



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Government Audit and Oversight Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Dean Preston, Connie Chan, Rafael Mandelman*

*Clerk: John Carroll (415) 554-4445*

---

**Friday, September 17, 2021**

**2:00 PM**

**Special Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Dean Preston, Connie Chan, and Rafael Mandelman

*The Government Audit and Oversight Committee met in special session through videoconferencing, and provided public comment through teleconferencing, on Friday, September 17, 2021, with Chair Dean Preston presiding. Chair Preston called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.*

**Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*On March 17, 2020, the Board of Supervisors authorized their Board and Committee meetings to convene remotely (via Microsoft Teams) and will allow remote public comment via teleconference. Visit the SFGovTV website at ([www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)) to stream the live meetings, or to watch meetings on demand. Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely via detailed instructions on participating via teleconference available at: <https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>.*

*Members of the public may participate by phone or may submit their comments by email to: [john.carroll@sfgov.org](mailto:john.carroll@sfgov.org); all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Regularly-scheduled Government Audit and Oversight Committee Meetings begin at 10:00 a.m. every first and third Thursday of each month. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at <https://sfbos.org/committees>.*

**ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Preston, Vice Chair Chan, and Member Mandelman were noted present. A quorum was present.*

**AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## LITIGATION

Chair Preston requested that File Nos. 210783, 210784, 210785, 210786, 210787, 210788, 210827, 210897, 210899, 210906, and 210907 be heard together.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Speaker; David Pilpel; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

### Conference with City Attorney

*[Convene in Closed Session - Existing Litigation - City as Plaintiff and/or Defendant]*

*Motion that the Government Audit and Oversight Committee of the Board of Supervisors convene in closed session with the City Attorney for the purpose of conferring with, or receiving advice from, the City Attorney regarding the following existing litigation and anticipated litigation. Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) permit this closed session. Discussion in open session concerning these matters would likely and unavoidably prejudice the position of the City in the pending lawsuits and claims listed below.*

*After a closed session, if one occurs, the Committee shall adopt a motion either to disclose or not to disclose.*

*The Deputy City Attorney reported that the Government Audit and Oversight Committee has met in closed session with the City Attorney, under the provisions of Government Code Section 54956.9 (a) and Administrative Code Section 67.8 (3), for the purpose of conferring with, or receiving advice from, the City Attorney regarding settlements in the lawsuits or claims listed above.*

*Persons in attendance: Anne Pearson, Estie Kus, John Roddy, and Rose Darling (Office of the City Attorney); Michael Carlin and Greg Norby (San Francisco Public Utilities Commission); and Erica Major and Victor Young (Office of the Clerk of the Board).*

**Chair Preston moved to convene in closed session. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

### 210783 **[Settlement of Lawsuit - Juanita Stockwell, et al. - \$480,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Guillermo Amigo, E.R. Balinton, Mike Bolte, Nikolaus Borthne, Edward Browne, Peter Busalacchi, Gary Castel, Philip Fleck, Severo Flores, George S. Fogarty, Malcolm Fong, Mary Godfrey, Jason Hui, Terrye Ivy, Jacklyn Jehl, Bartholomew Johnson, James Jones, Richard Jue, Robert Leung, Michael Lewis, Paul Lozada, D.H. Bud Massey, Bruce Meadors, Vince Neeson, Thomas O'Connor, Susan Rolovich, Juanita Stockwell, Jessie A. Washington, and Michael Wells against the City and County of San Francisco for \$480,000; the lawsuit was filed on December 17, 2015, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC 15-549482; entitled Juanita Stockwell, et al. v. City and County of San Francisco; the lawsuit involves an employment dispute. (City Attorney)

06/25/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/13/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210784 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Michael Devin - \$400,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Michael Devin against the City and County of San Francisco for \$400,000; the lawsuit was filed on October 25, 2019, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-19-580276; entitled Michael Devin v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit involves alleged personal injury on a City street. (City Attorney)

06/25/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/13/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210785 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Nadezhua Oshmansky - \$100,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Nadezhua Oshmansky against the City and County of San Francisco for \$100,000; the lawsuit was filed on June 25, 2020, in San Francisco County Superior Court, Case No. CGC-20-585036; entitled Nadezhua Oshmansky v. City and County of San Francisco et al.; the lawsuit involves alleged personal injury on a City sidewalk. (City Attorney)

06/25/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/13/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210786 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Mike Buckley and Mary Buckley - \$57,900]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Mike Buckley and Mary Buckley against the City and County of San Francisco for \$57,900; the lawsuit was filed on November 16, 2017, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-17-562543; entitled Mike Buckley, an individual; and Mary Buckley, an individual v. City and County of San Francisco; the lawsuit involves property damaged by erosion. (City Attorney)

06/25/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/13/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210787 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Stephanie Brunton - City to Receive \$40,000 from Walsh Construction Company]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Stephanie Brunton against the City and County of San Francisco by payment of \$40,000 to the City by Walsh Construction Company; the lawsuit was filed on April 29, 2019, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-19-575558; entitled Stephanie Brunton v. City and County of San Francisco, et al; the underlying lawsuit involves alleged personal injury suffered as a result of an alleged dangerous condition on public property; other material terms of the settlement are that the City and County of San Francisco will dismiss its Cross-Complaint for indemnity and contribution against Walsh Construction Company. (City Attorney)  
07/01/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/13/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210788 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Cynthia Spears - \$137,500]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Cynthia Spears against the City and County of San Francisco for \$137,500; the lawsuit was filed on May 5, 2020, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-20-584349; entitled Cynthia Spears v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit involves an alleged personal injury on a City sidewalk tree basin. (City Attorney)  
07/01/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/13/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210827 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Maurice Caldwell - \$8,000,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Maurice Caldwell against the City and County of San Francisco for \$8,000,000; the lawsuit was filed on April 16, 2012, in United States District Court, Case No. 12-cv-1892 DMR; entitled Maurice Caldwell v. City and County of San Francisco, et al.; the lawsuit alleges fabrication of evidence in violation of the Fourteenth Amendment. (City Attorney)

07/16/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

07/27/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210897 [Settlement of Lawsuit - Christina McGovern - \$100,000]**

Ordinance authorizing settlement of the lawsuit filed by Christina McGovern against the City and County of San Francisco for \$100,000; the lawsuit was filed on March 10, 2020, in San Francisco Superior Court, Case No. CGC-20-583596; entitled Christina McGovern v. City and County of San Francisco; the lawsuit involves an alleged personal injury on a City sidewalk. (City Attorney)

08/06/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

09/07/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210899 [Settlement of Unlitigated Claim - San Francisco Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board - Regulatory Enforcement Action]**

Resolution approving the settlement of an unlitigated claim of the San Francisco Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board against the City and County of San Francisco regarding alleged violations of the California Water Code related to wet weather-related overflows from the City's combined sewer system; no formal claim has been filed; the settlement involves entry of a stipulated enforcement order requiring the City to implement flood control projects in the Wawona area, Folsom area, and Lower Alemany area and flooding response actions. (City Attorney)

08/06/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

09/07/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210906 [Settlement of Unlitigated Claims - Mizuho Securities USA LLC and Mizuho Americas LLC - \$531,910.34]**

Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claims filed by Mizuho Securities USA LLC and Mizuho Americas LLC against the City and County of San Francisco for \$531,910.34; the claims were filed on May 6, 2021; the claims involve a refund of payroll expense, gross receipts, homelessness gross receipts, and early care and education commercial rents taxes. (City Attorney)

08/10/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

09/07/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

**210907 [Settlement of Unlitigated Claim - Lever, Inc. - \$30,756.32]**

Resolution approving the settlement of the unlitigated claim filed by Lever, Inc. against the City and County of San Francisco for \$30,756.32; the claim was filed on April 15, 2021; the claim involves a refund of payroll expense and gross receipts taxes. (City Attorney)

08/30/21; RECEIVED FROM DEPARTMENT.

09/07/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

**Chair Preston moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

*[Elect Not To Disclose]*

*Motion that the Committee finds that it is in the best interest of the public that the Committee elect at this time not to disclose its closed session deliberations listed above.*

**Chair Preston moved not to disclose closed session deliberations. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Preston, Chan, Mandelman

## **ADJOURNMENT**

*There being no further business, the Government Audit and Oversight Committee adjourned at the hour of 2:55 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*