



City and County of San Francisco

Meeting Minutes

Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Hillary Ronen, Jeff Sheehy, Sandra Lee Fewer

Clerk: John Carroll (415) 554-4445

Wednesday, November 29, 2017

1:00 PM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Special Meeting

Present: 4 - Hillary Ronen, Sandra Lee Fewer, Ahsha Safaí, and Norman Yee

Excused: 1 - Jeff Sheehy

The Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee met in special session on Wednesday, November 29, 2017, with Chair Hillary Ronen presiding.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Ronen called the meeting to order at 1:08 p.m. On the call of the roll Chair Ronen and Member Fewer were noted present. Vice Chair Sheehy was noted not present. There was a quorum.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

Vice Chair Sheehy Excused from Attendance

Chair Ronen moved to excuse Vice Chair Sheehy from attending the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee special meeting of November 29, 2017. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Fewer

Excused: 1 - Sheehy

REGULAR AGENDA

President London Breed appointed Supervisor Ahsha Safaí, in place of Vice Chair Sheehy, to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee for File No. 170773.

170773 [Hearing - Closing of the Skilled Nursing and Sub-Acute Units in St. Luke's Hospital]**Sponsor: Safai**

Hearing to discuss the closing of the skilled nursing and sub-acute units in St. Luke's Hospital; and requesting the Department of Public Health, Human Services Agency, and the Office of Economic and Workforce Development to report.

06/20/17; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee.

06/26/17; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Department of Public Health, the Human Services Agency, and the Office of Economic and Workforce Development for informational purposes.

07/26/17; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Supervisor Ahsha Safai (Board of Supervisors); Colleen Chawla (Department of Public Health); Ken Rich (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); Theresa Palmer, M.D.; Ken Barnes, M.D.; Gary Birnbaum, M.D.; Jane Sandoval, R.N.; Marsha Pushia; Larry Richards; Mary Lanier, R.N, Austin Ord, and Emily Webb (California Pacific Medical Center); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. David Serrano Sewell; Patrick Monette-Shaw; Raquel Rivera; Christine Reed; Michael Lyon; Ligia Montano; Lily Robinson Trezvant (Senior and Disability Action); Ronald Anderson; Anthony Tran; Kim Tavaglione; Comer Marshall; David Elliott Lewis (National Alliance on Mental Illness, San Francisco); Jamie Sanchez (SEIU); Valente Javier; Marco R. Vallejo; Avni Desai (Community Housing Partnership); Ms. Cativo; Theresa Flandrick (Senior and Disability Action); Carolyn Bowden, Celina Martinez, R.N., Amy Erb, Maria Dizon, R.N., and Jemila Pereira (California Nurses Association); Robert Manes (San Francisco Long-Term Care Ombudsman); Liz Cong, R.N. and Laura Van (California Pacific Medical Center); Anne Stewart (California Nurses Association); Allison Chapman; Tes Wellborn (District 5 Action); Tony Rivera; Margaret Rafferty; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Heard in Committee. Speakers: Raquel Rivera (St. Luke's Hospital Sub-Acute Facility); Ken Barnes, M.D. and Warren Browner, M.D., Chief Executive Officer (California Pacific Medical Center); Sneha Patil and Barbara Garcia, Director, (Department of Public Health); Benson Nadel, Program Director (San Francisco Long Term Care Ombudsman Program); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Patrick Monette-Shaw; Charles Minster (Senior and Disability Action); Shari Gropper (Swindells Family Center); Linda Rosario; Reverend Glenda Hope (Older Women's League); Tes Wellborn; Theresa Palmer, M.D. (San Franciscans for Healthcare, Housing, Jobs, and Justice); Ligia Montano (Senior and Disability Action); Gloria Simpson; Marlene Cativo; Ruth Cativo; Christine Reid; C.W. Johnson; Eric Brooks (Our City San Francisco); Kim Tavaglione; Carolyn Bowden; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

Chair Ronen moved that this Hearing be continued to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee meeting of March 28, 2018. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Fewer, Safai

Excused: 1 - Sheehy

Supervisor Ronen moved to rescind the previous vote. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Fewer

Excused: 1 - Sheehy

Chair Ronen moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Ronen, Fewer

Excused: 1 - Sheehy

President Breed appointed Supervisor Norman Yee, in place of Vice Chair Sheehy, to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee for File No. 170599.

170599 [Public Works, Police Codes - Permit for Testing of Autonomous Delivery Devices on Sidewalks]**Sponsors: Yee; Fewer, Ronen and Peskin**

Ordinance amending the Public Works Code to require a permit for the testing of autonomous delivery devices on sidewalks and to set rules governing the operations of such devices; amending the Public Works Code and Police Code to provide for administrative, civil, and criminal penalties for unlawful operation of such devices; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.

05/16/17; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee, expires on 6/15/2017.

05/23/17; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Police Department, Public Works, Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Planning Department for informational purposes; Planning Department for environmental review.

08/17/17; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Small Business Commission submitted a response recommending that the Board of Supervisors not approve the ordinance.

08/28/17; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment.

10/11/17; RECOMMENDED. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Supervisor Norman Yee (Board of Supervisors); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Mari Villaluna, Elia Fernandez, and Maria Luz Torre (Parent Voices San Francisco); Kaleda Walling (Richmond Senior Center); Alice Chiu; Sandy Mori; Katy Liddell (South Beach Rincon Mission Bay Neighborhood Association); Anna Kai; Robert Geshleider; Wendy Beck and Natasha Opfell (Walk SF); George Wooding (Coalition for San Francisco Neighborhoods); Lorraine Petty (Senior and Disability Action); Lance Carnes (Walk SF); Lori Liederman; Denis Mosgofian; Male Speaker; Richard Bauman; Anakh Sul Rama; David Desler; Cathy DeLuca (Walk SF); Rosa Chen (Chinatown TRIP); Alice Rodgers (Vision Zero Coalition); Edward Hasbrouck; John Nulty; Michael Nulty; spoke in support of the hearing matter. Chhavi Sahn (Golden Gate Restaurant Association); Rahim Ali; Michael; Stephen Cornell (Small Business Network); Adam Shear; Ditti Magyar; Nick Avila; Miriam Zouzounis (Arab Grocers Association); Jennifer Stojkovic (SF Citi); Vikrum Aiyer; David Catania (Starship Technologies); Farid Tawil; Harrison Shih; Male Speaker; spoke in opposition of the hearing matter. Gwen Kaplan (North East Mission Business Association); Nati Ramirez; Female Speaker; Doug Bloch (Teamsters Joint Council 7); Jim Lazarus (SF Chamber); Matt Regan (Bay Area Council); spoke on various concerns relating to the ordinance matter.

Supervisor Fewer requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

10/17/17; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Supervisor Ronen requested to be added as a co-sponsor.

10/17/17; RE-REFERRED AS AMENDED to Land Use and Transportation Committee. Supervisor Yee requested that this Ordinance be re-referred back to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee. Before a second was identified, President Breed indicated she was uncertain whether to send the Ordinance back to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee or refer it to the Land Use and Transportation Committee. The President requested Supervisor Yee make a motion to send the matter to "committee," and that the specific committee would be determined at a later time. Supervisor Yee agreed.

10/24/17; TRANSFERRED to Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee. President Breed transferred this matter from the Land Use and Transportation Committee to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee.

11/08/17; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Andrew Shen (Deputy City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Joan Kisthardt; Awadalla; Jim Lazarus (Chamber of Commerce); David Sartanian (Starship Technology); Vikrum Aiyer; spoke in support of the matter. Roger Hoffman; Denis Mogofian; Lori Liederman; Fran Taylor; Josie Aurens; spoke in opposition of the matter.

11/08/17; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR AS AMENDED.

11/19/17; NOTICED. First 10-Day Fee Ad for the November 29, 2017 Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee meeting published in the Examiner; per Government Code, Section 6062(a).

11/26/17; NOTICED. Second 10-Day Fee Ad for the November 29, 2017 Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee meeting published in the Examiner; per Government Code, Section 6062(a).

Heard in Committee. Speakers: None.

Member Yee, seconded by Member Fewer, moved that this Ordinance be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, on Page 5, Lines 1-6, by inserting ' provided that a permittee may apply for a second permit, if after six months have elapsed from the effective date of this Section 794, no more than two prospective permittees have applied for an Autonomous Delivery Device Testing permit. In the event a permittee applies for and is issued a second permit under this subsection (d)(4), that second permit shall not be eligible for an extension under subsection (d)(1)'; on Page 5, Lines 7-8, by inserting 'Public Works shall receive and process each permit application, and'; on Page 5, Lines 11-13, by inserting 'Public Works may refer a permit application to any other appropriate City department for its review and consultation'; on Pages 9-10, Lines 24-3 by inserting '(C) incidents arising from the Testing of the each Autonomous Delivery Device, including but not limited to, violations of the operational requirements set forth in subsection (i), incidents impacting public safety, public complaints regarding such Testing, any malfunctions or public tampering with a permitted device, or any collisions with street furniture, vehicles or persons in the public right of way'; on Page 10, Lines 9-11, by adding a provision to the operational requirements that to evaluate whether a permittee has complied, Public Works may seek the review and consultation of any other appropriate City department; on Page 11, Lines 20-25, to add provisions for docking on private property, and to add a provision for site visits by Public Works; on Page 12, Lines 1-10, by striking 'The Board of Supervisors shall hold a hearing regarding the operation of this Section 794 within one year of the issuance of the first Autonomous Delivery Device Testing permit, and at this hearing, Public Works shall provide a report summarizing the data it has collected from permittees and offer findings and recommendations regarding its administration of this program' and inserting 'Within one year of the issuance of the first Autonomous Delivery Device testing permit under this Section 794, Public Works shall provide a report to the Board of Supervisors regarding the operation of the permitting program, summarizing the data it has collected from permittees, and offering findings and recommendations regarding its administration of this program'; and making other clarifying, clerical, and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Fewer, Yee

Excused: 1 - Sheehy

Member Yee moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Ronen, Fewer, Yee

Excused: 1 - Sheehy

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee adjourned at the hour of 3:35 p.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.