


CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
BUDGET AND LEGISLATIVE ANALYST
1390 Market Street, Suite 1150, San Francisco, CA 94102
(415) 552-9292 FAX (415) 252-0461

POLICY ANALYSIS REPORT

To: Supervisor Sandra Fewer
From: Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office 
Date: March 25, 2019
Re: City Departments' Assignment of Take-Home Vehicles

Summary of Requested Action

Your office requested that we report on (1) the number of take-home vehicles by department across the City; (2) the cost to the City of these take-home vehicles; and (3) the policies and procedures in place in regards to take-home vehicles.

Project Staff: Ashley Clark, Jennifer Millman Tell, Severin Campbell

Executive Summary

- The Administrative Code defines when City-owned vehicles may be taken home by City staff, and allocates a specific number of take-home vehicles for eight City departments. The City Administrator, who is assigned responsibility by the Administrative Code to approve take-home vehicles, further requested department heads to monitor assignment of take-home vehicles to focus on public safety and emergency response.
- Many of the take-home vehicle assignments do not conform to the Administrative Code. Fourteen City departments assign 247 take-home vehicles, or 118 percent more than the 113 take-home vehicles allocated in the Administrative Code. The estimated annual cost to the City for these 14 departments' take-home vehicles is \$1.58 million.
- While some City positions are required to be available to respond to any incident or emergency after-hours, other positions are only required to respond when they are specifically assigned to be on-call. However, some City departments assign take-home vehicles to staff even when they are not specifically assigned to be on-call. For example, the Public Defender's Office assigns take-home vehicles to all 16 Public Defender investigators and senior investigators, and the City Attorney's Office assigns take-home vehicles to all six claims investigators.
- Some City departments also assign take-home vehicles to positions not specifically designated for emergency response. For example, the Airport assigns take-home vehicles to staff responsible for business, administrative, and communications functions; the Municipal Transportation Agency assigns take-home vehicles to staff responsible for parking and events; and the Police Department assigns take-home vehicle to staff responsible for risk management, community engagement and media relations.

- The Administrative Code, which has not been revised since 2004, needs updating. The Administrative Code also needs clarification on (1) which City departments are authorized to assign take-home vehicles, (2) the public safety and emergency response requirements justifying the permanent assignment of take-home vehicles, and (3) City departments' operational requirements justifying temporary assignment of take-home vehicles from a department vehicle pool
- The Board of Supervisors should request the City Administrator to recommend Administrative Code revisions to better align the Code with the City's practices and requirements. The City Administrator should also be requested to work with City departments to establish clear guidelines on the assignment of take-home vehicles on (1) a permanent basis to meet the City's public safety and emergency response requirements, and (2) temporary basis from a department vehicle pool to meet the department's operational requirements.

City-Wide Policy and Practice for Take-Home Vehicles

The use of City vehicles to and from a place of residence ("take-home vehicles") is governed by the San Francisco Administrative Code, Sec. 4.11. Vehicles owned, leased, or rented by the City are subject to the code.

According to the Administrative Code, no officer, employee, or authorized volunteer of the City may use a vehicle without consent of the head of the department. The head of the department may not assign any vehicle to an individual unless a written request justifying the need for personal assignment is made and approved by the Director of Administrative Services. These assigned vehicles must be used for municipal business.

There are five conditions in which a City vehicle may be used for transportation to and from an employee's place of residence:

1. The employee resides in the City and works outside of the City, or resides and works outside the City, and is on call for work after hours. The work must have required the use of a City vehicle after hours on at least five occasions in the preceding 12-month period.
2. The employee resides in the City and works outside of the City, or resides and works outside of the City, and must leave his or her residence prior to 8:00 a.m. on City business away from his or her normal place of work.
3. The employee resides in the City and works outside of the City, or resides and works outside of the City, and would return to his or her normal place of work from an appointment on City business after 6:00 p.m. or on a weekend.
4. The employee is a forensic pathologist employed by the Office of the Medical Examiner and has prior written permission of the Medical Examiner to use a City vehicle and is on call before or after normal work hours in order to respond to and investigate death scenes. The Medical Examiner is allowed only two exempted vehicles.

5. The employee is a resident of the City and is driving the vehicle to and from the employee's place of residence solely for the purpose of garaging the vehicle at his or her place of residence during non-work hours, with the approval by resolution of the Board of Supervisors, upon the recommendation of the Director of Administrative Services.

The Administrative Code allocates a specific number of take-home vehicles for the following departments: Police, Sheriff, Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), Public Works, Emergency Management, Office of Citizen Complaints (now Department of Police Accountability), and District Attorney. Employees of these departments must have prior written permission of the department head to use a vehicle equipped with emergency equipment. Department heads regulate the number of take-home vehicles assigned to staff and monitor actual vehicle usage. The departments must keep detailed records of all vehicles and the records are open to inspection by the Board of Supervisors. These departments are allocated a total of 113 take-home vehicles, as shown in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Take-Home Vehicles Allocated to City Departments in Administrative Code

Department	Number Allocated
Public Utilities Commission	42
Police Department	33
Sheriff's Department	5
Department of Emergency Management	2
Department of Public Works	17
Office of Citizen Complaints	4
District Attorney's Office	8
Medical Examiner	2
Total	113

Source: Administrative Code

Any employee violating the provisions of Section 4.11 of the Administrative Code shall pay to the City an amount equal to three times the City's mileage reimbursement rate times the number of miles driven in violation of the provisions of Section 4.11.

City Administrator Role

The Administrative Code provides for the Director of Administrative Services to approve the use of take-home vehicles assigned by City department heads, as noted above. According to the City Administrator's Office, given independent authority provided to enterprise departments by San Francisco's Charter and the practical limitations with review of public safety departments, the City Administrator (who functions as the Director of Administrative Services) serves in an information and coordination role rather than an approval and enforcement role. The City Administrator sends a memorandum to City department heads clarifying requirements for assigning take-home vehicles every two years. The memorandum requests department heads to review assignment of take-home vehicles to eliminate any unnecessary usage, and to submit justification for continued requests for take-home vehicles to the City Administrator's Office. According to the memorandum, "while the General Services Agency has authority to approve take-home vehicle requests, and while the GSA-Fleet Management Division will be reviewing all those submitted in response to this instruction, it is very difficult for a fleet office to assess the accuracy and validity of the justifications submitted." The memorandum requests department heads to monitor assignment of take-home vehicles to focus on public safety and emergency response.

Take Home Vehicles as a Benefit to City Staff

Use of a City-owned vehicle for commuting to and from work is a non-cash benefit and included in taxable income for reporting to the Internal Revenue Service. In 2019, the taxable amount for personal use of a City-owned vehicle, including commuting to and from work, is \$0.58 per mile. According to a 2013 memorandum from the Controller's Office, each driver and passenger who commutes in a City-owned vehicle is required to report their vehicle use each pay period.

According to our survey of City departments, two City departments had written policies outlining responsibilities for take-home vehicles. The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission has written policies outlining the driver and passenger's responsibility to (1) complete a take-home vehicle request form and (2) report the time travelled on e-Time, the SFPUC's payroll system. The Police Department's General Order 10.10 outlines the Department's rules for vehicle use, including the process for approving use of a vehicle overnight and recording mileage.

Budget and Legislative Analyst's 2018 Survey of City Departments

The Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office surveyed all City departments to obtain the number of take-home vehicles by department across the City. Fourteen departments reported having take-home vehicles, as shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2: 2018 Survey Results of Departments with Take Home-Vehicles

Department	Reported Number	Number Allocated in Code	Exceeds Number Allocated in Code
Emergency Management	2	2	Within allocation
Medical Examiner	0	2	Within allocation
Police Accountability	1	4	Within allocation
Public Works	10	17	Within allocation
SFPUC	21	42	Within allocation
District Attorney	8	8	Within allocation
Airport	40	0	40
City Attorney	6	0	6
Fire	45	0	45
Municipal Transportation Agency	23	0	23
Police	47	33	14
Port	1	0	1
Public Defender	16	0	16
Public Health	3	0	3
Sheriff	24	5	19
Total	247	113	167

Source: Budget and Legislative Analyst survey.

Note: The Office of the Medical Examiner, which is allocated two vehicles in the Administrative Code, reported having one vehicle that is rotated among on-call staff and not assigned to a specific employee. It was not considered a take-home vehicle for the purposes of this analysis.

Of the 14 departments that reported assigning take-home vehicles to employees, five departments were within the number of take-home vehicles allocated in the Administrative Code. Three departments reported a number of take-home vehicles in excess of the number of vehicles allocated in the Administrative Code, and seven City departments (Airport, City Attorney, Municipal Transportation Agency, Port, Public Health, Fire, and Public Defender) reported assigning vehicles for take-home use, even though the Administrative Code does not specifically define the number of take-home vehicles for these departments. The assignments for take-home vehicles are summarized below.

Departments Assigning Take Home Vehicles within the Number Defined in the Administrative Code

Emergency Management

The Department of Emergency Management is allocated two take-home vehicles in the Administrative Code. The Department has assigned these vehicles to the Department’s Executive Director and Deputy Director, who are both tasked with responding 24/7 to emergency situations. According to the Department, the vehicles are equipped with emergency response equipment.

Police Accountability

The Department of Police Accountability is allocated four take-home vehicles in the Administrative Code. The Department reports one take-home vehicle, which is assigned one vehicle to the Department's Deputy Director, who is on call after hours for emergencies related to officer-involved shootings and critical incidents.

Public Works

The Department of Public Works is allocated 17 take-home vehicles in the Administrative Code and has assigned 10 to employees. Employees assigned take-home vehicles include: (a) employees who drive the vehicles to and from residences for the purpose of garaging the vehicle at employees' residences during non-work hours, which according to the Department, was approved by resolution of the Board of Supervisors; (b) the Assistant Superintendent of the Street Environmental Services Division, who needs the vehicle in case of emergencies; (c) an employee who resides outside the City and is on call for work after the normal workday; and (d) three employees with prior written permission to use a vehicle equipped with emergency equipment, including the Department Head, a Senior Engineer, and Senior Construction Engineer.

San Francisco Public Utilities Commission

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission has assigned 21 of the 42 take-home vehicles allocated in the Administrative Code. Each vehicle is assigned to a subject matter expert employee of the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission and has the prior written permission of the department head to use a vehicle equipped with emergency equipment (hardware, tools and/or water sewer testing kits) for such purpose.

Departments Assigning Take Home Vehicles Exceeding the Number Defined in the Administrative Code

Airport

Although the Administrative Code does not specifically define the assignment of take-home vehicles to the Airport, the Airport reported 40 take-home vehicles. Four of the vehicles are assigned to executive and management staff with 24/7 responsibility to respond to Airport emergencies, including the Airport Director and Deputy Director in the Airport Director's Office, the Deputy Director for Design & Construction, and the Principal Engineer for Design & Construction.

Four other executive and management staff are assigned take-home vehicles but are not identified as having 24/7 responsibility. The four positions – Deputy Directors for Business & Finance, Administration & Policy, and Communication & Marketing – use these vehicles for work outside of normal hours. Additionally, the Communications & Marketing Manager is needed to be on-call for emergency situations. The four positions are considered to be part of the Airport's Incident Command System and are required to report to the Airport's Emergency Operations Center in the event of an emergency.

Eleven of the take-home vehicles are assigned to managers and supervisors responsible for facilities. These positions include five managers, and six supervising staff in plumbing, sheet metal, steamfitter, and electrician units.

The Airport has installed a transponder in every take-home vehicle, including public safety vehicles, which enables them to track usage, speed, monitor violations and take remedial action. According to Airport staff, the Airport has revoked vehicles given violations in the past.

The Airport's Police Bureau assigns take-home vehicles to 19 staff, of whom 15 are assigned to the K9 unit, and transport their dogs to and from home in the City-owned vehicle. Each vehicle holds the canine's supplies, equipment, and kennels that are used during the hours when the canines are in between terminal patrol and training. The U.S. Transportation Security Administration (TSA) requires safe transport and holding kennels for all canines assigned to the Airport. The other positions are a police officer in drug enforcement (DEA), a deputy chief and commander in administration, and a captain in patrol. Airport considers these positions to have 24/7 responsibility to respond to emergencies.

The four command staff members of the Airport's Police Bureau – Deputy Chief, Commander, Captain of Patrol, and Captain of Traffic – have 24/7 responsibility for the Airport and are responsible for reporting for duty to address emergencies that come up after normal business hour.

Two Fire Department staff assigned to the Airport – the Assistant Deputy Chief and the Fire Marshall – are also assigned take-home vehicles. According to the Airport, these positions are necessary for emergency response.

City Attorney

The City Attorney's Office reported six take-home vehicles assigned to claims investigators who must work on-call shifts. On-call investigators respond to emergency incidents in and out of the City to conduct liability investigations during business and non-business hours. While the Office assigns six take-home vehicles on a permanent basis, the Office reports that at least two vehicles must be taken home at any given time to ensure 24 hour shift coverage. According to the City Attorney's Office, although there are only two investigators on-call, the 24-hour shift coverage schedule is such that it does not allow for the same vehicle to be used during the day by one investigator and taken home by another investigator who is on the on-call shift.

District Attorney's Office

According to the District Attorney's Office, based on discussions with the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office, the District Attorney's Office reviewed existing take-home vehicle assignments through a review of on-call assignments to reduce the number from 18 to eight, the number defined in the Administrative Code. According to the District Attorney's Office, the eight take-home vehicles are now assigned only to investigators who are on-call.

Fire Department

Although the Administrative Code does not specifically define assignment of take-home vehicles by the Fire Department, the Fire Chief has assigned 45 take-home vehicles to staff. Fourteen of these vehicles are assigned to staff who, according to the Department, are responsible for 24 hour emergency calls. The staff on-call 24 hours to respond to

emergencies include the Fire Chief, two deputy chiefs for operations, the assistant deputy chief assigned to the Port, the Department's safety officer, the Department's chief water office, the Emergency Medical Service (EMS) chief, the EMS section chief, and the fire marshal.

The Department's Bureau of Equipment has four staff take-home vehicles: a captain, lieutenant, and two firefighters. According to the Fire Department, the two senior positions are on-call to respond to all greater alarms or major incidents and to supervise and assist two firefighters assigned in a daily 24/7 capacity. The positions are also responsible for 24/7 deployment of mutual aid strike teams, emergency fuel delivery, emergency facilities repairs, readiness and logistics warehouse access, and all major San Francisco International Airport incidents.

In addition, the Department's Peer Support group assigned two firefighter/paramedics take-home vehicles. The two positions support members who have any mental health concerns or issues. In their capacity as a resource for members who are having concerns, they may respond to burn units and hospitals, incident scenes, fire houses, or members' homes. They are asked to be on call 24/7.

According to the Department, 31 of the 45 take-home vehicles are assigned to fire inspectors and other staff in the Bureau of Fire Prevention. The Department reported that these vehicles are assigned as take-home because garage space is not available at the Fire Department, and the fire inspectors and other Bureau of Fire Prevention staff must be available for after-hours overtime assignments. The Fire Department does not know if there was ever Board Approval for this action.

Municipal Transportation Agency

Although the Administrative Code does not specifically define the assignment of take-home vehicles to the Municipal Transportation Agency, the Agency assigns take-home vehicles to 23 staff. These assignments include (a) three executive level staff with 24/7 responsibility for bus and light rail operations, including the Director of Transit, the Chief Transit Officer, and the Deputy Director of Transit Services; (b) three executive level staff with 24/7 responsibility for maintenance, including the Deputy Director of Bus Maintenance, the Deputy Director of Rail Maintenance, and the Deputy Director of Maintenance of Ways; (c) seven management and superintendent staff that the Agency considers to have 24/7 responsibility for transit maintenance; and (d) the Deputy Director of Construction who is responsible to respond to emergencies at construction sites.

The Municipal Transportation Agency assigns take-home vehicles to four management staff in the Sustainable Streets Division with various responsibilities for parking, events, incidents, and safety. According to the Agency, the Chief Security Officer and Parking Enforcement Officer have been called back for emergencies and incidents approximately 20 and five times in the past year, respectively. The Manager of Emergency Management, System Security and Special events has not been subject to call back, but often attends special events that occur outside of normal business hours.

Five vehicles are assigned to police officers who are on call for explosive canine detection and bomb threats, as required by contract with the TSA. As with the Airport, the TSA has

requirements for the vehicle and that the K9 and officer is able to respond within 45 minutes.

Police Department

The Police Department is allocated 33 take-home vehicles in the Administrative Code. In October 2018, the Police Department reported 79 take-home vehicles to the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office. In December 2018, the Police revised their designation of take-home vehicles down from 79 to 47, as shown below. According to Ms. Catherine McGuire, Director of the Police Department's Strategic Management Bureau, the Police historically assigned take home vehicles based upon the likelihood of having to respond into work afterhours. The Department is in the process of removing the take-home designation from several vehicles to ensure the Department is operating within the provisions of the Administrative Code.

Administration	2
Airport	3
Chief of Staff	2
Chief's Office	1
Community Engagement	1
Crime Scene Investigations	1
Field Operations	15
Forensics	1
Investigations	9
K9	6
Major Crimes	1
Media Relations	1
Municipal Transportation Agency	1
Risk Management	2
Special Operations Bureau	1
<hr/> Total	<hr/> 47

Six of the take-home vehicles are assigned to member of the K9 unit, who transport their dogs to and from home in a City vehicle. Similar to the TSA specifications for the Airport K9 units, some task force positions have specific specifications for K9 vehicles and require that the officer is able to respond.

The other 41 take-home vehicles are assigned to Police Department staff who, according to the Department, are subject to immediate recall to work for either investigative or emergency reasons. Eight of the take-home vehicles are assigned to executive-level staff, including the Police Chief, two Assistant Chiefs, five Deputy Chiefs for field operations, investigations, special operations, administration, and the Airport. One take-home vehicle is assigned to the manager of the Forensic Services Division.

According to the Department, members who are subject to call back are typically in the command ranks and will respond to major incidents, such as an officer involved shooting or custody deaths. These positions are subject to call back 365 days a year.

The remaining 32 take-home vehicles are assigned to police supervisory staff (commander, captain, lieutenant, and sergeant staff) at the Airport, Municipal Transportation Agency,

Field Operations, Investigations, Administration, and Major Crimes. The take-home vehicles assigned to police staff at the Airport and the Municipal Transportation Agency are in addition to the vehicles reported by those departments. The 32 take-home vehicles also include vehicles assigned to police supervisory staff in Risk Management, Media Relations, and Community Engagement. According to the Department, the Commander of Community Engagement does not typically respond to call back events. However, the staff member attends approximately 20 events annually outside of the normal work week. The Sergeant of Media Relations responds to every officer involved shooting, in custody deaths, and any other major event that occurs after normal work hours.

Port

The Port reported one vehicle, assigned to the Deputy Director of Maintenance, who is on call for emergency response to protect public safety and property.

Public Defender

Although the Administrative Code does not specifically allocate assignment of take-home vehicles by the Public Defender's Office, the Office assigns 16 take-home vehicles to Public Defender investigators and senior investigators. According to the Office, investigators may work after hours to locate, interview and subpoena witnesses, inspect and document crime scenes, research court records, and do other tasks in the investigation of criminal, juvenile, mental health, and immigration cases.

Public Health

The Department of Public Health reported three take-home vehicles assigned to two senior environmental health inspectors and one industrial hygienist. According to the Department, these three positions are required to respond 24/7 to hazardous materials emergencies, and must keep essential equipment with their vehicles.

Sheriff's Department

The Administrative Code allocates five take-home vehicles for the Sheriff's Department, but the Department assigns 24 take-home vehicles or 19 more than allocated in the Administrative Code. These assignments include: (a) 16 to staff in the rank of captain or above to respond to emergency situations; (b) four to Department investigations for timely/confidential personnel investigations; (c) three to the K9 unit for animal transport; and (d) one the Homeland Security liaison for out-of-county meetings. According to the Department, of the 16 staff the seven executive command staff – Sherriff, Assistant Sherriff, Under Sherriff, and four Chief Deputies – have 24/7 responsibility. The remaining nine captains are for the Officer's in Charge of a jail facility, which operates 24/7. Field patrol units such as Zuckerberg General Hospital and Laguna Honda, Administration and Community Programs, and Sheriff's Work Alternative Program. The nine captains are not on rotation and are each subject to call back at any time.

The four investigators are also subject to respond to incidences 24/7 at any Sheriff location including jail or field locations. Although a duty rotation exists to maintain a minimum response element on a 24/7 basis, the Department states that any investigator is subject to call back at any time.

According to the Department, although normal business hour meetings and functions can be scheduled in advance, the Homeland Security liaison position is required to immediately respond to critical incidents or requests for mutual aid.

Telematics

In March 2014, the Board of Supervisors adopted Resolution No. 91-14, which approved a Vision Zero Three Point Plan to reduce pedestrian fatalities to zero in the next ten years. Vehicle telematics, also known as black boxes or global positioning system (GPS) tracking, is viewed as an important tool to help the City achieve the goals of Vision Zero. Vehicle telematics allow the City to track vehicles individually and collect and report data on their location, history, speed, mechanical diagnostics, safety, and other information. According to the Budget and Legislative Analyst's February 2015 report on a citywide vehicle telematics system, vehicle telematics systems may help to correct and improve unsafe driving habits, reduce inappropriate use of City vehicles, and provide information to refute false claims against the City regarding vehicle accidents.

In June 2016, the Board of Supervisors approved an ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require the installation and use of telematics vehicle tracking systems in all motor vehicles owned or leased by the City (File No. 15-0682; Ordinance No. 101-16). The ordinance included an exemption for public safety and investigative vehicles, including Police, Fire, Sheriff, District Attorney, and the Public Defender. The ordinance also requires the submission of an annual report to the Board of Supervisors by the City Administrator on vehicle use based on data derived from those systems.

According to the February 2018 Telematics Report, telematics systems were installed in 4,163 vehicles, or 54 percent of the City's total vehicle fleet. Telematics systems still need to be installed in 74 vehicles. As the ordinance exempts certain vehicles, the systems were not installed in the remaining 3,506 vehicles in the City fleet, including the 1,683 public safety and investigative service vehicles and 1,823 pieces of equipment such as lawn mowers, carts, and forklifts exempt from this regulation.

According to a February 2017 Telematics report by department, of the 14 departments with take-home vehicles, the four that were within the number of take-home vehicles allocated in the Administrative Code also had telematics installed in their fleet vehicles, as shown in Table 3 below.

Table 3: Installation of Telematics and Conformance to Take-Home Vehicle Numbers Allocated in the Administrative Code in 14 City Departments

	Telematics without Exemptions?	Within Number in Administrative Code?
Airport*		
City Attorney*		
District Attorney*		
Emergency Management	√	√
Public Works	√	√
Fire*		
Municipal Transportation Agency*		
Police		
Police Accountability	√	√
Port	√	
Public Health	√	
Public Defender		
SFPUC	√	√
Sheriff*		

*These departments have telematics installed on some but not all vehicles.

Source: February 2017 Telematics report by department.

Annual Cost to the City for Take-Home Vehicles

This report estimates the annual cost to the City for take-home vehicles as the annual fuel cost of round trips to the employee residence, average annual maintenance costs of the vehicles, the average annual vehicle replacement cost, and the average annual costs of insurance claims. Of the 14 departments surveyed with take-home vehicles, the estimated annual cost to the City is approximately \$1,580,553, as shown in Table 4 below.

Table 4: Estimated Annual Cost to the City for Take-Home Vehicles

Department	Fuel Cost ^a	Maintenance Cost ^b	Vehicle Replacement Cost ^c	Insurance Claims ^d	Total
Airport	\$88,724	\$70,280	\$88,119	\$37,419	\$284,542
City Attorney	7,665	10,542	13,218	5,613	37,038
District Attorney	10,861	14,056	17,624	7,484	50,024
Public Works	5,781	17,570	22,030	9,355	54,736
Emergency Management	2,058	3,514	4,406	1,871	11,849
Fire	31,575	79,065	99,133	42,097	251,870
Municipal Transportation Agency	39,332	40,411	50,668	21,516	151,927
Police	94,198	82,579	103,539	43,968	324,284
Police Accountability	438	1,757	2,203	935	5,333
Port	2,102	1,757	2,203	935	6,997
Public Health	1,094	5,271	6,609	2,806	15,781
Public Defender	9,599	28,112	35,247	14,968	87,926
SFPUC	31,005	36,897	46,262	19,645	133,809
Sheriff	46,946	42,168	52,871	22,452	164,437
Total	\$371,378	\$433,979	\$544,132	\$231,064	\$1,580,553

^a Fuel cost calculated from the product of the number of take-home vehicles, the average round trip distance to the employee's stated residence, average miles per gallon of a San Francisco City passenger vehicle, and average fuel cost based on the California Energy Commission average weekly energy prices for 2018, accessed on November 1, 2018 https://www.energy.ca.gov/almanac/transportation_data/gasoline/retail_gasoline_prices2.html.

^b Maintenance cost calculated from the product of the average annual maintenance cost per vehicle, as provided by Fleet Management, multiplied by the number of take-home vehicles within that department.

^c Vehicle replacement cost calculated by dividing the average cost of a new replacement vehicle by the average life span of fleet vehicles, multiplied by the number of take-home vehicles.

^d Calculated using the average claim amount for all City vehicles (\$935.48) and the proportionate number of take-home vehicles reported by each the seven departments.

Conclusion and Policy Consideration

City departments surveyed by the Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office reported that they assign more than double the number of take-home vehicles than allocated in the City's Administrative Code. The Budget and Legislative Analyst's survey found that 14 City departments assigned 247 take-home vehicles, or 118 percent more than the 113 take-home vehicles allocated in the Administrative Code. The estimated annual cost to the City for these 14 departments' take-home vehicles is \$1.58 million.

Many of the take-home vehicle assignments do not conform to the Administrative Code. Several departments assign take-home vehicles to staff who must respond to incidents or emergencies after hours but departments broadly define this response requirement. While some City positions are required to be available to respond to any incident or emergency after-hours, other positions are only required to respond when they are specifically assigned to be on-call. However, some City departments assign take-home vehicles to staff

even when they are not specifically assigned to be on-call. For example, the Public Defender's Office assigns take-home vehicles to all 16 Public Defender investigators and senior investigators, and the City Attorney's Office assigns take-home vehicles to all six claims investigators.

Further, the City Administrator, who is assigned responsibility by the Administrative Code to approve take-home vehicles, requested department heads to monitor assignment of take-home vehicles to focus on public safety and emergency response. However, some City departments assign take-home vehicles to positions not specifically designated for emergency response. For example, the Airport assigns take-home vehicles to staff responsible for business, administrative, and communications; the Municipal Transportation Agency assigns take-home vehicles to staff responsible for parking and events; and the Police Department assigns take-home vehicle to staff responsible for risk management, community engagement and media relations.

The Administrative Code, which has not been revised since 2004, needs updating. The Code provides for the City Administrator to approve the assignment of take-home vehicles, but the City Administrator defines this responsibility as an information and coordination role, rather than an approval and enforcement role.

The Administrative Code also needs clarification on (1) which City departments are authorized to assign take-home vehicles, (2) the public safety and emergency response requirements justifying the permanent assignment of take-home vehicles, and (3) City departments' operational requirements justifying temporary assignment of take-home vehicles from a department vehicle pool.

The Board of Supervisors should request the City Administrator to recommend Administrative Code revisions to better align the Code with the City's practices and requirements. The City Administrator should also be requested to work with City departments to establish clear guidelines on the assignment of take-home vehicles on (1) a permanent basis to meet the City's public safety and emergency response requirements, and (2) temporary basis from a department vehicle pool to meet the department's operational requirements.

The assignment of take-home vehicles should be reviewed by the Mayor's Office of Policy & Finance and the Budget & Legislative Analyst's Office during the annual budget review. Any approval of requests for new or replacement vehicles by City departments should be contingent on detailed justification for take-home vehicles assigned on a permanent basis to meet the City's public safety and emergency response requirements, and on a temporary basis from a department vehicle pool to meet the department's operational requirements.