



City and County of San Francisco
Meeting Minutes
Government Audit and Oversight Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Dean Preston, Catherine Stefani, Connie Chan

Clerk: Monique Crayton
(415) 554-7750 ~ monique.crayton@sfgov.org

Thursday, September 19, 2024

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 3 - Dean Preston, Catherine Stefani, and Connie Chan

The Government Audit and Oversight Committee met in regular session on Thursday, September 19, 2024, with Chair Dean Preston presiding. Chair Preston called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Chair Preston, Vice Chair Stefani, and Member Chan were noted present. A quorum was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Monique Crayton, Government Audit and Oversight Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email (monique.crayton@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

REGULAR AGENDA

Chair Preston requested that File Nos. 240667 and 240668 be heard together.

240667 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Come Hell or Highwater: Flood Management in a Changing Climate]

Hearing on the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Come Hell or Highwater: Flood Management in a Changing Climate." (Clerk of the Board)

06/11/24; RECEIVED.

06/11/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

06/18/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Office of the Mayor, Office of the Controller, Office of the City Attorney, Office of the City Administrator, Office of Resilience and Capital Planning, Human Rights Commission, Commission on the Environment, Public Utilities Commission and Port of San Francisco for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

08/09/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Consolidated response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations received from the Office of the Mayor, Office of the Controller, Office of the City Administrator, Office of the City Attorney, Office of Resilience and Capital Planning, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission, Port of San Francisco, Commission on the Environment, and the Human Rights Commission.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Michael Carboy, Foreperson, and Ralph Lane (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Brian Strong, (Office of Resilience and Capital Planning); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); Sarah Minick (Public Utilities Commission); Adam Varat (Port of San Francisco); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Dr. Ahimsa Porter Sumchai (Hunters Point Biomonitoring Program); Shirletha Holmes-Box; shared support for the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

240668 [Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Come Hell or Highwater: Flood Management in a Changing Climate]

Resolution responding to the Presiding Judge of the Superior Court on the findings and recommendations contained in the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Come Hell or Highwater: Flood Management in a Changing Climate;" and urging the Mayor to cause the implementation of accepted findings and recommendations through her department heads and through the development of the annual budget. (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

06/11/24; RECEIVED.

06/11/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

08/09/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Consolidated response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations received from the Office of the Mayor, Office of the Controller, Office of the City Administrator, Office of the City Attorney, Office of Resilience and Capital Planning, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission, Port of San Francisco, Commission on the Environment, and the Human Rights Commission.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Michael Carboy, Foreperson, and Ralph Lane (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Brian Strong, (Office of Resilience and Capital Planning); Greg Wagner, Controller (Office of the Controller); Sarah Minick (Public Utilities Commission); Adam Varat (Port of San Francisco); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Dr. Ahimsa Porter Sumchai (Hunters Point Biomonitoring Program); Shirletha Holmes-Box; shared support for the hearing matter.

Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, by adding Board of Supervisors' responses to Finding Nos. F1, F3, F4, F5, and F6; and Recommendation Nos. R1.4, R3.2, R4.1, R5.1, R6.2 and R6.3. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

Chair Preston requested that File Nos. 240708 and 240709 be heard together.

240708 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Commission Impossible? Getting the Most from San Francisco's Commissions]

Hearing on the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Commission Impossible? Getting the Most from San Francisco's Commissions." (Clerk of the Board)

06/20/24; RECEIVED.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

07/02/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Office of the Controller, and Office of the City Attorney for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

08/20/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received responses to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Office of the City Attorney,

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Sophia Kittler (Office of the Mayor); Niall Murphy and Will McCaa (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); Brad Russi (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Brian Adam; Tony; shared support for the hearing matter.

Chair Preston moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

240709 [Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Commission Impossible? Getting the Most from San Francisco's Commissions]

Resolution responding to the Presiding Judge of the Superior Court on the findings and recommendations contained in the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Commission Impossible? Getting the Most from San Francisco's Commissions"; and urging the Mayor to cause the implementation of accepted findings and recommendations through her department heads and through the development of the annual budget. (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

06/20/24; RECEIVED.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

08/22/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received responses to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Office of the City Attorney,

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Sophia Kittler (Office of the Mayor); Niall Murphy and Will McCaa (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); Brad Russi (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Brian Adam; Tony; shared support for the hearing matter.

Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, by adding Board of Supervisors' responses to Finding Nos. F1, F2, F3, F4, F5, F6, F7, F8, and F9; and Recommendation Nos. R1.2, R1.3, R2.1, R2.2, R2.3, R2.4, R2.5, R2.6, R2.7, R3.1, R4.1, R4.2, R4.3, R5.1, R5.2, R6.1, R7.1, R7.2, R8.1, R9.1, R9.2, and R9.3. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

Chair Preston requested that File Nos. 240710 and 240711 be heard together.

Member Chan was noted not present at 1:26 p.m., and for the remainder of the meeting.

240710 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Building San Francisco: Designing, Constructing, and Maintaining City Infrastructure]

Hearing on the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Building San Francisco: Designing, Constructing, and Maintaining City Infrastructure." (Clerk of the Board)

06/20/24; RECEIVED.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

07/02/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Public Works Commission, Department of Public Works, Office of the City Controller, Office of the City Administrator, and Office of Resilience and Capital Planning for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

08/08/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received a response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Public Works Commission.

08/20/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received a response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Office of the Mayor, Department of Public Works, Office of the Controller, Office of the City Administrator, and the Office of Resilience and Capital Planning.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Will McCaa (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Brian Strong, Nicolas King (Office of Resilience and Capital Planning); Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); Sophia Kittler (Office of the Mayor); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Stefani

Absent: 1 - Chan

240711 [Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Building San Francisco: Designing, Constructing, and Maintaining City Infrastructure]

Resolution responding to the Presiding Judge of the Superior Court on the findings and recommendations contained in the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Building San Francisco Designing, Constructing, and Maintaining City Infrastructure"; and urging the Mayor to cause the implementation of accepted findings and recommendations through her department heads and through the development of the annual budget. (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

06/20/24; RECEIVED.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

08/08/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received a response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Public Works Commission.

08/20/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received a response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Office of the Mayor, Department of Public Works, Office of the Controller, Office of the City Administrator, and the Office of Resilience and Capital Planning.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Will McCaa (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Brian Strong, Nicolas King (Office of Resilience and Capital Planning); Sophie Hayward (Office of the City Administrator); Sophia Kittler (Office of the Mayor); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, by adding Board of Supervisors' responses to Finding No. F1 and Recommendation No. R1.5. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Stefani

Absent: 1 - Chan

Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Stefani

Absent: 1 - Chan

240719 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Lifting the Fog: On Budgets, Innovation, Silos, and More]

Hearing on the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Lifting the Fog: On Budgets, Innovation, Silos, and More". (Clerk of the Board)

06/21/24; RECEIVED.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

07/02/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Office of the City Controller, Office of the City Administrator, and Department of Technology for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

07/10/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Department of Technology provided a response to the findings and recommendations in the Civil Grand Jury report.

08/24/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received a response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Office of the Mayor, Office of the City Administrator, Controller's Office, and Department of Technology.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Paul Dravis (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Sophia Kittler (Office of the Mayor); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Chair Preston moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

240720 [Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Lifting the Fog: On Budgets, Innovation, Silos, and More]

Resolution responding to the Presiding Judge of the Superior Court on the findings and recommendations contained in the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Lifting the Fog: On Budgets, Innovation, Silos, and More"; and urging the Mayor to cause the implementation of accepted findings and recommendations through her department heads and through the development of the annual budget. (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

06/21/24; RECEIVED.

06/25/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

07/10/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Department of Technology provided a response to the findings and recommendations in the Civil Grand Jury report.

08/24/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Received a response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations from the Office of the Mayor, Office of the City Administrator, Controller's Office, and Department of Technology.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Paul Dravis (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Sophia Kittler (Office of the Mayor); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion.

Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, by adding Board of Supervisors' responses to Finding Nos. F1, F2, and F4; and Recommendation Nos. R1.4, R2.1, and R4.2. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

240583 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - "Uncontrolled Burn Dimming the Spark of Illegal Fireworks in San Francisco."]

Hearing on the 2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Uncontrolled Burn Dimming the Spark of Illegal Fireworks in San Francisco." (Clerk of the Board)

05/28/24; RECEIVED.

06/04/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

06/11/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Office of the City of the City Controller, Police Department, Fire Department, Department of Emergency Management, and 311 Customer Service for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

07/26/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Consolidated response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations received from the Office of the Mayor, Office of the Controller, Department of Emergency Management, San Francisco Police Department, San Francisco Fire Department, and 311 Customer Service Center.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Bart Fisher (2023-2024 Civil Grand Jury); Sophia Kittler (Mayor's Office); Jackie Thornhill (Department of Emergency Management); Jonathan Baxter (San Francisco Fire Department); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Member Chan moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Stefani, Chan

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Government Audit and Oversight Committee adjourned at the hour of 1:35 p.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.