy Alliance); Maurice Byrd (Harm Reduction Therapy Center); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Tom Wolf; Lauren Hall; Naty Louis; Yolanda Carlsanto; Lea Bris; Robert Young; Laura Thomas; Sheba Vandebum; David Elliot Lewis; Speaker; Colleen Rebecca; Sara Shore; Speaker; Westley Favor, Curtis Records; Theresa Palmer; Michael Ducre; Francisco Da Costa; Lakti Calenite; Ellen Grant; Culver Lawrence; Josh Gaulin; Speaker; Sue; Speaker; Larry Ackerman; Paige O'Donahue; Speaker; Chad Buckner; Alyssa Weir; Amber Sheldon; Alex Boyer; Sayer Alaniz; Kevin Deal; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Preston moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Chan
Excused: 1 - Mandelman

Chair Preston recessed the meeting at 2:37 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 3:00 p.m.

220886 [Urging Removal of Third Party Dispatch from the Taxi Upfront Fare Pilot]

Sponsors: Chan; Ronen and Mar

Resolution urging the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) Board of Directors to remove Third Party Dispatch from its Taxi Upfront Fare Pilot Program.

07/26/22; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

07/29/22; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Municipal Transportation Agency, Planning Department, Mayor's Office of Disability, Department of Environment, and Commission on the Environment for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Kate Toran (San Francisco Metropolitan Transportation Agency); Phil Cranna (San Francisco Metropolitan Transportation Agency); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Hansu Kim; Mark Krueger; Evelyn Engle; Mustafa Utar; George; Speaker; Mustafa; Teamsters; Dr. Teresa Palmer; David; Ted Fulborn; Barry Toronto; Ben Valis; Teresa Flandric; Erick Brooks; Lucci; Evelyn Pearson-Golden; Nadine Maines; Alaina Engle; Lori Leiberman; Dennis Moscovian; Matt Sutter; Anastasia Manopolus; Brent Thompson; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Chan moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, on Page 1, Line 11, by adding 'third, parties including' after 'allows'; on Page 1, Line 12, by striking 'their' before 'ride'; on Page 1, Line 14, by striking 'and', adding 'including locally regulated taxi' before 'taxi', and striking 'service' after 'taxi'; on Page 2, Lines 5-6, by adding 'Whereas, Taxis are public transit pursuant to the Transit-First Policy in Section 8A.115 of the San Francisco Charter; and'; on Page 2, Lines 8-9, by striking 'the ability to eliminate' after 'TNCs', and by adding 'permission to deviate' before 'publicly'; on Page 2, Line 16, by striking 'creates' after 'result', and by adding 'could create' before 'a'; on Page 2, Line 24, by adding 'TNCs are allowed to set fares', and by striking 'allows rates to be set by' after 'instead'; on Page 3, Line 1, by striking 'TNCs' before 'which'; on Page 3, Lines 3 -4, by striking 'a' after 'charge' and by adding 'taxi drivers an unregulated' before 'fee'; on Page 3, Line 5, by striking 'being accountable' and by adding 'responsibility' before 'for', and by adding 'the costs of vehicle operations', and by striking 'vehicle maintenance and' after 'for'; on Page 3, Line 6, by striking 'vehicle insurance for their drivers' before 'and'; and on Page 3, Line 11, by adding 'for', and by striking 'with' after 'difficult'. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Chan
Excused: 1 - Mandelman

Vice Chair Chan moved that this Resolution be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Chan
Excused: 1 - Mandelman

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Government Audit and Oversight Committee adjourned at the hour of 5:31 p.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.