


**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
BUDGET AND LEGISLATIVE ANALYST**

1390 Market Street, Suite 1150, San Francisco, CA 94102
(415) 552-9292 FAX (415) 252-0461

Policy Analysis Report

To: Supervisor Gordon Mar
From: Budget and Legislative Analyst's Office 
Re: The Social and Economic Impact of City College of San Francisco
Date: October 14, 2020

Summary of Requested Action

Your office requested that we gather information and examine the potential social and economic impact of City College of San Francisco and of recent class schedule and program reductions. You requested that this social and economic impact report provide a summary of the causes of schedule reductions, and that we analyze the social and economic benefit of City College of San Francisco for both students and the City.

For further information about this report, contact Dan Goncher at dan.goncher@sfgov.org.

Project Staff: Dan Goncher, Linden Bairey, and Karrie Tam.

Executive Summary

Structural Deficit and Schedule Reductions

- City College of San Francisco (City College) faces a structural budget deficit. Costs related to the schedule, including the cost of facilities, faculty, staff, and other educational expenses, exceed the revenue City College receives from the state and other sources. Both declining enrollment and changes in the state funding formula, which now ties funding directly to student success, is projected to exacerbate the structural deficit by restricting revenues. In other words, City College's ongoing expenses, which are primarily for salaries and benefits, exceed ongoing revenues generated through full-time equivalent student counts and Student Centered Funding Formula metrics.
- From FY 2014-15 through FY 2016-17, the District's funding levels were artificially inflated by "stability funding" received from the state, which protects districts from sudden drops in full-time equivalent counts. Although the District was receiving higher funding, the number of students enrolling at City College continued to decrease, creating a larger discrepancy between the revenues City College was "earning" versus receiving. City College budgeted ongoing costs (primarily employee costs) based on the higher level of stability funding. When City College was no longer eligible for stability funding beginning in FY 2017-18, expenses exceeded revenues dramatically.

- Although City College adopted a balanced budget for FY 2019-20, the budget included the assumption of a significant reduction in spending on certificated and classified salaries. During the first quarter of FY 2019-20, City College projected a \$13 million deficit based on first quarter budget and actual spending, despite the adoption of the “balanced” budget.
- As part of its response to the projected deficit, City College made reductions to its Spring 2020 class schedule. City College identified the classes that would be eliminated by prioritizing classes that lead to completions, graduations, and transfers to four-year degree programs, which informs the student success allocation of the Student Centered Funding Formula. City College also considered additional factors when developing its class schedule, including historical enrollment and enrollment trends, student success rates (i.e. program completion and graduation), and the impact on faculty.
- According to data provided by City College, 345 credit and noncredit classes were eliminated for Spring 2020. Credit classes were eliminated from a total of 32 departments. The Physical Education and Dance, Art, and Music Departments have the most eliminated classes. Noncredit classes were eliminated from a total of eight departments, primarily in the Older Adults Department.
- In order to ensure full-time faculty were assigned full-time course loads, City College reduced teaching assignments for part-time faculty for the Spring 2020 class schedule. No full-time faculty were impacted by the Spring 2020 reductions. According to data provided by City College, the part-time faculty headcount was reduced by 71, or approximately 10.4 percent, from 685 in Fall 2019 to 614 in Spring 2020.
- The economic position of City College is closely tied to the economic position of California: state apportionments and property taxes allocated to City College’s Unrestricted General Fund represented approximately 74 percent of City College’s total unrestricted revenues in FY 2018-19. Although City College is projected to receive the same level of revenue from the state in FY 2020-21 through FY 2023-24 based on the State Chancellor’s Student Centered Funding Formula Hold Harmless agreement, property tax revenues, particularly commercial property tax revenues, may affect levels of local funding. As a result, in addition to its financial condition described above, City College will likely face additional financial constraints in future years due to COVID-19.

Economic Benefits of City College

- City College serves a diverse student body population. Notably, Latino/a students are more represented in City College’s student body (27 percent) compared to the overall demographics of San Francisco (15 percent). One-third of City College students are youth 24 years old and younger, and 20 percent are students 50 years old and older.
- Students who transfer from City College to a four-year degree program and earn a college degree likely experience a wide array of economic benefits. A college degree is associated with substantially higher earnings and non-wage benefits like health insurance, and

workers with a bachelor's degree typically have a lower unemployment rate compared to workers with a high school diploma. College graduates are more likely to own a house, are less likely to live in poverty or be in need of safety net resources, have lower mortality rates, are more likely to have long-lasting marriages, and are more likely to be civically engaged.

- Students who complete City College's career education and vocational programs also likely experience economic benefits. Research has found that students who earn a career education credential have increased earnings, and health career education programs have by far and away the highest returns, particularly for associate degrees.
- City College's English as a Second Language (ESL) Department offers both credit and noncredit ESL programs and the associated benefits of English proficiency. According to 2014-2018 American Community Survey Five-Year Estimates, 43 percent of San Francisco residents speak a language other than English at home, and 20 percent of San Francisco residents speak a language other than English at home and speak English less than "very well." Research has consistently shown that acquiring higher levels of English proficiency improves labor market outcomes.
- Class offerings in City College's Older Adults Department provide opportunities for lifelong learning, health and wellness, and socialization, with related benefits for retired adults. The Older Adults Department offers noncredit classes specially designed for adults 55 and older across several different disciplines, including computers, the arts, and health and wellness. The majority of students enrolled in the Older Adults Department are retirees. The majority of noncredit students enrolled in the Older Adults Department cite their goals for enrollment as something other than improving job skills or language skills.
- There is a strong generational relationship between parents' and children's income levels and educational attainment. Education is critical to upward generational mobility: a greater percentage of adult children with college degrees exceed their parents' income than those without a college degree. A college education also helps to level the playing field: upon graduation, low-income and first-generation college students have similar labor market outcomes as their peers.
- Individuals with higher levels of education benefit San Francisco by paying more in taxes and by relying less on the social safety net. Higher education levels confer better labor market and social outcomes. Increases in individual education levels result in an increase in tax payments, and research has found that earning a bachelor's degree or more rather than completing only some college has the largest impact on tax payments.
- Individuals with higher education levels require less corrections and law enforcement spending. An increase in education levels reduces the costs of the criminal justice system and eases the demand for increased capacity in state prisons and county/municipal jails.

Policy Options

The Board of Supervisors could:

1. Explore additional opportunities to provide local funding to City College of San Francisco to reduce its structural budget deficit and in order to ensure that the City of San Francisco continues to benefit from its economic and social contributions.

Background on City College of San Francisco and Funding

City College of San Francisco (City College) is the public community college district in San Francisco. City College has one main campus and multiple centers located across San Francisco and offers courses in more than 50 academic programs and over 100 occupational disciplines. The College is accredited by the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges.

City College offers credit courses that are applicable to an Associate in Arts or Associate in Science degree, as well as credit courses that are transferrable to a four-year college or university. City College also offers career and technical education programs, which are occupational training programs designed to qualify students for entry-level employment, to help students build or upgrade their skills, and to prepare students for external certification or credentialing in certain fields. City College also offers noncredit courses in subjects such as English as a Second Language (ESL) and various adult education classes (e.g., art for older adults, health education). Finally, City College offers programs for high school students, high school equivalency test (GED/HiSET) preparation, and online learning opportunities.

Free tuition to City College is available to credit students who have established California residency and live in San Francisco through the Free City College Program, also known as “Free City.” The Free City College Program is funded by the City via the City College of San Francisco Enrollment Fee Assistance Fund.

City College Student Headcount and Demographics

Between academic years 2009-10 and 2018-19, the overall annual headcount¹ of enrolled City College students declined by 31.4 percent, from 91,592 to 62,841 students. The credit headcount, which includes students enrolled in a credit class, declined by 22.2 percent, and the noncredit headcount, which includes students with at least eight hours of attendance in a noncredit class, declined more significantly by 44.2 percent. Exhibit 1 below shows the overall student headcount, as well as headcount broken out by credit and noncredit, at City College from 2009-10 to 2018-19.

¹ Annual student headcount represents the number of individuals who take a class at City College at some point during an academic year. The overall headcount number counts each student only once, whether enrolled in credit, noncredit, or both.

Exhibit 1: Annual Student Headcount from 2009-10 to 2018-19

Academic Year	Overall Headcount	% Change in Overall Headcount	Credit Headcount	% Change in Credit Headcount	Noncredit Headcount	% Change in Noncredit Headcount
2009-10	91,592	N/A	52,805	N/A	41,672	N/A
2010-11	83,718	-8.6%	48,287	-8.6%	38,016	-8.8%
2011-12	83,401	-0.4%	49,568	2.7%	36,377	-4.3%
2012-13	73,359	-12.0%	42,912	-13.4%	32,725	-10.0%
2013-14	67,545	-7.9%	39,240	-8.6%	30,085	-8.1%
2014-15	61,782	-8.5%	36,181	-7.8%	27,223	-9.5%
2015-16	60,139	-2.7%	36,262	0.2%	25,500	-6.3%
2016-17	58,239	-3.2%	35,026	-3.4%	24,505	-3.9%
2017-18	63,039	8.2%	40,313	15.1%	24,175	-1.3%
2018-19	62,841	-0.3%	41,058	1.8%	23,272	-3.7%

Source: City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, "Fact Sheet: Annual Headcount," September 2019.

Among the overall student population enrolled at City College during the 2018-19 academic year, the most prevalent racial/ethnic groups identified are Asian (32.3 percent), Latino (27.1 percent), and white (19.1 percent). The least prevalent racial/ethnic groups identified are American Indian/Alaskan Native (0.2 percent), Pacific Islander (0.6 percent) and two or more races (4 percent). These patterns were the same for students enrolled in credit or noncredit classes at City College. The percentage of City College headcount by student ethnicity group for academic year 2018-19 is shown in Exhibit 2 below.

Exhibit 2: Percentage of City College Student Headcount by Student Ethnicity Group (2018-19)

Student Ethnicity Group	Overall Student Pct N = 62,841	Credit Student Pct N = 41,058	Noncredit Student Pct N = 23,272
American Indian/Alaska Native	0.2%	0.2%	0.1%
Asian	32.3%	28.6%	39.5%
Black or African American	6.0%	7.3%	3.7%
Filipino	4.3%	5.7%	1.7%
Latino	27.1%	25.2%	30.4%
Pacific Islander	0.6%	0.7%	0.3%
Two or more races	4.0%	5.7%	0.9%
White	19.1%	24.0%	10.1%
Unknown	6.5%	2.5%	13.3%

Source: City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, "Fact Sheet: Student Demographics," September 2019.

Among the overall student population enrolled at City College during the 2018-19 academic year, nearly half (49.2 percent) of students are younger than 29, and

approximately 12 percent are older than 60. For students enrolled in credit classes, over half (59.1 percent) of students are younger than 29, while approximately four percent are older than 60. However, students enrolled in noncredit classes skew older than students enrolled in credit classes: 50 percent of noncredit students are older than 40, with a little over a quarter (25.9 percent) of students older than 60. The percentage of City College student headcount by age group for academic year 2018-19 is shown in Exhibit 3 below.

Exhibit 3: Percentage of City College Student Headcount by Age Group (2018-19)

Student Age Group	Overall Student Pct N = 62,841	Credit Student Pct N = 41,058	Noncredit Student Pct N = 23,272
19 or younger	15.4%	16.9%	13.1%
20 – 24	18.2%	23.2%	9.0%
25 – 29	15.6%	19.0%	9.4%
30 – 34	11.5%	12.8%	9.4%
35 – 39	8.1%	8.0%	8.4%
40 – 49	10.7%	9.5%	13.1%
50 – 59	8.0%	6.4%	11.0%
60 – 69	6.5%	3.2%	12.4%
70 and older	5.6%	1.1%	13.5%

Source: City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, “Fact Sheet: Student Demographics,” September 2019. Percentages may not total 100.0% due to rounding and students of unknown age.

City College Funding and Financial Position

As shown in Exhibit 4 below, City College’s largest expense is salaries and benefits, which totaled \$245 million in FY 2018-19,² followed by supplies and maintenance (\$36 million). Its largest revenue source is the apportionment it receives from the state (\$96 million), followed by federal, state, and local grants and contracts (\$52 million).

The state allocates funding to community college districts based on the Student Centered Funding Formula (SCFF). The SCFF determines the total funds for a district based on three calculations:

- 1) A base allocation, which largely reflects enrollment.

² Salaries and benefits expenses vary between the years presented in Exhibit 4 due to early retirement payouts. During the 2016-17 year, the District adopted a one-time Supplemental Early Retirement Plan (SERP) for full-time faculty who were employed by the District as of December 15, 2016. In exchange for early retirement, the District contributed 65 percent of the 2016-2017 actual paid step/column salary. The District had 57 employees who enrolled in the 2016-2017 SERP. During the 2018-19 year, the District adopted a one-time SERP for full-time faculty, part-time faculty, classified personnel and administrators. In exchange for early retirement, the District contributed 65 percent of the 2018-19 base salary. The District had 197 employees who enrolled in the 2018-19 SERP.

- 2) A supplemental allocation based on the numbers of students receiving a College Promise Grant, students receiving a Pell Grant and students covered by AB 540.³
- 3) A student success allocation based on outcomes that include the number of students earning associate degrees and credit certificates, the number of students transferring to four-year colleges and universities, the number of students who complete transfer-level math and English within their first year, the number of students who complete nine or more career education units and the number of students who have attained the regional living wage.

The state also allocates funds through categorical programs, which have different allocation formulas and restrictions. City College receives additional revenue from other sources including local property taxes, local sales tax, and enrollment fees and tuition.

³ AB 540 allows access to in-state tuition rates for undocumented and other eligible students at California's public colleges and universities.

**Exhibit 4: City College of San Francisco Revenues, Expenses, and Changes in Net Position,
FY 2016-17 – 2018-19**

Operating Revenues	FY 2016-17	FY 2017-18	FY 2018-19	Pct. Change (FY 2017 - 19)
Tuition and fees	18,447,803	22,120,047	21,918,599	18.8%
Federal, State, and local grants and contracts	41,791,527	47,053,276	51,761,440	23.9%
Other operating revenues	168,185	-	-	-100.0%
<i>Total Operating Revenues</i>	<i>60,407,515</i>	<i>69,173,323</i>	<i>73,680,039</i>	<i>22.0%</i>
Operating Expenses				
Salaries and benefits	247,149,867	189,415,024	245,134,455	-0.8%
Supplies and maintenance	38,366,054	34,357,133	36,125,816	-5.8%
Student financial aid	20,778,801	19,429,829	19,927,016	-4.1%
Depreciation	26,590,982	23,814,941	22,647,532	-14.8%
<i>Total Operating Expenses</i>	<i>332,885,704</i>	<i>267,016,927</i>	<i>323,834,819</i>	<i>-2.7%</i>
Nonoperating Revenues and (Expenses)				
State apportionments	71,073,818	62,764,880	96,394,334	35.6%
Local property taxes	82,240,443	53,941,275	26,467,079	-67.8%
Taxes levied for debt service	28,762,068	30,268,594	27,017,007	-6.1%
Taxes levied for other specific purposes	15,281,673	19,000,394	20,190,456	32.1%
Local sales tax	15,254,074	14,421,447	15,285,632	0.2%
Federal and State financial aid grants	18,847,725	17,772,672	17,780,031	-5.7%
Other State revenue	4,211,250	4,425,978	5,981,031	42.0%
Investment income	1,283,696	1,338,926	3,465,806	170.0%
Interest expense on capital related debt	(2,315,919)	(9,915,701)	(9,215,566)	297.9%
Transfer to fiduciary funds	(296,841)	(93,340)	(65,280)	-78.0%
Transfer from fiduciary funds	70,127	520	-	-100.0%
Other nonoperating revenues	1,897,572	8,546,095	1,814,212	-4.4%
<i>Total Nonoperating Revenues (Expenses)</i>	<i>236,309,686</i>	<i>202,471,740</i>	<i>205,114,742</i>	<i>-13.2%</i>
Other Revenues				
State grant and contracts	4,330,659	2,008,426	3,189,272	-26.4%
Local property taxes and revenues	4,024,868	-	582,385	-85.5%
Apportionment repayment	19,037,039	-	-	-100.0%
<i>Total Other Revenues</i>	<i>27,392,566</i>	<i>2,008,426</i>	<i>3,771,657</i>	<i>-86.2%</i>
CHANGE IN NET POSITION	(8,775,937)	6,636,562	(41,268,381)	-370.2%

Source: San Francisco Community College District Annual Financial Reports for FY 2016-17, FY 2017-18, and FY 2018-19.

City College’s Structural Budget Concerns

As can be seen in Exhibit 4 above, City College faces a structural budget deficit. According to the City College Office of the Chancellor, costs related to the schedule, including the cost of facilities, faculty, staff, and other educational expenses, exceed

the revenue City College receives from the state and other sources. Both declining enrollment (as mentioned above, between academic years 2009-10 and 2018-19, the overall annual headcount of enrolled City College students declined by 31.4 percent) and changes in the state funding formula, which now ties funding directly to student success, have exacerbated the structural deficit by restricting revenues. In other words, City College's ongoing expenses, which are primarily for salaries and benefits, exceed ongoing revenues generated through full-time equivalent student (FTES) counts and Student Centered Funding Formula metrics.

As stated in Finding 2019-001 in the FY 2018-19 Annual Financial Report, in FY 2018-19 City College's Unrestricted General Fund expenditures and other financing uses exceeded its revenues and other financing sources by \$13.98 million. This deficit represented 58 percent of City College's beginning fund balance. City College ended FY 2018-19 with \$363,727 in spendable available reserves comprised of unassigned balances held in the Unrestricted General Fund. This amount represented 0.20 percent of the District's total expenditures and financing uses. The minimum prudent Unrestricted General Fund balance is five percent for community colleges.⁴

Note 16 of City College's FY 2018-19 Annual Financial Report outlines the concerns related to City College's deficit spending, declining Unrestricted General Fund balance, and overall financial condition. During FY 2014-15 through FY 2016-17, the District's funding levels were artificially inflated by "stability funding" received from the state, which protects districts from sudden drops in full-time equivalent student (FTES) counts. Although the District was receiving higher funding, the number of FTES enrolling at City College continued to decrease, creating a larger discrepancy between the revenues City College was "earning" versus receiving. City College budgeted ongoing costs (primarily employee costs) based on the higher level of stability funding. When City College was no longer eligible for stability funding beginning in FY 2017-18, expenses exceeded revenues dramatically.

An additional concern related to City College's future financial stability is its "hold harmless" designation under the Student Centered Funding Formula, which provided revenue continuity for its funding levels in FY 2018-19 but masks some future budgetary concerns. The hold harmless provision of the Student Centered Funding Formula ensures that no community college district receives less than it received in FY 2017-18, adjusted for inflation. In other words, City College's "earned" revenues FY 2018-19, based on the Student Centered Funding Formula, were less

⁴ Pursuant to Education Code Section 84040, the Board of Governors is required to adopt criteria and standards for the periodic assessment of the fiscal condition of California community college districts. The main criterion for this assessment is the percentage of Unrestricted General Fund balance to all expenditures and other outgo of Unrestricted General Fund. The established minimum prudent Unrestricted General Fund balance reserve of five percent for community colleges is considered necessary to ease cash flow problems, to deal with unexpected cost increases, and to address other fiscal uncertainties.

than what the District actually received in FY 2018-19 under the hold harmless provision. Senate Bill No. 116, the Postsecondary education trailer bill to the Governor's FY 2020-21 main budget bills, extended the hold harmless provision for community college districts for additional years.⁵ However, upon expiration of the hold harmless provision, City College revenues will be based on earned revenue calculated under the Student Centered Funding Formula, which may be significantly less than the hold harmless funding levels the District received in FY 2018-19.

In addition to (a) the heavy deficit spending within the Unrestricted General Fund and (b) the decline in revenues due to the loss of stability funding and decline in FTES, City College's budgeting practices and multiple physical locations have also contributed to its financial uncertainty. In FY 2018-19, actual revenues fell below the budgeted FY 2018-19 amounts, which were projected assuming a significant increase in full-time equivalent students that did not occur. And although City College adopted a balanced budget for FY 2019-20, the budget included the assumption of a 16.4 percent reduction in spending on certificated and classified salaries. As noted in the notes to the 2018-19 Annual Financial Report, a personnel reduction of this size will be difficult to accomplish within one year. During the first quarter of FY 2019-20, City College projected a \$13 million deficit based on first quarter budget and actual spending, despite the adoption of the "balanced" budget. In each of these fiscal years, City College's budget was based on unrealistic expectations of either revenue increases or expenditure decreases.

Finally, although it is officially a single-campus community college district, City College maintains multiple physical locations. The credit FTES are concentrated at the main Ocean Campus, while noncredit FTES are distributed across the centers. Three of the locations—the Airport, Fort Mason, and Southeast centers—served fewer than 200 FTES each in 2018-19.⁶ These centers incur administrative, operating, and maintenance costs with little to no ongoing revenue generation.

As noted in the Management's Discussion and Analysis in City College's FY 2018-19 Annual Financial Report, the economic position of City College is closely tied to the economic position of California, because state apportionments and property taxes allocated to City College's Unrestricted General Fund represent approximately 74 percent of City College's total unrestricted revenues.⁷ As a result, the condition of

⁵ Prior to Senate Bill No. 116, existing law established hold harmless provisions to ensure a minimum level of funding to community college districts for the fiscal years 2018–19 to 2021–22, inclusive, and included provisions to allocate different apportionments to the San Francisco Community College District through the 2023–24 fiscal year. Senate Bill No. 116 extended both the hold harmless provisions and the specified apportionments for the San Francisco Community College District for two additional fiscal years, through FY 2023-24 and FY 2025-26, respectively.

⁶ City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, "Fact Sheet: Full Time Equivalent Students by Center," September 2019.

⁷ The balance of City College's unrestricted revenues in FY 2018-19 comes primarily from tuitions (11 percent), local sales tax (9 percent), lottery (3 percent), and other revenues (3 percent).

California's economy has significant impact on City College's financial condition. Although City College is projected to receive the same level of revenue from the state in FY 2020-21 through FY 2023-24 based on the State Chancellor's Student Centered Funding Formula Hold Harmless agreement, property tax revenues, particularly commercial property tax revenues, may affect levels of local funding. As a result, in addition to its financial condition described above, City College will likely face additional financial constraints in FY 2020-21 and beyond due to COVID-19.

Class Schedule and Program Reductions

In November 2019, City College projected a \$13 million deficit and \$3 million reserve deficit in FY 2019-20, based on first quarter budget and actual spending. As part of its response to the projected deficit, City College made reductions to its Spring 2020 class schedule to close the deficit gap.⁸ City College identified the classes that would be eliminated by prioritizing classes that lead to completions, graduations, and transfers to four-year degree programs, which informs the student success allocation of the Student Centered Funding Formula. City College also considered additional factors when developing its class schedule, including historical enrollment and enrollment trends, student success rates (i.e. program completion and graduation), and the impact on faculty.

Major Groups of Eliminated Spring 2020 Credit and Noncredit Classes

According to data provided by City College, 345 credit and noncredit classes were eliminated for Spring 2020. This includes 281 credit and 64 noncredit classes. Credit classes were eliminated from a total of 32 departments: the Physical Education and Dance, Art, and Music departments have the most eliminated classes. Exhibit 5 below shows the departments with the most eliminated credit classes for Spring 2020. Appendix A details the full list of eliminated credit and noncredit classes.

**Exhibit 5: Top Five Departments with the Most Eliminated Credit Classes,
Spring 2020**

Department	Number of Eliminated Classes	Percent of Total (n = 281)
Physical Education and Dance	44	15.7%
Art	43	15.3%
Music	31	11.0%
Engineering and Technology	22	7.8%
World Languages and Cultures	18	6.4%

Source: City College of San Francisco.

⁸ In addition to schedule reductions, City College also transferred funds from the Unrestricted Fund and reduced spending on administrators and consulting services.

For noncredit classes, the Older Adults Department had the majority of eliminated classes (78.1 percent), followed by Health Education (6.3 percent). Noncredit classes were eliminated from a total of eight departments. Exhibit 6 below shows the departments with the most eliminated noncredit classes for Spring 2020.

**Exhibit 6: Top Five Departments with the Most Eliminated Noncredit Classes,
Spring 2020**

Department	Number of Eliminated Classes	Percent of Total (n = 64)
Older Adults	50	78.1%
Health Education	4	6.3%
Health Care Technology	3	4.7%
Fashion	2	3.1%
Women's and Gender Studies	2	3.1%

Source: City College of San Francisco.

Part-Time Faculty Assignment Reductions

In order to ensure full-time faculty were assigned full-time course loads, City College reduced teaching assignments for part-time faculty for the Spring 2020 class schedule. No full-time faculty were impacted by the Spring 2020 reductions. According to data provided by City College, the part-time faculty headcount reduced by 71, or approximately 10.4 percent, from 685 in Fall 2019 to 614 in Spring 2020. The Older Adults Department had the most reductions in the Spring 2020 part-time faculty headcount, which is consistent with this department having the majority of eliminated noncredit classes. However, the English as a Second Language Department had the second highest part-time faculty headcount reduction, despite having only one credit class eliminated. City College stated that not all the part-time faculty reductions are due to schedule reductions (for example, a decrease in part-time faculty could indicate that an individual was hired full time, instead). Exhibit 7 below shows the departments with the most part-time faculty headcount reductions for Spring 2020.

**Exhibit 7: Top Five Departments with the Most Part-Time Faculty Headcount
Reductions for Spring 2020**

Department	Fall 2019	Spring 2020	Number of Reductions
Older Adults	18	4	14
English as a Second Language	82	69	13
Art	20	10	10
Music	16	9	7
World Languages and Culture ⁹	17	11	6

Source: City College of San Francisco.

Economic Benefits of City College

The second half of this report is focused on the importance of community colleges and the economic and social benefits that City College provides its students and the City of San Francisco.

To assess the economic benefits that City College of San Francisco provides, we assess (1) the benefits to the students themselves, and (2) the related benefits for the City of San Francisco. We rely on data and reports produced by City College and published by the State Chancellor’s Office, as well as academic research on the benefits of community college degrees and the relationship between education and income and other outcomes. In particular, the Public Policy Institute of California (PPIC), which conducts high-quality independent research and provides information for policymakers, has produced numerous recent studies on the economic implications of higher education and the social and economic impact of community colleges in California. This section relies heavily on the economic work conducted by PPIC and the RAND Corporation, which we have supplemented with information specific to City College of San Francisco.

Our main findings are summarized below.

- **City College serves a diverse student body population.** PPIC research has shown that California community colleges and the California State University (CSU) have higher shares of low-income and first-generation college students than the University of California or private nonprofit colleges. The student populations at community colleges and CSU are also more reflective of the racial and ethnic composition of high school graduates in the state. At City College, the total student headcount is 32 percent Asian, 27 percent Latino/a, and six percent Black or African American. One-third (33 percent) are youth

⁹ The Engineering and Technology (Weld) department also had six part-time faculty headcount reductions.

24 years old and younger, and 20 percent are students 50 years old and older. In comparison, according to American Community Survey 2018 5-Year Estimates,¹⁰ San Francisco's population is approximately 38 percent Asian, 15 percent Hispanic or Latino,¹¹ and six percent Black or African American; 21 percent are age 24 and younger, and 24 percent are age 55 and older. Notably, Latino/a students are more represented in City College's student body (27 percent) compared to the overall demographics of San Francisco. (15 percent).

- **Students who transfer from City College to a four-year degree program and earn a college degree likely experience a wide array of economic benefits.** A college degree is associated with substantially higher earnings, based upon research done by PPIC: in California, the typical full-time year-round worker with a high school diploma earns \$36,000, while the typical worker with at least a bachelor's degree earns \$81,000. Between 1990 and 2017, adjusted for inflation, median earnings increased by 19 percent for workers with at least a bachelor's degree, but decreased by 15 percent for those with only a high school diploma. In addition to wage gains, workers with at least a bachelor's degree typically receive non-wage benefits like vacation, health insurance, or retirement and have a lower unemployment rate compared to workers with a high school diploma. College graduates are more likely to own a house, are less likely to live in poverty or be in need of safety net resources, have lower mortality rates, are more likely to have long-lasting marriages, and are more likely to be civically engaged.
- **Students who complete City College's career education and vocational programs likely also experience economic benefits.** PPIC research found that for students who earned their first career education credential between 2003 and 2010, subsequent earnings increased by 20 percent above what students likely would have earned without the credential. The PPIC also found that two years after obtaining a career education credential, 60 percent of students earn at least middle-income wages,¹² and that after six years, 76 percent do. Health career education programs have by far and away the highest returns, particularly for associate degrees: students whose first award is a health associate degree earn 138 percent more in the six years following their graduation than they would have without the degree.
- **City College's English as a Second Language (ESL) Department offers both credit and noncredit ESL programs and the associated benefits of English**

¹⁰ 2018: ACS 5-Year Estimates Data Profiles, Table DP05.

¹¹ City College's demographic reports use "Latino/a" while the U.S. Census uses "Hispanic or Latino."

¹² PPIC defines middle income as between 200 and 700 percent of the regional poverty threshold.

proficiency. According to 2014-2018 American Community Survey Five-Year Estimates, 43 percent of San Francisco residents speak a language other than English at home, and 20 percent of San Francisco residents speak a language other than English at home and speak English less than “very well.”¹³ Research has consistently shown that acquiring higher levels of English proficiency improves labor market outcomes. Some ESL students need English skills to progress towards degrees, certificates, or transfers to four-year colleges, while others enroll in classes to improve job prospects or for personal reasons. Whatever the reason, the English as a Second Language program at City College, both credit and noncredit, offers students the opportunity to access higher-paying jobs that require English skills, to transfer to a four-year college or earn their Associates degrees, and overall to improve their labor market outcomes.

- **Class offerings in City College’s Older Adults Department provide opportunities for lifelong learning, health and wellness, and socialization, with related benefits for retired adults.** The Older Adults Department offers noncredit classes specially designed for adults 55 and over across several different disciplines, including computers, the arts, and health and wellness, and the majority of students enrolled in the Older Adults Department are retirees. The majority of noncredit students enrolled in the Older Adults Department cite their goals for enrollment as something other than improving job skills or language skills.
- **There is a strong generational relationship between parents’ and children’s income levels and educational attainment.** Education is critical to upward generational mobility: a greater percentage of adult children with college degrees exceed their parents’ income than those without a college degree. Children born in the lowest income quintile have a 45 percent chance of remaining there if they do not have a college degree, but with a college degree, children born in the bottom quintile have less than a 20 percent change of remaining there. A college education also helps to level the playing field: upon graduation, low-income and first-generation college students have similar labor market outcomes as their peers.
- **Individuals with higher levels of education benefit San Francisco by paying more in taxes and by relying less on the social safety net.** Higher education levels confer better labor market and social outcomes. Results from a study by the RAND Corporation show that increases in individual education levels result in a substantial increase in tax payments, and that earning a bachelor’s degree or more rather than completing only some college has the largest

¹³ American Community Survey 2014-18 Five-Year Estimates, Table DP02.

impact on tax payments (followed by graduating high school rather than dropping out).

- **Individuals with higher education levels require less corrections and law enforcement spending.** An increase in education levels reduces the costs of the criminal justice system and eases the demand for increased capacity in state prisons and county/municipal jails.

More details on each of the points above are provided in the following sections of this report.

Economic benefit for students

City College of San Francisco offers degree, credit certificate, and non-credit certificate courses of study. The degree programs include Associate in Arts (AA) and Associate in Science (AS) degrees, as well as the Associate in Arts for Transfer (AA-T) and Associate in Science for Transfer (AA-S). The associate degrees for transfer are designed to provide a clear pathway to a California State University (CSU) major and baccalaureate degree, and students who are awarded an associate degree for transfer from City College are guaranteed admission with junior standing somewhere in the CSU system. City College students can also take advantage of the Transfer Admission Degree, which offers guaranteed admission to six of the University of California (UC) campuses.

The two types of credit certificates are the Certificate of Achievement, which is a sequence of courses usually consisting of 16 or more units of degree-applicable coursework that has been approved by the State Chancellor's Office, and the Certificate of Accomplishment, which is a sequence of courses consisting of fewer than 16 units of degree-applicable coursework. City College also offers noncredit certificates, which prepare students for entry-level employment or further study.

In addition, City College provides an opportunity for adults to earn the CCSF High School Diploma in the Transitional Studies Department.¹⁴ The Transitional Studies Department also prepares students to take the GED examination or the High School Equivalency Test (HiSET).

In the annual 2018-2019 term, 3,306 City College students earned a total of 4,546 degrees or certificates (some students earn more than one credential). Exhibits 8 and 9 below show the annual count of students receiving a degree or certificate by award type, and the annual count of awards granted by award type.

¹⁴ The program is also open to concurrently enrolled high school students who are in the 11th or 12th grades and who require high school credits to transfer to their home high schools.

Exhibit 8: Annual count students receiving a degree or certificate, 2018-19

Type of award	2018-19 student count
Degree	1,194
Certificate of Achievement	1,179
Certificate of Accomplishment	928
Noncredit certificate	301
High school diploma	103
Total students	3,306

Source: City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, "Fact Sheet: Degrees and Certificates," January 2020.

Exhibit 9: Annual count of awards granted by award type, 2018-19

Type of award	2018-19 award count
Associate in Arts	268
Associate in Science	1,078
Associate in Arts for Transfer	205
Associate in Science for Transfer	183
Certificate of Achievement	1,296
Certificate of Accomplishment	1,104
Noncredit certificate	309
High school diploma	103
Total awards	4,546

Source: City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, "Fact Sheet: Degrees and Certificates," January 2020.

Economic benefits of transfer to four-year degree programs

As mentioned above, the associate degrees for transfer offered by City College are designed to provide a clear pathway to a California State University (CSU) or University of California (UC) major and baccalaureate degree. Students who are awarded an associate degree for transfer from City College are guaranteed admission with junior standing somewhere in the CSU or UC system. City College awarded fewer associate for transfer degrees than other associate degrees in 2018-19; however, analysis of academic characteristics for students who transfer from City College into a four-year college or university shows that most students transfer without earning a City College degree. Exhibit 10 below displays selected information related to students who transferred in academic years 2016-17 and 2017-18.

**Exhibit 10: Transfer destination and City College degree earned by students
 transferring in 2016-17 and 2017-18**

College/university	Students	Type of degree earned	Students
California State University	1,842	Associate for Transfer (ADT)	224
University of California	631	Associate degree	642
California private	307	Both Associate degree and ADT	133
Out-of-state public	298	Transfer with no degree	2,280
Out-of-state private	201		
Total	3,279	Total	3,279

Source: City College of San Francisco Office of Research and Planning, Research Brief, March 2019.

The economic benefits of a college degree, and therefore the economic benefits of City College’s CSU transfers, are significant. An October 2019 report from the Public Policy Institute of California’s Higher Education Center, “Higher Education in California: Meeting California’s Workforce Needs,” summarizes the benefits of a college degree:

- By 2030, the PPIC projects that 40 percent of jobs in California will require at least a bachelor’s degree.
- A college degree is associated with substantially higher earnings: in California, the typical full-time year-round worker with a high school diploma earns \$36,000, while the typical worker with at least a bachelor’s degree earns \$81,000.
- Wages have increased more for workers with a college or advanced degree: between 1990 and 2017, adjusted for inflation, median earnings increased by 19 percent for workers with at least a bachelor’s degree, but decreased by 15 percent for those with only a high school diploma.
- In addition to wage gains, workers with at least a bachelor’s degree typically receive non-wage benefits like vacation, health insurance, or retirement and have a lower unemployment rate compared to workers with a high school diploma.
- College graduates are more likely to own a house and are less likely to live in poverty or be in need of safety net resources.
- College graduates have lower mortality rates and are more likely to have long-lasting marriages and be civically engaged.

The PPIC also concludes that because the student population at community colleges better reflects California’s economic and demographic diversity, continuation and expansion of community college transfer pathways will ensure that more low-income, first-generation, and other underrepresented students have access to a four-year

degree. A separate PPIC report, “Higher Education as a Driver of Economic Mobility” (Dec. 2018), emphasizes that economic progress for families and individuals is closely tied to improvements in educational attainment, and that society overall also benefits due to lower unemployment and poverty rates, less demand for public assistance programs, lower incarceration rates, higher tax revenue, and greater civic engagement. These gains to society will be discussed later on in this report.

Economic benefits of career education programs

Career education programs, also known as career technical or vocational programs, train students for middle-skill jobs that typically require more experience than a high school diploma but less training than a four-year degree. These programs consist of specialized occupational training designed to qualify students for entry-level employment, help students build or upgrade skills in fields in which they have prior experience or training, and prepare students for external certification or credentialing in certain fields.

Students who complete City College of San Francisco career education programs earn associate degrees (for example, an associate degree in Registered Nursing), credit certificates of achievement or accomplishment, or noncredit certificates.

Exhibit 11 below shows City College’s career education programs with the following career options.

Exhibit 11: Career education programs and career options at City College

Arts, media, and entertainment	Art director, digital illustrator, game developer, graphic designer, fashion designer, florist, interior designer, multimedia journalist, photographer, radio/television broadcaster, sound engineer, special effects artist, video producer
Building and construction trades	Architect, building maintenance worker, construction carpenter, construction laborer, construction manager, HVAC and refrigeration technician, janitor, landscape designer, landscape manager, residential plumber
Business and finance	Accountant, administrative assistant, customer service representative, financial analyst, hotel manager, human resources manager, marketing manager, paralegal, real estate agent, restaurant manager, retail manager
Education, public and social services	Community health worker, firefighter, health educator, human services assistance, nutrition assistant, paralegal, paramedic, police officer, post-prison health worker, pre-school teacher, special education teacher, youth worker
Healthcare	Community health worker, dental assistant, emergency medical technician, healthcare interpreter, health information technologist, licensed vocational nurse, medical assistant, medical biller, nutrition assistant, paramedic, phlebotomist, radiologic technologist, registered nurse
Information technology and computer science	Business information worker, computer network support specialist, computer technician, computer user support specialist, database developer, information security analyst, network administrator, technical support specialist, web developer
Liberal studies	Broad knowledge of arts and sciences
Culinary, retail, and hospitality	Baker, catering manager, chef, guest services manager, event planner, florist, front office manager, pastry chef, restaurant manager, retail buyer, retail manager, tour guide, travel agent, visual merchandiser
Science, technology, engineering, and mathematics	Aircraft maintenance technologist, Android app programmer, architect, autobody painter and refinisher, automotive mechanic, biomanufacturing technician, biotechnologist, computer scientist, computer technician, geographical information systems technician, information security analyst, Linux administrator, motorcycle mechanic, network security analyst
Transportation	Aircraft powerplant maintenance technician, airframe maintenance technician, autobody painter and refinisher, automotive diagnostician, automotive hybrid and EV technician, brake and suspension specialist, engine repair specialist, motorcycle mechanic, transmission specialist

Source: City College of San Francisco.

A report published by the Public Policy Institute of California (PPIC) in 2019 (“Career Pathways and Economic Mobility at California’s Community Colleges”) found that for students who earned their first career education credential between 2003 and 2010, subsequent earnings increased by 20 percent above what students likely would have earned without the credential. PPIC found that two years after obtaining a career education credential, 60 percent of students earn at least middle-income wages,¹⁵ and that after six years, 76 percent do. The earnings gain varies by the type of credential earned:

- On average, students whose first award is an associate degree, which requires at minimum two years of training, see a 32 percent increase in earnings after their first credential, compared to what they would have earned without it.
- Students who receive a single long-term certificate¹⁶ or short-term certificate¹⁷ earn 21 percent and eight percent more, respectively, and that students who stack an additional credential on top of their first credential see greater returns than the single credential.

Returns by program area

The PPIC research found that health programs have by far and away the highest returns, particularly for associate degrees, which is likely due to associate degrees in registered nursing, one of the most lucrative for middle-skill workers.

- Students whose first award is a health associate degree earn 138 percent more in the six years following their graduation than they would have without the degree.
- Students who earn health-related certificates, rather than associate degrees, also see high returns of 35 to 63 percent for long-term certificates or multiple short-term certificates.

Outside of health programs, long- and short-term certificates in public and protective services (which includes administration of justice and fire technology) see returns of 13 to 20 percent, and associates degrees in engineering and family and consumer programs see returns of 10 to 14 percent. However, the PPIC analysis found that business management and information technology programs show small or no returns for all pathways.

¹⁵ PPIC defines middle income as between 200 and 700 percent of the regional poverty threshold.

¹⁶ Long-term certificates can be completed in less than two years but take more than one year.

¹⁷ Short-term certificates can be earned in less than one year.

Economic returns across student groups

Generally speaking, female students, Asian/Pacific Islander and White students, and students who earn their first credential between the ages of 23 and 27 see the largest returns on career education on average throughout California.

- Female students on average earn 27 percent more after their first credential, while male students earn 13 percent more.
- Asian/Pacific Islander students also earn on average 27 percent more after their first credential, and White students earn 23 percent more, compared to Latino/a students (17 percent more) and African American students (14 percent more).
- Students aged 23 to 27 earn 31 percent more after their first credential, compared to students aged 18 to 24 and 28 to 37 (24 percent more for each group), while the oldest student group (aged 38-54) see the lowest returns (12 percent).

In light of these different returns across demographic groups, even for the same credential in the same program area, the PPIC notes that labor market opportunities for a new credential holder may vary due to individual preferences, regional conditions, discrimination, the depth or quality of skills, and other economic realities.

Economic benefit of English as a Second Language

The English as a Second Language (ESL) Department is the largest department at City College of San Francisco, and offers both credit and noncredit programs. The Credit ESL program is designed for students with academic goals who wish to complete a two-year degree or vocational certificate at City College, or to transfer to a four-year college or university. The Noncredit ESL program is designed to help immigrant students develop their general ability to understand, speak, read, and write English.

According to 2014-2018 American Community Survey Five-Year Estimates, 43 percent of San Francisco residents speak a language other than English at home, and 20 percent of San Francisco residents who speak a language other than English at home speak English less than “very well.”¹⁸ Research has consistently shown that acquiring higher levels of English proficiency improves labor market outcomes (for a list of research papers, see the PPIC’s 2019 report “English as a Second Language in California’s Community Colleges”).¹⁹ Some ESL students need English skills to progress towards degrees, certificates, or transfers to four-year colleges, while others enroll in classes to improve job prospects or for personal reasons. Whatever the reason, the

¹⁸ American Community Survey 2014-18 Five-Year Estimates, Table DP02.

¹⁹ Olga Rodriguez, Sarah Bohn, Laura Hill, and Bonnie Brooks, Public Policy Institute of California. “English as a Second Language in California’s Community Colleges,” April 2019.

English as a Second Language program at City College, both credit and noncredit, offers students the opportunity to access higher-paying jobs that require English skills, to transfer to a four-year college or earn their Associates degrees, and overall to improve their labor market outcomes.

Noncredit classes and older adult health and well-being

In 2018-19, 59.1 percent of noncredit FTES were enrolled in the English as a Second Language Department, followed by 13.1 percent in the Transitional Studies Department, 5.4 in the Business Department, 4.4 percent in the Child Development and Family Studies Department, and 4.2 percent in the Older Adults Department, as shown in Exhibit 12 below.

Exhibit 12: Top Five Departments by FTES enrolled in noncredit classes, 2018-19

Department	Percent of Noncredit FTES
English as a Second Language	59.1%
Transitional Studies	13.1%
Business	5.4%
Child Development and Family Studies	4.4%
Older Adults	4.2%

Source: City College Office of Research and Planning, "Summary Data: Noncredit Classes and Students," October 2019.

A 2005 survey conducted by City College of students enrolled in noncredit courses found that the goal of most noncredit students is to improve their language skills, improve their job skills, or both, as shown in Exhibit 13 below.

Exhibit 13: Reported goals of noncredit students, 2005

By enrolling in noncredit class(es), my goal is to:	Percent of Respondents N = 3,273
Improve my language skills	64%
Improve my job skills	38%
Prepare for credit coursework	24%
Other (write-in goals primarily GED, HSD)	12%
Multiple goals	31%

Source: City College Noncredit Student Survey conducted September 2005.

As discussed earlier in this report, of the noncredit classes eliminated in Spring of 2020, the Older Adults Department had the majority of eliminated classes (78.1 percent). The Older Adults Department offers noncredit classes specially designed for adults 55 and over across several different disciplines, including computers, the arts, and health and wellness. As presented earlier in this report, 50 percent of students

enrolled in non-credit classes are older than 40, and a little over a quarter (26 percent) of students are older than 60.

As shown in exhibits 14 and 15 below, survey results for noncredit students enrolled in the Older Adults department showed a different focus than the overall noncredit student population. The majority of noncredit students enrolled in the Older Adults department cite their goals for enrollment as something other than improving job skills or language skills. The large majority of these students are retired.

Exhibit 14: Reported goals of students in the Older Adults Department, 2005

By enrolling in noncredit class(es), my goal is to:	Percent of Respondents
	N = 96
Improve my language skills	6%
Improve my job skills	0%
Prepare for credit coursework	4%
Other	90%
Multiple goals	0%

Source: City College Noncredit Student Survey conducted September 2005.

Exhibit 15: Employment status of students in the Older Adults Department, 2005

Employment status	Percent of Respondents
	N = 96
Full time	0%
Looking for work	0%
Not employed	7%
Regular part time	1%
Retired	85%
Occasional part time	3%
Homemaker	1%
Multiple	2%

Source: City College Noncredit Student Survey conducted September 2005.

The classes offered in the Older Adults Department include classes on health, the arts, music and theater, writing and literature, and computers. Rather than improving language or job skills, these classes offer lifelong learning, exercise, and socialization opportunities and related benefits for retired adults.

Economic benefit for the City of San Francisco

The economic benefits to City College outlined above generate benefits for the City overall: San Francisco benefits from having a well-educated and high-earning workforce.

The generational benefit of a college degree and higher earnings

There is a strong generational relationship between parents' and children's income levels and educational attainment. Education is critical to upward generational mobility: research summarized by the PPIC has shown that a greater percentage of adult children with college degrees exceed their parents' income than those without a college degree. Children born in the lowest income quintile have a 45 percent chance of remaining there if they do not have a college degree, but with a college degree, children born in the bottom quintile have less than a 20 percent chance of remaining there. In contrast, most young adults in California whose parents are college-educated and/or have high incomes will also finish college. And finally, a college education helps to level the playing field: upon graduation, low-income and first-generation college students have similar labor market outcomes as their peers.²⁰

Individuals with higher education levels have better labor market and social outcomes

Individuals with higher levels of education have higher wages and additional associated benefits, as discussed above. Society benefits from these individual benefits in the form of lower unemployment and poverty rates, less demand for public assistance programs, lower incarceration rates, higher tax revenue, and greater civic engagement. Places with more highly educated populations tend to have stronger economies and relatively high wages.²¹

Exhibit 16 below summarizes calculations related to labor market benefits of education from the PPIC. Individuals with higher levels of education are more likely to participate in the labor force, less likely to be unemployed, and are more likely to have health insurance and/or a retirement plan through employment.

²⁰ Hans Johnson, Marisol Cuellar Mejia, and Sarah Bohn, the Public Policy Institute of California. "Higher Education as a Driver of Economic Mobility," December 2018.

²¹ Hans Johnson, Marisol Cuellar Mejia, and Sarah Bohn, the Public Policy Institute of California. "Higher Education as a Driver of Economic Mobility," December 2018. Refer to this report for a full list of economic benefit research work.

Exhibit 16: Labor market benefits of education

	Labor force participation	Unemp. rate	Health ins. through emp.	Retirement plan through emp.
No high school diploma	66%	8.2%	44%	17%
High school graduate	73%	7.0%	66%	32%
Some college	78%	5.5%	76%	40%
Associate degree	79%	4.5%	77%	44%
Bachelor’s degree or higher	86%	3.4%	86%	48%

Source: Hans Johnson, Marisol Cuellar Mejia, and Sarah Bohn, the Public Policy Institute of California. “Higher Education as a Driver of Economic Mobility,” December 2018.

Higher educational attainment is also associated with lower poverty and social safety net assistance, as shown in Exhibit 17 below. In addition to being less likely to be in poverty and/or a social safety net recipient, college graduates are more likely to own a house, be married with long-lasting marriages, have lower mortality rates, are more likely to be civically engaged, and report being in better health.

Exhibit 17: Poverty and safety net benefits of education

	Poverty rate	Social safety net recipient
No high school diploma	34.5%	44%
High school graduate	21.2%	33%
Some college	15.6%	24%
Associate degree	13.6%	19%
Bachelor’s degree or higher	8.4%	9%

Source: Hans Johnson, Marisol Cuellar Mejia, and Sarah Bohn, the Public Policy Institute of California. “Higher Education as a Driver of Economic Mobility,” December 2018.

Individuals with higher education levels contribute more in taxes and rely less on the social safety net

In a 2009 research paper,²² researchers in the RAND Education program research area found that the higher income realized by more highly educated people results in higher federal and state income taxes as well as higher “consumption” taxes, such as sales, real estate, and excise taxes.²³ These higher tax payments benefit San Francisco

²² Stephen J. Carroll and Emre Erkut, RAND Corporation. “The Benefits to Taxpayers from Increases in Students’ Educational Attainment,” 2009.

²³ Taxes on consumption and property depend on the amounts spent on consumption and property, which depend on individual and household disposable income. As a by-product of earning higher incomes, people with more education generally pay more in taxes on consumption and property.

either directly, such as direct revenue sales tax, or indirectly in the form of apportionments, allocations, or grants from the state or federal government that are funded by these revenues. The RAND study results show that increases in the education level of individuals in every population subgroup result in a substantial increase in tax payments, and that earning a bachelor's degree or more rather than completing only some college has the largest impact on tax payments (followed by graduating high school rather than dropping out). RAND's results, presented in Exhibit 18 below, show the estimated increase in the 2002 value of what an individual would contribute over his or her lifetime if he or she graduated from college instead of dropping out of high school.

Exhibit 18: Increased tax payments associated with increasing educational attainment from high school dropout to college graduate

Race/ethnicity	Increased tax payments (2002 \$)	
	Men	Women
White	\$192,000	\$167,000
Asian	181,000	171,000
Black	144,000	128,000
Hispanic	165,000	148,000

Source: Stephen J. Carroll and Emre Erkut, RAND Corporation. "The Benefits to Taxpayers from Increases in Students' Educational Attainment," 2009.

The RAND research supports the PPIC's conclusion that individuals with higher levels of education rely less on the social safety net. In addition, because payments to social support and insurance programs by individuals and employers are determined by earnings, as a by-product of higher earnings, people with higher levels of education generally pay more to social support and insurance programs. The research focuses mainly on social support programs provided at the federal and state level, in two broad categories:

- Social support programs that provide cash and non-cash benefits to members of low-income households in programs that provide direct income support, medical support, food and nutrition, and housing (for example, the Temporary Assistance for Needy Families, the Earned Income Tax Credit, housing subsidies, the Supplemental Nutrition Program, and Medicaid).
- Social insurance programs that replace the lost income of people who cannot work because of old age, severance, or disability (for example, Medicare, unemployment insurance, and Social Security).

Increased educational attainment is rewarded in the job market with the lower likelihood of being unemployed, higher income when employed, and higher likelihood to have private insurance when employed. RAND concludes that each of these facts leads to lower demand for support from the government. According to

RAND, the greatest savings in spending on social programs comes from individuals who graduate from college rather than dropping out.

Individuals with higher education levels require less corrections and law enforcement spending

As cited by RAND, the available research provides strong evidence that individuals with higher levels of education commit less crime and therefore require less spending from government on law enforcement, prosecution, and incarceration.²⁴ Unlike spending on social support programs, San Francisco incurs significant direct costs associated with law enforcement and corrections spending, and the RAND research focuses on costs of county and municipal jails in particular. The research concludes that an increase in education levels reduces the costs of the criminal justice system and eases the demand for increased capacity in state prisons and county/municipal jails. Exhibit 19 below presents RAND's conclusions on the total effects of increased education on incarceration spending, in the extreme case (raising an individual's education from high school dropout to college graduate). As can be seen, because women are infrequently incarcerated and Black men are more frequently incarcerated, the reductions in spending are smaller for women than men, and larger for Black men and women than other races.

²⁴ Research on the relationship between education and crime is extensive and varied. The bulk of the research concludes that education reduces the chance that an individual will engage in criminal activity for a variety of reasons. First, an individual with more education is less likely to be unemployed, and therefore has less incentive to commit crime. Relatedly, higher education levels raise wages, and therefore the value of any lost working time (from incarceration and from a reduction in wages post-incarceration) is higher for an individual with higher education. (Research on the relationship between education and white-collar crime in particular is inconsistent.) Conversely, an individual with a criminal record may be less likely to be hired at a job, and if he or she is hired, the job is more likely to be low-paying. Male ex-inmates are also less likely to share a household with the mothers of their children, and their families will likely need more support from social support programs. For a full summary of research, refer to: Stephen J. Carroll and Emre Erkut, RAND Corporation, "The Benefits to Taxpayers from Increases in Students' Educational Attainment," 2009.

Exhibit 19: Present value of reduced spending on incarceration associated with increased educational attainment, from high school dropout to college graduate

Race/ethnicity	Reduced spending (2002 \$)	
	Men	Women
White	\$23,000	\$3,000
Asian	17,000	1,000
Black	137,000	14,000
Hispanic	58,000	6,000

Source: Stephen J. Carroll and Emre Erkut, RAND Corporation. "The Benefits to Taxpayers from Increases in Students' Educational Attainment," 2009.

Conclusion

City College students experience a wide array of economic benefits from increases in education and workforce skills, primarily from increased wages and better labor market outcomes. These benefits are generational, and education is critical to upward generational mobility and to leveling the playing field for the next generation. A highly educated and skilled workforce also provides a significant benefit to the community: individuals contribute more in taxes and rely less on government-funded programs and institutions. By serving a diverse population of students of all ages, City College makes these economic benefits available to San Francisco residents, and the City experiences a related economic benefit as a result.

Policy Options

The Board of Supervisors could:

1. Explore additional opportunities to provide local funding to City College of San Francisco to reduce its structural budget deficit and in order to ensure that the City of San Francisco continues to benefit from its economic and social contributions.

Appendix A: Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Credit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Administration of Justice/Fire Science	33046	ADMJ	54	Princ. & Proc. of Justice Sys.
Administration of Justice/Fire Science	33044	ADMJ	53	Legal Aspects of Evidence
Administration of Justice/Fire Science	33047	ADMJ	63	Fingerprints
Administration of Justice/Fire Science	31887	ADMJ	83	Police Career Preparation
Architecture	32547	ARCH	218	Rhino 3D Computer Modeling
Art	31283	ART	105	Ancient Art/Arch of Lat Amer
Art	30406	ART	125A	Basic Design
Art	30012	ART	130A	Basic Drawing
Art	30407	ART	132A	Beginning Figure Drawing
Art	31128	ART	132B	Intermediate Figure Drawing
Art	31288	ART	132C	Advanced Figure Drawing
Art	31292	ART	132D	Figure Drawing Special Topics
Art	33006	ART	139	Live Model Illustration
Art	32286	ART	140A	Beginning Painting
Art	32287	ART	140B	Intermediate Painting
Art	32288	ART	140C	Advanced Painting
Art	32289	ART	140D	Painting Mastery
Art	33107	ART	145A	Beginning Watercolor Painting
Art	33108	ART	145B	Intermediate Watercolor
Art	33111	ART	145C	Adv Watercolor/Water Media
Art	33110	ART	145D	Watercolor Special Topics
Art	30867	ART	146A	Beg. Chinese Brush Painting
Art	30868	ART	146B	Int. Chinese Brush Painting
Art	31665	ART	146C	Adv. Chinese Brush Painting
Art	31667	ART	146D	Chin Brush Painting Mastery
Art	32207	ART	150A	Beginning Printmaking
Art	32208	ART	150B	Intermediate Printmaking
Art	32209	ART	150C	Advanced Printmaking
Art	32210	ART	150D	Printmaking Special Topics
Art	31659	ART	152A	Beginning Screen Printing
Art	31668	ART	152B	Intermediate Screen Printing
Art	32726	ART	152C	Advanced Screen Printing
Art	30028	ART	160A	Beginning Ceramics
Art	30384	ART	160A	Beginning Ceramics
Art	30500	ART	160A	Beginning Ceramics
Art	30033	ART	160B	Intermediate Ceramics
Art	30358	ART	160B	Intermediate Ceramics
Art	31294	ART	160C	Advanced Ceramics
Art	30925	ART	160C	Advanced Ceramics
Art	31447	ART	160D	Ceramics Studio
Art	31448	ART	160D	Ceramics Studio
Art	30039	ART	180A	Beginning Jewelry/Metal Arts
Art	30040	ART	180B	Intermediate Jewelry/Metal Art
Art	30042	ART	180C	Advanced Jewelry/Metal Arts
Art	32228	ART	180D	Metal Arts Studio
Art	30927	ART	181A	Beg. Casting for Metal Arts
Art	30928	ART	181B	Intermed Casting for Metal Art
Art	30929	ART	181C	Adv. Casting for Metal Arts
Astronomy	31366	ASTR	16	Observational Astronomy
Astronomy	31808	ASTR	16	Observational Astronomy
Behavioral Sciences	33170	PSYC	15	Assertive Behavior.
Biological Sciences	30389	BIO	9	Human Biology

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Credit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Biological Sciences	30622	BIO	9	Human Biology
Biological Sciences	31864	BIO	21B	Ecology of San Francisco
Biological Sciences	31863	BIO	21E	Ecology of Coastal Mendocino
Biological Sciences	32140	BIO	21J	Agroecology
Biological Sciences	30497	BIO	40	Plants & Animals of California
Biological Sciences	32327	BIO	51	Introduction to Genetics
Biological Sciences	30292	BIO	91	On-Campus Bio Work Experience
Biological Sciences	30293	BIO	92	Off-Campus Bio Work Experience
Broadcast Electronic Media Art	33023	BCST	158	Social Media for Professionals
Business	32175	ACCT	10	Introduction to Accounting
Business	31810	ACCT	52	Intermediate Accounting
Business	31200	R E	181	Principles of Real Estate
Business	31467	BSEN	74	Written Business Communication
Business	31812	BSMA	68	Mathematics of Business
Business	31187	INTR	170	International Business Finance
Business	32825	MGT	234	Communications for Bus. Mgmt.
Business	32517	R E	192	Advanced Real Estate Appraisal
Chemistry	32556	CHEM	110	Chemistry and the Environment
Child Dev. & Family Studies	32469	CDEV	41M	Sub. Teaching in ECE
Child Dev. & Family Studies	32944	CDEV	41O	Outdoor Lrng in Fmly Chld Care
Child Dev. & Family Studies	33242	CDEV	53	Child Growth and Development
Child Dev. & Family Studies	30310	CDEV	53	Child Growth and Development
Child Dev. & Family Studies	31860	CDEV	61	Infant/Toddler Growth & Dev.
Child Dev. & Family Studies	33178	CDEV	62	Infant/Tod. Care in Grp. Set.
Child Dev. & Family Studies	31259	CDEV	62	Infant/Tod. Care in Grp. Set.
Child Dev. & Family Studies	30639	CDEV	66	Early Childhood Curriculum
Child Dev. & Family Studies	31907	CDEV	67	Child, Family, and Community
Child Dev. & Family Studies	31842	CDEV	68	Interactions with Children
Child Dev. & Family Studies	32468	CDEV	89	Early Childhood Admin III
Child Dev. & Family Studies	31844	CDEV	96	Understdg Child Challeng Behav
Child Dev. & Family Studies	31846	CDEV	105	Adult Supervision & Mentoring
Communication Studies	31964	CMST	2	Intro to Rhetorical Criticism
Communication Studies	32168	CMST	6	Workplace Communication
Computer Networking & Info Tech	32591	CNIT	124	Advanced Ethical Hacking
Computer Networking & Info Tech	32982	CNIT	151	Intro to Virtualization
Computer Networking & Info Tech	33193	CNIT	214	Internet of Things
Computer Science	30644	CS	130A	PHP Programming
Computer Science	32660	CS	185	Exploring Game Worlds
Computer Science	30754	CS	211D	Android Programming
Computer Science	31355	CS	132A	Ruby Programming
Computer Science	32565	CS	256	Data Visualization
Culinary Arts & Hospitality	32063	CAHS	10N	Culinary Fundamentals 1
Culinary Arts & Hospitality	32064	CAHS	10NL	Culinary Fundamentals 1 Lab
Culinary Arts & Hospitality	32211	CAHS	60N	Mousses: Cakes and Desserts
Culinary Arts & Hospitality	33213	CAHS	209	Food Business Entrepreneurship
Earth Sciences	30569	GEOG	110	Introduction to GIS
Earth Sciences	32925	GEOL	21B	San Francisco Geology
Engineering & Technology	30556	BTEC	10	Rsrch Skills for Career Opport
Engineering & Technology	31903	BTEC	6	Basics of Cell Culture
Engineering & Technology	30615	BTEC	22	Immunoassay: ELISA
Engineering & Technology	30616	BTEC	23	Western Blotting Techniques
Engineering & Technology	30643	BTEC	25	Analytical PCR Technology

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Credit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Engineering & Technology	30666	BTEC	107	Language Skills for Tech's
Engineering & Technology	30667	BTEC	108A	Practical Math for Lab Science
Engineering & Technology	31784	CAD	99B	Advanced AutoCAD Techniques
Engineering & Technology	30456	CAD	181	Intro to Comp Aided Drafting
Engineering & Technology	30943	CAD	182	Engineering Detailing in Revit
Engineering & Technology	31377	CAD	190	Part Modeling in SolidWorks
Engineering & Technology	30472	ELEC	102A	Active Analog Electronics
Engineering & Technology	30840	ELEC	102B	Practical Digital Circuits
Engineering & Technology	30768	ENGN	10B	IntroEngn:SoftwareTools&Design
Engineering & Technology	30315	ENGN	24	Engineering Design Graphics
Engineering & Technology	31379	ENGN	37	Engineering Mechanics-Dynamics
Engineering & Technology	30617	ENGN	48L	Engineering & Technology Lab
Engineering & Technology	30843	ET	50	Technical Mathematics
Engineering & Technology	32772	ET	108A	Practical Mathematics I
Engineering & Technology	32801	SUST	5	Sustain & Envir Speaker Series
Engineering & Technology	30455	WELD	140	Manufacturing Processes
Engineering & Technology	31787	WELD	144A	Survey of Welding Processes
English	31001	ENGL	35A	Intro to Writing Fiction
English	31278	ENGL	35B	Intermediate Fiction Writing
English	32018	ENGL	35G	Writing Creative Nonfiction I
English	32021	ENGL	35H	Creative Nonfiction Writing II
English	32920	ENGL	44B	Survey of World Literature
English	30655	ENGL	52	Shakespeare
English	30996	HUM	8	Philosophies of Religion
English	30997	HUM	8	Philosophies of Religion
English	30985	HUM	12	Music/Art/Lit: Modern
English	31003	HUM	41B	Western Cultural Values
English As a Second Language	32911	ESL	67	Practical Writing for ESL
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	32945	O H	71A	Landscape Construction
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	32946	O H	71B	Landscape Construction
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	33225	O H	111B	Growing Orchids
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	33230	O H	111D	Introduction To Xeriscaping
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	31148	R F	86A	Beg. Oriental Flwr Arrangement
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	31380	R F	86B	Oriental Flower Arrangement II
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	31381	R F	86C	Oriental Flowr Arrangement III
Env. Horticulture & Floristry	31602	R F	86D	Oriental Flower Arrangement IV
Fashion	31589	FASH	37	Flat Pattern Design II
Fashion	32949	FASH	111B	Adv. Leather & Heavy Textiles
Health Care Technology	33200	EMT	11A	Pediatric CPR and First Aid
Health Care Technology	31484	EMT	11A	Pediatric CPR and First Aid
Health Care Technology	31483	EMT	11A	Pediatric CPR and First Aid
Health Care Technology	31945	EMT	11A	Pediatric CPR and First Aid
Health Care Technology	32185	EMT	12	BLS Provider Course
Health Care Technology	32372	EMT	12	BLS Provider Course
Health Care Technology	32799	EMT	12	BLS Provider Course
Health Care Technology	32814	EMT	13	Standard First Aid
Health Care Technology	31305	HIT	63	Health Information Systems
Health Care Technology	32186	HIT	74	Intro to Quality Improvement
Health Education	32445	HLTH	65	Youth Development & Leadership
Health Education	32446	HLTH	67	HIV and Hepatitis Navigation
Health Education	30181	HLTH	53	Personal and Community Health
Health Education	31577	HLTH	90C	How Trauma Affects Our Lives

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Credit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Health Education	31530	HLTH	91D	Intro to Wellness and Recovery
Interdisciplinary Studies	31372	IDST	3	Intro to Museum Studies
Interdisciplinary Studies	31373	IDST	4	Ways of Faith
Interdisciplinary Studies	32005	IDST	50	College Success
Interdisciplinary Studies	31459	IDST	80D	Diversity and Social Justice: Heterosexism
Labor and Community Studies	30540	LBCS	98A	Beg. Labor Heritage Chorus
Labor and Community Studies	30541	LBCS	98B	Intermed Labor Heritage Chorus
Labor and Community Studies	30588	LBCS	98C	Adv. Labor Heritage Chorus
Mathematics	30248	MATH	125	Differential Equations
Music	32690	MUS	6A	Beginning Classical Guitar
Music	32122	MUS	6A	Beginning Classical Guitar
Music	31061	MUS	6B	Adv Beginning Classical Guitar
Music	31066	MUS	6C	Intermediate Classical Guitar
Music	31069	MUS	6D	Adv Intermed Classical Guitar
Music	32303	MUS	9A	Beginning Piano
Music	30088	MUS	9B	Intermediate Piano
Music	31663	MUS	9C	Keyboard Harmony
Music	31485	MUS	10A	Beginning Voice
Music	30089	MUS	10A	Beginning Voice
Music	31486	MUS	10B	Advanced Beginning Voice
Music	30671	MUS	10B	Advanced Beginning Voice
Music	31487	MUS	10C	Intermediate Voice
Music	31072	MUS	10C	Intermediate Voice
Music	31488	MUS	10D	Advanced Intermediate Voice
Music	31075	MUS	10D	Advanced Intermediate Voice
Music	31070	MUS	11	Guitar Workshop
Music	32127	MUS	11	Guitar Workshop
Music	32190	MUS	13A	Jazz/Rock Improvisation WKSP
Music	31491	MUS	14	Chorale
Music	31492	MUS	14	Chorale
Music	30080	MUS	9A	Beginning Piano
Music	31082	MUS	19	Piano Ensemble
Music	33226	MUS	23	Jazz Hist, Mus Trad of Afr Amr
Music	30344	MUS	26	Music In American Culture
Music	30602	MUS	29	Electronic Music Lab
Music	33172	MUS	48A	Beg. Labor Heritage Chorus
Music	33173	MUS	48B	Intermed Labor Heritage Chorus
Music	33174	MUS	48C	Adv. Labor Heritage Chorus
Music	32818	MUS	100	Music Fundamentals
Music	32819	MUS	100	Music Fundamentals
Photography	31476	PHOT	51	Beginning Photography
Photography	33032	PHOT	60A	Beginning Photoshop
Photography	33034	PHOT	81B	Adv Black/White Darkroom Tech
Photography	31478	PHOT	80	Outdoor & Ambient Lighting
Photography	31823	PHOT	102B	Documentary/News Photography
Photography	32678	PHOT	102C	Phase One - Capture One
Photography	33033	PHOT	102D	Beg. Drone Piloting & Imaging
Phys Education & Dance	30858	DANC	34A	Dance Conditioning
Phys Education & Dance	32079	DANC	37	Feldenkrais for Performance
Phys Education & Dance	33196	DANC	127A	Dance Improvisation: Group
Phys Education & Dance	31629	DANC	138A	Beginning Hip Hop Dance
Phys Education & Dance	31879	DANC	140A	Beginning European Folk Dance

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Credit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Phys Education & Dance	32084	DANC	140B	Int. European Folk Dance
Phys Education & Dance	30725	DANC	150A	Beginning Swing Dance
Phys Education & Dance	31793	DANC	150B	Intermediate Swing Dance
Phys Education & Dance	30986	DANC	151A	Beginning Lindy Hop
Phys Education & Dance	30739	DANC	151B	Intermediate Lindy Hop
Phys Education & Dance	30722	DANC	160A	Beginning Argentine Tango
Phys Education & Dance	32536	DANC	172B	Zumba: Session 2
Phys Education & Dance	30714	PE	200C	Fitness Center Super Circuit
Phys Education & Dance	30716	PE	200C	Fitness Center Super Circuit
Phys Education & Dance	31634	PE	200C	Fitness Center Super Circuit
Phys Education & Dance	31313	PE	210B	Intermediate Boxercise
Phys Education & Dance	31497	PE	214A	Beginning Weight Training
Phys Education & Dance	31496	PE	214A	Beginning Weight Training
Phys Education & Dance	30738	PE	218	Gentle Restorative Yoga
Phys Education & Dance	32720	PE	218	Gentle Restorative Yoga
Phys Education & Dance	31027	PE	223A	Feldenkrais, Level 1
Phys Education & Dance	31164	PE	233A	Beginning Basketball
Phys Education & Dance	31169	PE	233B	Intermediate Basketball
Phys Education & Dance	31173	PE	233C	Advanced Basketball
Phys Education & Dance	31178	PE	236A	Beginning Golf
Phys Education & Dance	31176	PE	236A	Beginning Golf
Phys Education & Dance	31177	PE	236A	Beginning Golf
Phys Education & Dance	31181	PE	236B	Intermediate Golf
Phys Education & Dance	31179	PE	236B	Intermediate Golf
Phys Education & Dance	31180	PE	236B	Intermediate Golf
Phys Education & Dance	31119	PE	240A	Beginning Tennis
Phys Education & Dance	31122	PE	240B	Intermediate Tennis
Phys Education & Dance	31829	PE	252A	Beginning Water Aerobics
Phys Education & Dance	31039	PE	252A	Beginning Water Aerobics
Phys Education & Dance	31830	PE	252B	Intermediate Water Aerobics
Phys Education & Dance	31041	PE	252B	Intermediate Water Aerobics
Phys Education & Dance	31831	PE	252D	Intensive Water Aerobics
Phys Education & Dance	31640	PE	252D	Intensive Water Aerobics
Phys Education & Dance	31048	PE	254	Novice Swimming
Phys Education & Dance	31056	PE	255A	Beginning Swimming
Phys Education & Dance	32231	PE	255B	Advanced Beginning Swimming
Phys Education & Dance	32232	PE	255C	Intermediate Swimming
Phys Education & Dance	31883	PE	274A	Beg. Jiu-jitsu
Phys Education & Dance	31658	PE	274B	Intermediate Jiu-jitsu
Social Science	30133	HIST	5	Europe Since 1900
Social Science	30134	HIST	12A	US Women's History to 1880s
Social Science	31986	HIST	18A	Colonial Hist of Latin Amer
Social Science	30149	POLS	1	American Government
Social Science	30546	PHIL	25C	Modern Philosophy through Kant
Social Science	30399	PHIL	40	Logic: Intro to Critical Think
Social Science	30418	PHIL	40	Logic: Intro to Critical Think
Social Science	31257	POLS	4	Politics of Globalization
Social Science	33121	POLS	45	Govt & Politics of Middle East
Social Science	30403	SOC	25	Sex/Gender in American Society
Theatre Arts	31088	TH A	160A	Beg Vocal Production/Audition
Theatre Arts	31089	TH A	160B	Intermed Vocal Prod & Audition
Theatre Arts	31090	TH A	160C	Adv-Intermed Vocal Prod & Audi

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Credit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Theatre Arts	31091	TH A	160D	Advanced Vocal Prod & Audition
Visual Media Design	30814	VMD	105	Visual Media Digital Skills
Visual Media Design	33055	VMD	168	Vis. Dev. for Animation
World Languages and Cultures	33072	CHIN	33	Chinese Culture Heritage Learn
World Languages and Cultures	33146	GERM	1	Elem German
World Languages and Cultures	30781	GERM	1A	Elementary German
World Languages and Cultures	32101	GERM	1A	Elementary German
World Languages and Cultures	32182	GERM	1A	Elementary German
World Languages and Cultures	30782	GERM	1B	Elem German
World Languages and Cultures	31778	GERM	10A	Practical German
World Languages and Cultures	31388	GERM	10B	Cont Practical German
World Languages and Cultures	32184	PIL	1	Elementary Filipino (Tagalog)
World Languages and Cultures	32201	PIL	10A	Conversational Pilipino
World Languages and Cultures	32200	PIL	10B	Conversational Filipino
World Languages and Cultures	32908	PLS	14	Immigration Law
World Languages and Cultures	32162	RUSS	1A	Elementary Russian
World Languages and Cultures	32163	RUSS	21A	Elem Russ For Bilingual Stud
World Languages and Cultures	32438	SPAN	32B	Spanish for Heritage Speakers 2B
World Languages and Cultures	32109	SPAN	7	Intro to Literature in Spanish
World Languages and Cultures	33156	SPAN	10D	Cont. Interm. Conver. Spanish
World Languages and Cultures	32270	SPAN	2A	Continuation of Elementary Spanish

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Noncredit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Business	40007	SMBU	9793	
Fashion	40544	FASH	6055	Beginning Upholstery
Fashion	40298	FASH	6056	Advanced Upholstery Trade
Health Care Technology	40263	AHWC	9183	Unit Coordinator
Health Care Technology	40334	EMT	5000	Heartsaver CPR
Health Care Technology	40410	EMT	5005	EMT Refresher
Health Education	40545	HLTH	5018	Tai Chi for Health
Health Education	40574	HLTH	5018	Tai Chi for Health
Health Education	40532	HLTH	5018	Tai Chi for Health
Health Education	40573	HLTH	5018	Tai Chi for Health
Nursing, Licensed Vocational	40088	VOCN	9200	Nursing Refresher
Older Adults	40555	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40557	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40348	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40667	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40477	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40473	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40478	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40561	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40562	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40729	OLAD	7005	Body Dynamic & Aging Process I
Older Adults	40349	OLAD	7007	Body Dynamic & Aging Proc II
Older Adults	40350	OLAD	7007	Body Dynamic & Aging Proc II
Older Adults	40351	OLAD	7203	Principles of Balance-Beg
Older Adults	40352	OLAD	7203	Principles of Balance-Beg
Older Adults	40354	OLAD	7203	Principles of Balance-Beg
Older Adults	40355	OLAD	7203	Principles of Balance-Beg
Older Adults	40357	OLAD	7203	Principles of Balance-Beg
Older Adults	40358	OLAD	7204	Principles of Balance-Int/Adv
Older Adults	40361	OLAD	7204	Principles of Balance-Int/Adv
Older Adults	40363	OLAD	7204	Principles of Balance-Int/Adv
Older Adults	40270	OLAD	7209	Mind-Body Health
Older Adults	40271	OLAD	7209	Mind-Body Health
Older Adults	40731	OLAD	7209	Mind-Body Health
Older Adults	40199	OLAD	7300	Art for Older Adults
Older Adults	40119	OLAD	7300	Art for Older Adults
Older Adults	40075	OLAD	7300	Art for Older Adults
Older Adults	40093	OLAD	7300	Art for Older Adults
Older Adults	40733	OLAD	7301	Arts & Crafts for Older Adults
Older Adults	40077	OLAD	7301	Arts & Crafts for Older Adults
Older Adults	40698	OLAD	7301	Arts & Crafts for Older Adults
Older Adults	40080	OLAD	7303	Figure Drawing - Older Adults
Older Adults	40079	OLAD	7303	Figure Drawing - Older Adults
Older Adults	40125	OLAD	7307	Music Apprec. for Older Adults
Older Adults	40081	OLAD	7307	Music Apprec. for Older Adults
Older Adults	40565	OLAD	7307	Music Apprec. for Older Adults
Older Adults	40272	OLAD	7309	Theater-Elements and Interp
Older Adults	40083	OLAD	7310	Stitchery for Older Adults
Older Adults	40082	OLAD	7310	Stitchery for Older Adults
Older Adults	40566	OLAD	7311	Ceramics for Older Adults
Older Adults	40567	OLAD	7311	Ceramics for Older Adults
Older Adults	40568	OLAD	7311	Ceramics for Older Adults

Spring 2020 Schedule Reductions Noncredit

Department	CRN	Subject	Course	Title
Older Adults	40084	OLAD	7316	Life Sculpture - Older Adults
Older Adults	40670	OLAD	7320	OLAD Art for Memory Loss
Older Adults	40569	OLAD	7401	Writer'sWorkshop Older Adults
Older Adults	40734	OLAD	7401	Writer'sWorkshop Older Adults
Older Adults	40198	OLAD	7402	English - Women's Literature
Older Adults	40570	OLAD	7402	English - Women's Literature
Older Adults	40480	OLAD	7410	Telling Your Life Story
Older Adults	40572	OLAD	7501	Intro to Computers I
Older Adults	40171	OLAD	7503	Art & Photo Using Digital Med
Photography	40791	PHOT	1002	Beg. B/W Film and Darkroom
Women's and Gender Studies	40717	WGST	2501	Self-Defense
Women's and Gender Studies	40718	WGST	2501	Self-Defense