



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Land Use and Transportation Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Member: Myrna Melgar, Chyanne Chen, Bilal Mahmood*

*Clerk: John Carroll*  
*(415) 554-4445 ~ [john.carroll@sfgov.org](mailto:john.carroll@sfgov.org)*

---

**Monday, March 17, 2025**

**1:30 PM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

**Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Myrna Melgar, Chyanne Chen, and Bilal Mahmood

*The Land Use and Transportation Committee met in regular session on Monday, March 17, 2025, with Chair Myrna Melgar presiding. Chair Melgar called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Melgar, Vice Chair Chen, and Member Mahmood were noted present. A quorum was present.*

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

*John Carroll, Land Use and Transportation Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email ([john.carroll@sfgov.org](mailto:john.carroll@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

**241021 [Planning Code - Window Replacement Standards]****Sponsors: Melgar; Engardio, Sauter, Sherrill and Mahmood**

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to limit restrictions on window replacement projects in certain buildings; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and making findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare pursuant to Planning Code, Section 302.

10/15/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Land Use and Transportation Committee, expires on 11/14/2024.

10/23/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Planning Commission for findings of consistency with the General Plan; the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302. Referred to the Planning Department for environmental review.

12/30/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 16060(c)(2) because it would not result in a direct or indirect physical change in the environment. Individual projects will require environmental review.

01/24/25; REMAIN ACTIVE. On January 14, 2025, the Board adopted extension Resolution No. 15-25 (Board File No. 241218), extending the prescribed time within which the Planning Commission may render its decision on the proposed Ordinance for approximately 90 additional days until April 21, 2025.

03/13/25; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Planning Commission held a duly-noticed hearing on February 27, 2025, and recommended approval of the proposed legislation with modifications.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Michelle Taylor (Planning Department); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Sophia O'Neal-Roberts (Mission Housing Development Corporation); Peter; Julia; Speaker; shared support for the ordinance matter. Michael Keenan; shared opposition to the ordinance matter. Thierry Fill; Steve Wilson; Speaker; shared various concerns regarding the ordinance matter.*

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, on Page 1, Lines 3-4, to read 'Ordinance amending the Planning Code to limit restrictions on replacement materials in window replacement projects in certain buildings;' on Page 2, Line 12, through Page 3, Line 10, to read 'SEC. 136.2. WINDOW REPLACEMENT REQUIREMENTS. (a) Subject to the exceptions set forth in subsections (b) and (c), the Planning Department shall impose no restrictions related to the replacement materials of any window frame or sash that replaces an existing window frame or sash. (b) Exceptions Involving Historic Resources. Subsection (a) shall not apply to replacement windows in any property, building, or structure previously determined to be a Historic Building, as that term is defined in Section 102. (c) Applicable Building, Fire, and other Health and Safety Requirements. Notwithstanding subsection (a), the City, including the Planning Department, may impose any requirements for replacement windows that are necessary to comply with applicable building and fire standards and any other applicable requirements necessary to protect health and safety. (d) In the event of a conflict between this Section 136.2 and any other provisions of the Planning Code, including controls related to window treatments and transparency, the more restrictive standards shall apply. (e) In the event of a conflict between this Section 136.2 and any applicable Cultural District Objective Design Standards, the more restrictive standards shall apply.'** The motion carried by the following vote:

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to limit restrictions on replacement materials in window replacement projects in certain buildings; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code Section 101.1; and making findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare pursuant to Planning Code, Section 302.

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

**241067 [Planning, Building Codes - Interim Housing in Hotels and Motels]****Sponsors: Mayor; Sauter**

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to allow tourist hotels and motels to be used for Interim Housing without thereby abandoning or discontinuing the hotel use classification under that Code; amending the Building Code to allow Interim Housing without thereby changing the underlying occupancy classification of the property, and amending Appendix P to remove restriction that emergency housing be located on land owned or leased by the City; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1, and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.

10/29/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Land Use and Transportation Committee, expires on 11/28/2024.

11/06/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Building Inspection Commission for review and response. Referred to the Planning Commission for findings of consistency with the General Plan; the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302. Referred to the Planning Department for environmental review. Referred to the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing and the Human Services Agency for informational purposes.

11/15/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it would not result in a direct or indirect physical change to the environment.

11/21/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. On November 20, 2024, the Building Inspection Commission met and held a duly noticed hearing, and recommended approval of the proposed legislation.

12/23/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Planning Commission held a duly-noticed hearing on December 12, 2024, and adopted a recommendation for approval.

02/10/25; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Bivett Brackett; Speaker; Sharky Laguana; shared various concerns regarding the ordinance matter.

03/10/25; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Supervisor Matt Dorsey (Board of Supervisors); Veronica Flores (Planning Department); Emily Cohen (Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing); Brad Russi (Office of the City Attorney); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Nate; Timothy Stewart; Vernon Harris; Speaker; Cynthia Gomez (Hotel Workers Union Local 2); Destiny Pletsch (Salvation Army); Steve Adami; Aaron Lowers; Louie Gomez; Ricardo Gutierrez; Speaker; Ken Baker; Joshua Banks; Gilbert Young; Gregory; James; Abigail Morley; shared various concerns regarding the ordinance matter.

03/10/25; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

03/12/25; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Budget and Legislative Analyst for review and fiscal impact determination pursuant to Administrative Code, Section 2.6-3.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Emily Cohen (Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Thierry Fill; Cynthia Gomez (Hotel Workers Union Local 2); shared various concerns regarding the ordinance matter.*

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, on Page 7, Line 9, to read 'Interim Housing is authorized at only the following locations: Block 3519, Lot 006;' and on Page 7, Lines 14-16, to read 'A Hotel or Motel identified in subsection (c) and existing after April 1, 2025 may apply to establish Interim Housing pursuant to this Section 202.15 without losing its Hotel or Motel use.' The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

**DUPLICATED AS AMENDED**

*See Duplicate File No. 250257.*

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

**250257 [Planning, Building Codes - Interim Housing in Hotels and Motels]****Sponsor: Mayor**

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to allow tourist hotels and motels to be used for Interim Housing without thereby abandoning or discontinuing the hotel use classification under that Code; amending the Building Code to allow Interim Housing without thereby changing the underlying occupancy classification of the property, and amending Appendix P to remove restriction that emergency housing be located on land owned or leased by the City; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1, and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.

*Duplicated from File No. 241067.*

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, on Page 1, Lines 5-8, to read 'authorizing the reestablishment of hotel use for certain Shelter-In-Place hotels; amending the Building Code to allow Interim Housing without thereby changing the underlying occupancy classification of the property, allowing reestablishment of hotel use for Shelter-In-Place hotels;' on Page 6, Lines 4-14, by inserting '(k) As part of its initial response to COVID-19, the City launched the Shelter-in-Place ("SIP") Hotel Program. The SIP Hotel Program made a historic commitment to serving the unhoused population by providing non-congregate shelter for over 3,700 people experiencing homelessness who were most vulnerable to COVID-19. Over the course of the program, HSH served 3,356 adult guests in these non-congregate hotel sites, and two-thirds of eligible guests exited to housing. (l) One unintended consequence of the SIP Hotel Program is that some participating hotels may have abandoned or discontinued the previously approved hotel use under applicable provisions of City law. It is reasonable to permit the hotels that participated in the SIP Hotel Program to reactivate the hotel use, and to not require strict compliance with the Planning Code;' on Page 9, Lines 4-19, by inserting '(h) Reactivation of Hotel or Motel Use for Certain Shelter-In-Place Hotels. Notwithstanding Section 178, a Hotel or Motel located at Block 0304, Lot 005, Block 0715, Lot 011, Block 0335, Lot 027 that otherwise abandoned or discontinued the Tourist Hotel use due to participation in the City's Shelter-In-Place Hotel Program may reestablish such use, if the Zoning Administrator determines that: (1) the Hotel or Motel entered into an agreement with the City to provide non-congregant shelter as part of the City's Shelter-In-Place Hotel Program; and (2) the Hotel or Motel continued to provide shelter services under an agreement with the City on or after January 1, 2025. Any such reestablished use shall comply with the applicable requirements of the Planning Code, provided that the Hotel or Motel use shall not be required to comply with Article 4 of the Planning Code concerning development impact fees and project requirements to reestablish the use, and the abandonment of the shelter use and reactivation of the Hotel or Motel use shall not be considered removal of residential units pursuant to Section 317. The authorization in this subsection 202.15(h) shall not apply to any units that were Residential Units in a Residential Hotel, as those terms are defined in Chapter 41 of the Administrative Code, at the time the Hotel or Motel began to participate in the Shelter-in-Place Hotel Program;' on Page 10, Lines 1-5, to read '(11) If a Hotel or Motel is lawfully authorized for Interim Housing use in accordance with Section 202.15, and such use ceases, the abandonment, cessation, or termination of Interim Housing use shall not be considered a Residential Conversion. The reactivation of any Hotel or Motel use pursuant to Section 202.15(h) shall not be considered a Residential Conversion;' on Page 10, Lines 22-25, by inserting '26. The reestablishment of a Hotel or Motel use pursuant to Planning Code Section 202.15(h) for any such use that participated in the City's Shelter-In-Place Hotel Program and was operated as a shelter. Such reestablishment of the Hotel or Motel Use shall not be considered a change in the underlying occupancy classification of the property;' and making conforming and clerical amendments throughout the ordinance text. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to allow tourist hotels and motels to be used for Interim Housing without thereby abandoning or discontinuing the hotel use classification under that Code, and authorizing the reestablishment of hotel use for certain Shelter-In-Place hotels; amending the Building Code to allow Interim Housing without thereby changing the underlying occupancy classification of the property, allowing reestablishment of hotel use for Shelter-In-Place hotels, and amending Appendix P to remove restriction that emergency housing be located on land owned or leased by the City; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1, and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

### **241173 [Planning Code - Continuation of Nonconforming Public Parking Lots in CMUO and MUR]**

**Sponsor: Dorsey**

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to authorize the continuance of nonconforming public parking lots in the Central SoMa Mixed Use-Office (CMUO) and Mixed Use-Residential (MUR) Districts through December 31, 2026; enabling an existing public parking lot operator in CMUO and MUR Districts to apply for a conditional use authorization for a five-year extension; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and adopting findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.

12/03/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Land Use and Transportation Committee, expires on 1/2/2025.

12/11/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Planning Commission for findings of consistency with the General Plan; the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302. Referred to the Planning Department for environmental review.

12/30/24; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it would not result in a direct or indirect physical change in the environment.

02/25/25; SUBSTITUTED AND ASSIGNED to Land Use and Transportation Committee. Supervisor Dorsey introduced a substitute Ordinance bearing a new title.

02/28/25; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Planning Commission for findings of consistency with the General Plan; the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302. Referred to the Planning Department for environmental review.

03/10/25; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Planning Commission held a duly-noticed hearing on March 6, 2025, and recommended approval of the proposed legislation.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Madison Tam (Office of Supervisor Matt Dorsey); Audrey Merlone (Planning Department); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Thierry Fill; shared various concerns regarding the ordinance matter.*

**Chair Melgar moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

**250069 [Planning Code - Conversion of Residential Hotel Rooms to Tourist Hotel Rooms at 447 Bush Street]**

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to principally permit up to 51 Tourist Hotel rooms at Assessor's Parcel Block No. 0287, Lot No. 020, also known as 447 Bush Street; exempting 447 Bush Street from the requirement to obtain a conditional use authorization to convert 38 Residential Hotel rooms to Tourist Hotel rooms; waiving development impact fees and requirements for the conversion of the 38 rooms; providing that the conversion of the 38 rooms shall occur simultaneously with the application of the Residential Hotel Unit Conversion and Demolition Ordinance to 27 Group Housing rooms at 412-422 Hayes Street and seven Group Housing Rooms at 319-321 Ivy Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 0808, Lot No. 007; providing that the Department of Building Inspection shall issue certificates of use to reflect the changes in use of all the aforementioned properties and waiving associated fees; providing that the Ordinance is conditioned on enactment of the ordinance approving settlement of claims in Hotel Des Arts, LLC v. City and County of San Francisco et al.; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and making findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302. (City Attorney)

01/17/25; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

01/28/25; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Land Use and Transportation Committee, expires on 2/27/2025.

02/05/25; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Planning Department for environmental review. Referred to the Planning Commission for findings of consistency with the General Plan; the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.

02/12/25; RESPONSE RECEIVED. CEQA clearance under Final Negative Declaration issued on January 26, 2023 (Case No. 2020-005491ENV).

03/12/25; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Planning Commission held a duly-noticed hearing on March 6, 2025, and recommended approval of the proposed legislation.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Brad Russi (Office of the City Attorney); Aaron Starr (Planning Department); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Thierry Fill; shared various concerns regarding the ordinance matter.*

**Supervisor Mahmood moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Melgar, Chen, Mahmood

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Land Use and Transportation Committee adjourned at the hour of 2:15 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Land Use and Transportation Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*